

Page 1

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

IN RE: NEW ENGLAND
COMPOUNDING PHARMACY,
INC. PRODUCTS LIABILITY MDL No. 2419
LITIGATION

Master Dkt:
1:13-md-02419-RWZ

~~~~~  
THIS DOCUMENT RELATES  
TO:

All Actions

~~~~~

VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF
JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D.

9:05 a.m.
March 23, 2015

Suite 1100
315 Deaderick Street
Nashville, Tennessee

Blanche J. Dugas, RPR, CCR No. B-2290

Page 3

1 ~~~ APPEARANCES CONTINUED ~~~
2 On Behalf of Saint Thomas Health, Saint Thomas
Network, Saint Thomas West Hospital f/k/a St. Thomas
3 Hospital:
4 ADAM T. SCHRAMEK, Esquire
Norton, Rose, Fulbright
Suite 1100
5 98 San Jacinto Boulevard, Suite 1100
Austin, Texas 78701
6 (512) 536-5232
adam.schramek@nortonrosefulbright.com
7
8 LELA M. HOLLABAUGH, Esquire
Bradley, Arant, Boulton & Cummings, LLP
Suite 700, Roundabout Plaza
9 1600 Division Street, Suite 700
Nashville, Tennessee 37203
10 (615) 252-2348
(615) 252-6348 (facsimile)
11 lhollabaugh@babco.com
12 On Behalf of UniFirst Corporation:
JIM REHNQUIST, Esquire
13 NICHOLAS DREW, Esquire
Goodwin Procter, LLP
14 53 State Street, Exchange Place
Boston, Massachusetts 02109
15 (617) 570-1000
(617) 523-1231 (facsimile)
16 ndrew@goodwinprocter.com
jrehnquist@goodwinprocter.com
17
18 On Behalf of Specialty Surgery Center - Crossville,
PLLC; Kenneth R. Lister, M.D.; Kenneth R. Lister,
M.D., PC:
19 MEGAN A. CARRICK, Esquire
Brewer, Krause, Brooks, Chastain & Burrow, PLLC
20 Suite 2600
611 Commerce Street, Suite 2600
21 Nashville, Tennessee 37203
(615) 256-8787
22 (615) 256-8985 (facsimile)
mcarrick@bkblaw.com
23
24
25

Page 2

1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL
2 On Behalf of the Plaintiffs:
RANDALL L. KINNARD, Esquire
3 DANIEL L. CLAYTON, Esquire
Kinnard, Clayton & Beveridge
4 127 Woodmont Boulevard
Nashville, Tennessee 37205
5 (615) 686-2501
(615) 297-1505 (facsimile)
6 rkinnard@kcbattys.com
dclayton@kcbattys.com
7
8 J. GERARD STRANCH, IV, Esquire
BENJAMIN A. GASTEL, Esquire
Branstetter, Stranch & Jennings, PLLC
9 227 Second Avenue North, Fourth Floor
Nashville, Tennessee 37201
10 (615) 254-8801
(615) 250-3937 (facsimile)
11 gerards@bsjfirm.com
12 GEORGE NOLAN, Esquire
WILLIAM LEADER, Esquire
13 Leader, Bulso & Nolan, PLC
414 Union Street - Suite 1740
14 Nashville, Tennessee 37219-1734
(615) 780-4114
15 (615) 780-4122 (facsimile)
gnolan@leaderbulso.com
16 bleader@leaderbulso.com
17 On Behalf of St. Thomas Outpatient Neurosurgical
Center, LLC; Howell Allen, a Professional Corporation;
18 John W. Culclasure, M.D.; Debra V. Schamberg, RN:
CLARENCE J. "C.J." GIDEON, JR., Esquire
19 MATTHEW CLINE, Esquire
CHRISTOPHER TARDIO, Esquire
20 Gideon, Cooper & Essary, PLC
315 Deaderick Street - Suite 1100
21 Nashville, Tennessee 37238
(615) 254-0400
22 (615) 254-0459 (facsimile)
cj@gideoncooper.com
23 matt@gideoncooper.com
chris@gideoncooper.com
24
25

Page 4

1 ~~~ ATTORNEYS APPEARING VIA VIDEO STREAM ~~~
2 On Behalf of the Plaintiffs:
DANIEL MILLER, Esquire
3 Janet, Jenner & Suggs, LLC
Suite 165
4 1777 Reisterstown Road
Baltimore, Maryland 21208
5 (410) 653-3200
(410) 653-9030 (facsimile)
6 dkm@myadvocates.com
7 On Behalf of the Plaintiffs Jocelyn Norris and James
and Michelle Palmer:
8 CHRISTOPHER T. CAIN, Esquire
Scott & Cain
9 Suite 601
550 West Main Street
10 Knoxville, Tennessee 37902
(865) 525-2150
11 (865) 525-2120 (facsimile)
cain@scottandcain.com
12
13 On Behalf of St. Thomas Outpatient Neurosurgical
Center, LLC; Howell Allen, a Professional Corporation;
John W. Culclasure, M.D.; Debra V. Schamberg, RN:
14 JEREMY CAIN, Esquire
Gideon, Cooper & Essary, PLC
15 315 Deaderick Street - Suite 1100
Nashville, Tennessee 37238
16 (615) 254-0400
(615) 254-0459 (facsimile)
17 jeremy@gideoncooper.com
18 On Behalf of Dallas Back Pain Management/Momentum Pain
Management and Abbeselom Ghermay, M.D.:
19 COURTNEY BOES, Esquire
Fraley & Fraley, LLP
20 Suite 6300, Bank of America Plaza
901 Main Street
21 Dallas, Texas 75202
(214) 761-6460
22 (214) 761-6469 (facsimile)
cboes@fraley-law.com
23
24
25

1 ~~ VIDEO STREAM APPEARANCES CONTINUED ~~

2 On Behalf of Premier Orthopaedic & Sports Medicine
Associates of Southern New Jersey, LLC d/b/a Premier
3 Orthopaedic & Sports Associates, LLC and Premier
Orthopaedic Associates Surgical Center, LLC:

4 JAY J. BLUMBERG, Esquire
Blumberg & Wolk, LLC
5 158 Delaware Street
Woodbury, New Jersey 08096
6 (856) 848-7472
(856) 848-8012 (facsimile)

7 jblumberg@blumberglawoffices.com
8 On Behalf of Barry Cadden, Lisa Conigliaro Cadden,
Carla Conigliaro, Gregory Conigliaro, Douglas
9 Conigliaro and Glenn Chin:

ROBERT H. GAYNOR, Esquire
10 Sloane & Walsh, LLP
Suite 850

11 Three Center Plaza
Boston, Massachusetts 02108
12 (617) 523-6010
(617) 227-0927 (facsimile)

13 rgaynor@sloanevalsh.com
14 On Behalf of Medical Advanced Pain Specialists, PA and
David M. Schultz, M.D.:

15 CLARE CARROLL, Esquire
McCarthy, Bouley & Barry, PC
16 47 Thorndike Street
Cambridge, Massachusetts 02141
17 (617) 225-2211
(617) 225-7711 (facsimile)

18 cfc@mbblaw.com
19 On Behalf of Ocean State Pain Management, Inc. and
Abdul Barakat, M.D.:

20 THOMAS M. DOLAN, III, Esquire
Capplis, Connors & Carroll, PC
21 Suite 220
18 Tremont Street
22 Boston, Massachusetts 02108
(617) 227-0722
23 (617) 227-0772 (facsimile)
tdolan@ccclaw.org

1 ~~ VIDEO STREAM APPEARANCES CONTINUED ~~

2 On Behalf of Harris Methodist Hospital Southlake:

3 ROBERT YOUNG, Esquire
English, Lucas, Priest & Owsley, LLP
1101 College Street
4 Bowling Green, Kentucky 42102-0770
(270) 782-6500
5 (270) 782-7782 (facsimile)
byoung@elpolaw.com

6 On Behalf of Medical Advanced Pain Specialists, PA and
David M. Schultz, M.D.:

7 TRACY CONTE, Esquire
The Blair Law Firm
8 Suite 207
5214 Maryland Way
9 Brentwood, Tennessee 37027
(615) 515-4492
10 (615) 515-4491 (facsimile)
tconte@blair-law.com

11 Also Present:
12 Daniel Makowski, Videographer
Melissa Howard, paralegal

1 INDEX OF EXAMINATION
2 EXAMINATION PAGE
3 EXAMINATION 12
4 BY MR. KINNARD

5 EXAMINATION 168
6 BY MR. CLAYTON
EXAMINATION 187
7 BY MR. REHNQUIST

8 FURTHER EXAMINATION 222
9 BY MR. CLAYTON

10 - - -

11 INDEX TO EXHIBITS
12 EXHIBIT DESCRIPTION PAGE

13 122 Document titled Exhibit "A" 67
floor plan of premises,
14 Bates labeled STOPNC_0727,
PSC-EX_000035 and 36

15 123 St. Thomas Outpatient 73
Neurosurgical Center -
16 Nashville Tennessee consent
to operation,
17 administration of
anesthetics and rendering
18 of other medical service,
including consent for
19 transfusion(s) and release,
Bates labeled PSC-EX_000031
and 32

20 124 Disc titled "Epidural 86
injection computer
21 animations"

22 125 Anesthesia record - St. 91
Thomas Outpatient
23 Neurosurgical Center, Bates
labeled PSC-EX_000033 and
24 34
25

1 126 Busse Hospital Disposables 94
2 letter dated April 1, 2011
to Howell Allen - St.
3 Thomas/PM/901, Attention
Debra Schamberg, RN, Bates
labeled PSC-EX_000041

4 127 St. Thomas Outpatient 97
5 Neurosurgical Center -
Nashville, Tennessee Policy
6 Title: Mission and Goals,
Policy #: LD-02, Bates
7 labeled STOPNC_0629

8 128 St. Thomas Outpatient 100
9 Neurosurgical Center -
Nashville, Tennessee Policy
10 Title: Philosophy and
objectives, Policy #:
11 LD-01, Bates labeled
STOPNC_0628

12 131 St. Thomas Outpatient 127
13 Neurosurgical Center -
Nashville, Tennessee Policy
Title: Ethical Business
14 Behavior, Policy #: RI-10,
Bates labeled STOPNC_0696
15 through 0705

16 133 Curriculum vitae, Bates 20
labeled STOPNC_0400 through
17 0407

18 134 Sketch prepared by Dr. 90
Culclasure

19 135 NECC prescription order 135
20 form, Bates labeled
STOPNC_0056 through 65

1 136 Letter dated October 3, 153
 2 2012 to "Dear Medical
 3 Provider" from Son D. Le,
 4 M.D., FAAPMR from the
 5 Center for Spine, Joint and
 6 Neuromuscular
 7 Rehabilitation, Bates
 8 labeled STOPNC_0001597 and
 9 1594
 10 137 E-mail from Clint 155
 11 Pharmaceuticals dated
 12 Thursday, October 4, 2012
 13 regarding Clint
 14 Pharmaceuticals NOT linked
 15 to Fatal Meningitis
 16 Outbreak, Bates labeled
 17 STOPNC_00807 and 808
 18 138 E-mail from John W. 158
 19 Clucasure, Dr. To Shreka
 20 Rogers dated 10/17/2012
 21 regarding STOPNC Balances,
 22 Bates labeled
 23 STOPNC_0004565
 24 139 E-mail string dated October 162
 25 4, 2012 regarding
 26 inquiries, Bates labeled
 27 STOPNC_0004422
 28 140 Photograph Bates labeled 163
 29 STOPNC_0775
 30 141 St. Thomas Outpatient 208
 31 Neurosurgical Center, LLC's
 32 responses to plaintiff's
 33 first set of
 34 interrogatories in the case
 35 of Reed vs. STOPNC
 36 142 E-mail string regarding 218
 37 Opposing the Clarksville
 38 Chiropractor CON for Pain
 39 Management Surgery Center,
 40 Bates labeled STOPNC_0352
 41 and 0353

1 (Original Exhibits 122 through 142
 2 have been attached to the original
 3 transcript. Exhibit Nos. 129, 130 132 were
 4 not marked.)
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
 10
 11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

1 Videotaped Deposition of John W. Culclasure, M.D.
 2 March 23, 2015

3 VIDEOGRAPHER: Here begins Tape No. 1
 4 to the videotaped deposition of John W.
 5 Culclasure, M.D., taken in the matter of
 6 New England Compounding Pharmacy, Inc.
 7 Products Liability Litigation. This
 8 deposition is being held at 315 Deaderick
 9 Street, Nashville, Tennessee 37238, on
 10 March 23 of 2015. The time is 9:05 a.m.
 11 My name is Daniel Makowski and I'm the
 12 video technician. The reporter today is
 13 B.J. Dugas. Would counsel please introduce
 14 yourselves for the record and state whom
 15 you represent. Then the court reporter
 16 will swear in the witness.

17 MR. KINNARD: I'm Randy Kinnard and I
 18 represent the PSC.

19 MR. CLAYTON: Daniel Clayton, on
 20 behalf of the PSC.

21 MR. NOLAN: George Nolan for the
 22 plaintiffs.

23 MR. REHNQUIST: Jim Rehnquist,
 24 UniFirst.

25 MR. LEADER: Bill Leader, for

1 plaintiffs.
 2 MR. SCHRAMEK: Adam Schramek, Saint
 3 Thomas entities.

4 MR. DREW: Nicholas Drew, UniFirst.

5 MR. GASTEL: Ben Gastel, plaintiffs.

6 MR. STRANCH: Gerard Stranch,
 7 plaintiffs.

8 MS. CARRICK: Megan Carrick, Dr.
 9 Lister and Speciality Surgery Center.

10 MS. HOLLABAUGH: Lela Hollabaugh,
 11 Saint Thomas Hospital, Saint Thomas Health,
 12 Saint Thomas Network.

13 MR. TARDIO: Chris Tardio, for the
 14 Tennessee clinic defendants.

15 MR. CLINE: Matt Cline, for the
 16 Tennessee clinic defendants.

17 MR. GIDEON: C.J. Gideon, for the
 18 witness and Howell Allen Clinic, as well as
 19 St. Thomas Outpatient Neurosurgery Center.

20 JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D.,
 21 having been first duly sworn, was examined and
 22 testified as follows:

23 EXAMINATION

24 BY MR. KINNARD:

25 Q. Sir, would you tell us your name, please.

1 A. John Culclasure.
2 Q. Dr. Culclasure -- is that how you say it?
3 A. Culclasure, yes.
4 Q. Doctor, I haven't met you yet. My name is
5 Randy Kinnard. And you've just took an oath. You
6 understand that?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. You've testified before, haven't you?
9 A. Yes.
10 Q. And you understand that the oath you just
11 took is as important as the one you could take in
12 court?
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. If anyone including myself asks you a
15 question today that you don't understand, will you ask
16 for clarification?
17 A. I will.
18 Q. I don't want to talk over you when you give
19 an answer. And try to let me finish a question.
20 Okay?
21 A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)
22 Q. And try to say "yes" or "no" when an
23 appropriate yes or no is the answer. Okay?
24 A. I will.
25 Q. During the deposition, if you realize

1 you've made a mistake, will you agree to try to fix it
2 during the deposition?
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. We're going to take breaks. I'm going to
5 shoot for about every 50 minutes. If you need one
6 before that, you're welcome to take it. Okay?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. How many patients of St. Thomas Outpatient
9 neurological --
10 MR. GIDEON: Neurosurgical.
11 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) -- Neurosurgical Center
12 died from meningitis?
13 A. 13, I believe.
14 Q. How many were injured?
15 A. I think 113 got sick.
16 Q. Do you agree that this was a catastrophe?
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. You understand the importance of your
19 testimony today, don't you?
20 A. Yes.
21 Q. Were you the medical director of this
22 center?
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. Were you overall in charge of it?
25 A. I'm -- I don't understand the question.

1 Q. Of the center. Were you overall in charge
2 of it?
3 A. Well, there's a manager, a nurse manager,
4 and so she was in charge of the day-to-day operations,
5 and I was -- I'm the medical director.
6 Q. Did she answer to you as the medical
7 director?
8 A. For clinical issues, not for -- not for
9 personnel matters or other things along those lines.
10 Q. Okay.
11 A. We would collaborate, I guess, if there was
12 an issue like that.
13 Q. Let's go over your background, Doctor.
14 Where were you born?
15 A. Orangeburg, South Carolina.
16 Q. When?
17 A. 1957, January 23rd.
18 Q. And where were you raised?
19 A. About ten miles away in a smaller town.
20 St. Matthews.
21 Q. Where did you go to high school?
22 A. In Orangeburg. Wade Hampton Academy.
23 Q. What year did you graduate from high
24 school?
25 A. 1975.

1 Q. Then what did you do?
2 A. College.
3 Q. Where did you go?
4 A. Wofford College.
5 Q. Where is that?
6 A. Spartanburg, South Carolina.
7 Q. Was that a four-year program?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. What kind of degree did you get?
10 A. A BS in biology.
11 Q. And when did you graduate?
12 A. In 1979.
13 Q. Then what did you do?
14 A. Went to medical school.
15 Q. Why did you want to go to medical school?
16 A. My grandmother's brother was a big
17 influence on me. He was the town doctor.
18 St. Matthews is about 2000 people, then and now. It
19 hasn't really grown. But he -- he went to Wofford.
20 He graduated medical school in the 19 -- around 1914
21 or '15 or '16, somewhere in that range. And came back
22 and practiced in St. Matthews until -- until his death
23 when he was about 92.
24 Q. So that man's influence caused you to want
25 to go to medical school?

Page 17

1 A. Yes. My grandfather -- my maternal
2 grandfather died before I was born, so he was like a
3 grandfather to me. He encouraged me to go to Wofford.

4 Q. When you went to medical school, first, did
5 you have a goal to become a particular specialist or
6 not?

7 A. No. No goal.

8 Q. And how long was medical school?

9 A. Four years.

10 Q. When did you graduate from medical school,
11 Doctor?

12 A. 1983.

13 Q. Medical and University of South Carolina?

14 A. Yes, sir.

15 Q. Then what did you do?

16 A. Started my internship in the Army.

17 Q. Now, what sort of -- did you have an
18 arrangement with the Army of some type?

19 A. I had an obligation from undergraduate
20 school, from ROTC, an academic scholarship.

21 Q. So in undergrad, you were in ROTC?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. So they -- the government gave you money, I
24 guess?

25 A. Yes, tuition.

Page 18

1 Q. Now, were you on active duty, and if so,
2 what year were you on active duty?

3 A. I was not on active duty until starting
4 internship in 1983. Well, I was not considered to be
5 on active duty while I was in medical school.

6 Q. Now after you finished medical school, did
7 you have in mind a particular specialty?

8 A. I didn't until -- yes. Once I finished I
9 did, yes.

10 Q. Okay. What was that speciality you wanted
11 to be in?

12 A. Anesthesiology.

13 Q. Why did you want to be in anesthesiology?

14 A. During our junior year of medical school,
15 we rotate -- we rotated through some of the major
16 specialties -- three months of general surgery, three
17 months of internal medicine, and then two months each
18 of pediatrics, OB/GYN and psychiatry. And at the end
19 of that period of time, I just was still undecided
20 about what I wanted to do. And so I was assisting --
21 I was at the naval hospital that was just north of
22 Charleston, and I was performing the function that
23 most medical students have done at one time or
24 another, I was holding a retractor. But the way they
25 position the medical students, the students can rarely

Page 19

1 see what's going on. So I had one person standing on
2 one side of my arm that was holding the retractor and
3 another on the other side -- on the other side of my
4 arm.

5 And the way I was positioned, I was facing
6 the anesthesiologist and I couldn't see the field. So
7 I started asking him what he was doing. So that's
8 when I first started thinking about anesthesiology.
9 My two favorite subjects in medical school were
10 physiology and pharmacology. And so each anesthetic
11 is really all about that person's physiology and how
12 they respond to the medications administered. So it
13 seemed like a good -- it piqued my interest at that
14 point.

15 Q. So you say you began an internship. Where
16 was it?

17 A. San Antonio, Texas. Fort Sam Houston.

18 Q. What was the date you began that?

19 A. July 1, 1983.

20 Q. Did you complete a year in that internship?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. So does that bring us to July 1 in '84?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Then what did you do?

25 A. Started the anesthesiology residency.

Page 20

1 Q. Whereabouts?

2 A. The same place. Brooke Army Medical
3 Center, Fort Sam.

4 Q. Now, we have a CD. This is Exhibit 133.
5 STOPNC_0400. Would you look at that, please, Doctor.
6 And look through that and tell us if that's accurate,
7 please.

8 (Exhibit 133 was marked for
9 identification.)

10 THE WITNESS: The continuing medical
11 education stops in 2012, so that's not
12 updated. But other than that it appears to
13 be accurate.

14 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) So you've had some
15 continuing education that's not on this form?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Other than that, it's accurate?

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. Well, look at Page 2, please. And let's
20 look at your -- under -- you state things about your
21 education. Look at 1983 to 1984. This is what you
22 call an anesthesiology categorical internship. Is
23 this what you were talking about a moment ago?

24 A. The -- yes. The internship that started in
25 July 1, 1983.

1 Q. Now, looking up above that line, I see 1984
2 to 1987 an anesthesiology residency program; correct?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Above that, I see 1988 through 1989,
5 anesthesiology residency program; correct?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Was this a five-year residency, Doctor?

8 A. No, sir.

9 Q. What's missing in there?

10 A. I worked in the Troop Medical Clinic at
11 Fort Sam in the intervening time.

12 Q. Now tell me that again. You worked where?
13 In the troop what?

14 A. It's called the TMC, the Troop Medical
15 Clinic. Had a general practice.

16 Q. What were the dates of that?

17 A. Roughly -- let's see -- probably February
18 of '87 until fall of '88.

19 Q. At least a year and a half?

20 A. Yes, sir.

21 Q. Why is that not on your CV?

22 A. That was not part of my education.

23 Q. I'm sorry?

24 A. That wasn't -- that wasn't part of my
25 training or education.

1 Q. So you stopped your residency in
2 anesthesiology at that point; is that correct?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Why did you stop?

5 A. I went to treatment for substance abuse.

6 Q. Substance abuse?

7 A. Yes, sir.

8 Q. What was the substance?

9 A. Fentanyl.

10 Q. So during your residency program, you
11 abused fentanyl?

12 A. Yes, sir.

13 Q. How? IV, muscular, both, what?

14 A. Both.

15 Q. Would you inject yourself in a hospital?

16 A. I did.

17 Q. Did you steal drugs to do that?

18 A. I diverted drugs, yes, sir.

19 Q. Sir? I'm sorry?

20 A. Yes. I diverted drugs.

21 Q. You diverted them. You stole them;
22 correct?

23 A. Yes, sir.

24 Q. Why did you start doing that?

25 A. My ex-wife had a substance abuse problem.

1 She was going around San Antonio seeing multiple
2 physicians, intending to get medication, and was not
3 able to take care of our children at home because of
4 her pursuit. And so in order to try to wean her off,
5 I initially brought some medication home to try to
6 wean her off so she wouldn't go to the -- all the
7 physicians in town. And that -- I clearly was not
8 able to do that and it just made things worse. And it
9 was just a -- it was -- it was just a very difficult,
10 bad time.

11 And my -- my -- and in all of that, my --
12 I -- to relieve stress and get away from what was
13 going on, and trying to manage her and take care of
14 the kids, I tried some of the fentanyl myself, and
15 that's how I started.

16 Q. When you first tried it, was it IV or
17 intramuscular?

18 A. Actually, just subcutaneous.

19 Q. Subcu?

20 A. Uh-huh (affirmative).

21 Q. When did you start doing that?

22 A. Sometime in 1986. I don't remember
23 exactly. Probably that fall.

24 Q. And there would be times when you were on
25 duty as a resident that you would be under the

1 influence of fentanyl?

2 A. Yes, sir.

3 Q. Looking after patients?

4 A. Yes, sir.

5 Q. How long did you use fentanyl like this?

6 A. Until December of '86.

7 Q. Then did you get caught using it or what?

8 A. They -- the staff suspected that something
9 was going on because of mood and personality changes,
10 and so they confronted me.

11 Q. Somebody challenged you and said, What are
12 you doing?

13 A. Yes. I think I was called to meet with the
14 program director. And at that point they had arranged
15 for me to go to treatment.

16 Q. Where did you go to treatment?

17 A. The residential treatment facility. They
18 called it the RTF at William Beaumont Army Medical
19 Center in El Paso Texas.

20 Q. How long were you there?

21 A. Six weeks, I believe. No more than eight.
22 Six to eight weeks.

23 Q. When you finished that, did you consider
24 yourself clean?

25 A. Yes, I was at that time.

1 Q. Then did the Army let you continue your
2 residency program?

3 A. I went back to Fort Sam and started working
4 at the Troop Medical Center. I resigned my -- I
5 resigned from the residency.

6 Q. You did resign?

7 A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)

8 Q. Okay. How much of an obligation did you
9 have left for the Army?

10 A. I think I had a four-year obligation.

11 Q. So that was not up yet?

12 A. No.

13 Q. So you went to the Troop Medical Clinic
14 kind of as a general practitioner?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. How long did you do that?

17 A. Until I think December of '88, when I went
18 to Walter Reed.

19 Q. Now, did you have to start your residency
20 over?

21 A. No, sir.

22 Q. They gave you credit for what you had done?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Okay. Then when your duty in this Troop
25 Medical Clinic was over, what did you do?

1 in the Army for a career, and so rather than stay in
2 for four more years, I just -- I opted to get out.

3 Q. Doctor, there's been a request down at the
4 other end of the table. Could you please speak a
5 little louder. I hear you fine.

6 A. Okay.

7 Q. But it's a distance down there.

8 A. Okay.

9 Q. What was your rank when you got out of the
10 Army?

11 A. Captain.

12 Q. Then what did you do?

13 A. I took a job in Bowling Green, Kentucky.

14 Q. What was that job?

15 A. Anesthesiologist with a group there.

16 Q. Who were the doctors in that group?

17 A. Robert Watson, John Villarreal, Ken -- and
18 I'm blanking on his last name now. He retired not too
19 long after I got there. And one other guy from West
20 Virginia who came and left after a few months. I
21 think that's -- I think that's everybody.

22 Q. What type of work did you do in Bowling
23 Green?

24 A. General anesthesiology and some pain clinic
25 work, chronic pain, with patients.

1 A. I went to Walter Reed to finish my
2 residency.

3 Q. And how much more time did that take? I
4 see 1988 to 1989 at Walter Reed Army Medical Center.

5 A. When I went to treatment, I had I guess
6 seven months left in my residency. So they had me do
7 a full year at Walter Reed. So I started I think
8 December 1st of '88, and finished November 30th of
9 '89.

10 Q. During this time that you were abusing
11 fentanyl, did you abuse anything else?

12 A. No, sir.

13 Q. After you finished your residency at Walter
14 Reed in 1989, what did you do next?

15 A. I stayed at Walter Reed for about a month
16 on staff, and during that time, I had a decision to
17 make about -- they offered me a promotion and I could
18 stay in or I had the option of getting out. I had
19 been passed over for a promotion three times and so I
20 was scheduled to leave the Army. But the -- my staff
21 guys in the residency program sort of petitioned the
22 promotion board to let -- to reconsider and let me
23 stay in.

24 And so they did offer me the promotion, but
25 I chose not to take it. I didn't think I could stay

1 Q. When is the first time you ever performed
2 an epidural steroid injection?

3 A. That would have been during my residency,
4 but I couldn't tell you the year.

5 Q. Can you approximate the number of epidural
6 steroid injections you personally were responsible for
7 in residency training?

8 A. I couldn't. It would be just a very rough
9 guess. I don't have a total.

10 Q. What's your rough guess?

11 A. I'm sorry, could you repeat the question.

12 Q. Okay. How many were you personally
13 responsible for in residency training?

14 A. Of what procedure?

15 Q. Epidural steroid injections?

16 A. Steroid. Okay. I didn't know whether you
17 wanted me to include OB epidurals and things like
18 that. To the best of my recollection, I probably
19 spent two months or maybe three in the pain clinic at
20 Brooke Army Medical Center. So while there, I would
21 have done epidural steroid injections. Usually there
22 was just one resident there, so I would have done all
23 of the injections under supervision from the staff
24 guys. It wasn't a high volume. Probably five or six
25 a day for two to three months, because we did other

1 procedures too.

2 Q. When you did them in your residency was
3 somebody watching you, or were you allowed to do it
4 alone?

5 A. Someone was always with us as residents.

6 Q. Under the supervision of somebody else?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Is that where you learned to do epidural
9 steroid injections?

10 A. Yes, sir.

11 Q. Has your technique over the years changed
12 any, in the way you actually perform the procedure?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Well, we'll get do that eventually. Did
15 you do some pain management in Bowling Green?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. What percentage of your practice in Bowling
18 Green was pain management?

19 A. Probably about 20 percent. 15 to 20.

20 Q. And of that 15 to 20 percent of your
21 practice, what did epidural steroid injections
22 represent?

23 A. The majority of that 15 to 20 percent.
24 Excuse me.

25 Q. How long did you work in Bowling Green?

1 name. It was just in the outpatient department of the
2 hospital, sort of adjacent to the outpatient surgery
3 center. So we just utilized some of the rooms there.

4 Q. And were they anesthesiologists like you?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Performing these procedures? All right.

7 Then who did you go to work for in
8 Washington D.C.?

9 A. The anesthesia group at Washington Hospital
10 Center.

11 Q. Were there more doctors there than there
12 were in Bowling Green that you worked with?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And what kinds of practice did you have
15 there?

16 A. Just OR anesthesia.

17 Q. Did you do pain management?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Why not?

20 A. It wasn't an option. That group didn't do
21 pain management.

22 Q. How long did you work there?

23 A. Somewhere between four and six months.
24 After I got there, the call schedule was not --
25 several things -- a couple of things happened. The

1 A. A couple of years, I think. I took a job
2 in Washington D.C. at the Washington Hospital Center.
3 My ex-wife had moved from western North Carolina near
4 Asheville to Myrtle Beach. And so that made my drive
5 to see my kids really long and difficult to do on a
6 weekend. And so there was a -- in the early '90s
7 there was an oversupply of anesthesiologists, so I
8 tried to find work in South Carolina closer to them.
9 But the best I could do was D.C. on I-95, so I could
10 at least have a straighter shot to get down there.

11 So I took a job in D.C.

12 Q. Back to Bowling Green. Can you estimate
13 for us, please, the approximate number of epidural
14 steroid injections you did?

15 A. It would be very difficult. I guess on an
16 afternoon -- morning and afternoon, probably 12 to 15
17 in an afternoon. We'd usually go down in the
18 afternoon after the OR schedule slowed down a little
19 bit. And one of us would have a -- would go down and
20 see patients in the pain clinic.

21 Q. Was there a clinic devoted to pain
22 management?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. What was it called?

25 A. You know, I don't think it had a specific

1 people that I met when I interviewed had all
2 decided -- the younger guys that I had met and liked
3 had decided to leave. They had a lot of internal
4 problems within the group.

5 A couple of the guys were actually just a
6 couple months away from partnership and they chose to
7 leave anyway. And they put me on a call schedule such
8 that I would be on call on Friday one weekend,
9 Saturday the next, Sunday the next, and then a backup
10 weekend somewhere also in that mix -- or after that.
11 So that meant I couldn't drive down to Myrtle Beach to
12 see my kids if I was on call any of those days of the
13 weekend.

14 So I turned in my resignation because they
15 would not -- I asked them to modify the call schedule
16 for me and they wouldn't. So I resigned, so I -- the
17 people in Bowling Green said if I ever -- if I wanted
18 to come back, I was welcome to do that. So I
19 contacted them and told them I didn't think it was
20 going to work out for me in D.C. and I wanted to come
21 back.

22 Q. So you went back to Bowling Green?

23 A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)

24 Q. Did you resume the same type practice you
25 described earlier for us?

1 A. Yes.
2 Q. Okay. Then how long did you stay there?
3 A. Until '95.
4 Q. Then where did you go?
5 A. I moved to Asheville, North Carolina and
6 started a pain practice there. My kids were with my
7 ex-wife. Then she'd moved back to the mountains and
8 they were living in Hendersonville.
9 Q. Hendersonville, North Carolina?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. Now, you started a practice there?
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. Is that correct?
14 Now, the practice you left in Bowling
15 Green, you were doing general anesthesia and pain
16 management?
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. Now what did you start in North Carolina,
19 in 1995?
20 A. A full-time pain practice.
21 Q. Did you do other anesthesia work?
22 A. No.
23 Q. Why did you switch to full-time pain
24 management?
25 A. It was -- the best opportunity for me to be

1 able to move closer to the kids.
2 Q. But why didn't you start practicing
3 anesthesiology there also, in like the OR?
4 A. Well, they had closed -- the medical staff
5 was closed, so I couldn't just go in and offer to do
6 OR anesthesia. I would have had to have been a member
7 of the group -- one of the groups that was at the two
8 hospitals.
9 Q. How many hospitals were there?
10 A. Two in Asheville proper. Another one
11 slightly south, between Asheville and Hendersonville.
12 Q. Now, did you have privileges to admit
13 patients to either of those hospitals?
14 A. Only St. Joseph's.
15 Q. You did have privileges there?
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. The whole time you were in Asheville, did
18 you run this Carolina Pain Management Center?
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. You called it Carolina Pain Management
21 Center; is that correct?
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. Did you have other doctors working with
24 you?
25 A. No.

1 Q. Well, describe your practice for us,
2 please. How many employees did you have?
3 A. One nurse who helped me schedule. And then
4 all the administrative things, I had a contract with a
5 management company. They did the billing and taxes
6 and all -- and all of those other things.
7 Q. Tell us what you did in this pain
8 management.
9 A. A combination of procedures and medical
10 management of the patients.
11 Q. Tell us what those were.
12 A. What -- which were?
13 Q. Well, the pain management procedures.
14 A. Procedures.
15 Q. What did you do?
16 A. Epidural steroid injections, facet
17 injections, implantable morphine pumps or pain pumps,
18 some spinal cord stimulation.
19 Q. What percentage of the total pain
20 management that you did was epidural steroid
21 injections?
22 A. Probably 60 or 70 percent of the
23 procedures.
24 Q. How many could do you in a day over there?
25 A. I never booked an entire day, probably

1 because I would see office visits in the morning or
2 the afternoon. It just sort of -- I think it varied
3 from day to day. And whether I had to go to the
4 hospital to do procedures.
5 We'd probably do seven or eight in an
6 afternoon. Probably in between some followup visits.
7 Q. To shorten things up, is it all right with
8 you if I say ESI sometimes for epidural steroid
9 injections?
10 A. That's fine.
11 Q. You'll know what I'm talking about; right?
12 A. Yes, I will.
13 Q. The way you've described your practice for
14 everybody here, did it stay the same the whole time
15 you were there at Carolina's pain management center?
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. It stayed the same. Then when did you stop
18 doing that practice?
19 A. '98, I believe.
20 Q. You're welcome to look at your CV.
21 A. Okay. There we go. Thank you, appreciate
22 it.
23 Yeah, at that point, I took a -- I had been
24 in solo practice for that time in Asheville and I had
25 not been able to, you know, get busy enough to bring

1 on another person, another physician. And so I had
2 met some of the people in Johnson City at a meeting,
3 and so we talked about me coming over there. So I
4 visited with them, interviewed, and they offered me a
5 position.

6 Q. Correct me if I'm wrong. It sounds like
7 you couldn't make enough money at pain management --
8 excuse me, Carolina's pain management center to keep
9 it going?

10 A. Oh, I could keep it going, but I
11 couldn't -- to bring on another person, I would need
12 to be able to do, you know, about enough work for one
13 and a half people to then bring on another person, let
14 that new person take over part of -- you know, part of
15 the work. And I was busy, but I couldn't make -- I
16 couldn't get to the point where I could comfortably
17 bring on another person, so...

18 Q. So you felt uncomfortable having to cover
19 all these things?

20 A. Right. I was on call all the time. It was
21 very hard to leave town or do anything else, so...

22 Q. And you'd met these doctors in Johnson
23 City?

24 A. I don't -- I did go to meet them there, you
25 know, but I'd met them I think at a medical

1 A. 90 or 95 percent.

2 Q. Were the percentage of your ESIs going up
3 compared to prior practice or staying about the same?

4 A. I -- I was doing other additional
5 procedures at that time. But I was -- a rough guess
6 probably still 75 percent of the procedures were
7 epidurals.

8 Q. Why did you leave that practice?

9 A. I relapsed and went to treatment here in
10 Nashville.

11 Q. Now what was the problem this time?

12 A. Same thing.

13 Q. What?

14 A. Fentanyl.

15 Q. What caused you to use fentanyl again?

16 A. I wasn't -- I wasn't going to meetings and
17 hit some rough spots in the road with my access to my
18 kids and with my ex-wife, and -- and so I relapsed.

19 Q. What meetings were you not making?

20 A. AA and NA meetings.

21 Q. What do those initials stand for?

22 A. Alcoholics Anonymous and Narcotics
23 Anonymous.

24 Q. Are those meetings held, you know, for
25 people who were addicted to alcohol and narcotics, in

1 conference. I think that was our first contact.

2 Q. And when did you start working with them?

3 A. I don't remember the -- you know, the
4 month, offhand. But it was in 1998.

5 Q. Your CV looks like --

6 A. Oh, there it is. May of '98. Okay.

7 Q. Started in May of '98 through February '99;
8 correct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Well, describe for us, please, the practice
11 of anesthesia and pain consultants in Johnson City
12 when you were there.

13 A. They covered several hospitals and so --
14 and Turney Williams, one of the partners in the group,
15 did pain management primarily, some OR anesthesia.
16 And so I worked primarily with him and I did some
17 weekend or night coverage for the -- you know, in the
18 hospital for anesthesia. But primarily spent my days
19 doing pain management.

20 Q. You did some work in the OR, though?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. As a regular anesthesiologist?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. What percentage of your practice was pain
25 management in Johnson City?

1 the same place, or were they different meetings? AA
2 and NA, are they different meetings or the same?

3 A. Different meetings. They're more AA
4 meetings, so a lot of people who have a substance
5 abuse issue will still go to AA just because there are
6 more options. NA meetings are a bit more limited
7 and -- as far as location and frequency.

8 Q. Do you remember when you took your first
9 fentanyl drug in this time period?

10 A. No. It -- let's see. I believe probably
11 December. It was after some issues at Thanksgiving of
12 that year. So probably December.

13 Q. Of what year?

14 A. Of 1998.

15 Q. Again, did you steal drugs from a hospital?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. That was the source of your drugs?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. How long were you abusing fentanyl before
20 something happened that caused you to seek treatment?

21 A. January of '99. So about a month and a
22 half, I guess.

23 Q. What happened?

24 A. One of the nurses who worked in the pain
25 clinic saw me divert some of the medication.

Page 41

1 Q. Some nurse saw you take?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. What was it -- what form was it? A syringe
 4 or what was it?
 5 A. A syringe.
 6 Q. And where did you put it that she saw you
 7 doing this?
 8 A. Most likely in my pocket.
 9 Q. So she turned you in?
 10 A. He did, yes.
 11 Q. Oh, he did. This nurse turned you in.
 12 Then what happened?
 13 A. I was -- the Tennessee Medical Foundation,
 14 who at that time -- at that time it was headed by Gary
 15 Olbrich. And so he came and paid me a visit and
 16 the -- the group stopped my clinical duties at that
 17 point. And so he recommended that I go to treatment
 18 here in Nashville.
 19 Q. So you left that group practice; right?
 20 A. Yes.
 21 Q. And came to Nashville. Where did you go?
 22 A. CPE. The Center for Professional
 23 Excellence is what it's called.
 24 Q. Where did you live while you were there?
 25 A. In an apartment. They had -- it was a --

Page 42

1 they put us up in apartments in Bellevue.
 2 Q. Is this the campus of this treatment center
 3 or not?
 4 A. No, the treatment center itself is near the
 5 zoo, would be the best description.
 6 Q. How many months were you in that program?
 7 A. Four.
 8 Q. Did you ever inform any Tennessee board of
 9 your being treated over there?
 10 A. Yes. The -- they were -- yes. The board
 11 was aware. The TMF communicates with the board.
 12 Q. And when did they find that out?
 13 A. Probably in January. I don't remember.
 14 But it's not a -- it wouldn't have been a delayed
 15 process. They would have notified them immediately.
 16 Q. Did you inform them or what?
 17 A. I don't remember, but probably the -- it
 18 was Dr. Olbrich who informed them.
 19 Q. Did they contact you in January -- anybody
 20 with the board?
 21 A. I don't remember. It probably occurred
 22 later, once I was in treatment here in Nashville.
 23 Q. Do you remember somebody from the board
 24 talking to you?
 25 A. Not in person, but probably by phone. But

Page 43

1 I don't -- I don't have a specific memory of that.
 2 Q. You don't have a memory of a phone call
 3 either or --
 4 A. I don't remember how the contact was done.
 5 It could have been by letter. It could have been a
 6 phone call. I just don't remember. And at that point
 7 the TMF and Dr. Olbrich were sort of the method of the
 8 communication between me and the board at that point,
 9 so...
 10 Q. Has your addiction -- excuse me. Do you
 11 consider yourself today addicted? Or maybe that's not
 12 the right question.
 13 Are you an addictive person?
 14 A. I would say that I'm an addict, but I'm in
 15 recovery.
 16 Q. You're a recovering addict. Is that a fair
 17 statement?
 18 A. Yes, sir.
 19 Q. Has the fact that you're a recovering
 20 addict impacted your practice of medicine and what you
 21 do?
 22 A. I chose not to return to the OR where there
 23 was, you know, so much access to the medication.
 24 Q. When did you make that decision, that
 25 you're not going to work in the OR anymore?

Page 44

1 A. During my treatment here at the -- at CPE.
 2 And it was just based on the process there, in
 3 consultation with the staff there. And that was their
 4 recommendation.
 5 Q. Have you relapsed any since then?
 6 A. No, sir. I'm happy to say I have not.
 7 Q. You've what, I'm sorry?
 8 A. I'm happy to say I have not.
 9 Q. Okay. You need a break yet?
 10 A. No, sir.
 11 Q. When you completed your treatment in
 12 Nashville, what did you do next?
 13 A. I started a job here in Nashville.
 14 Q. All right. Who was that job with?
 15 A. Neurosurgical Associates.
 16 Q. Who was in that group, please?
 17 A. Ray Hester, Paul McCombs, William Schooley.
 18 Q. I'm sorry, last name?
 19 A. William Schooley.
 20 Q. Stooley.
 21 A. Schooley, S-C-H-O-O-L-E-Y.
 22 Q. Schooley?
 23 A. Doug Mathews, Richard Berkman.
 24 MR. GIDEON: Arendall.
 25 THE WITNESS: Oh, and Rex Arendall.

Page 45

1 Thank you.
2 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Arendall?
3 A. Yes. Rex Arendall.
4 Q. Anybody else?
5 A. That's it.
6 Q. What did that group do?
7 A. Those are all neurosurgeons. So they do
8 neurosurgery.
9 Q. Did you know any of these gentlemen before?
10 A. Yes. I had seen some patients or had some
11 contact with Doug Mathews, and so apparently the group
12 had some internal discussions about adding a pain
13 management physician. So he contacted me while I was
14 still in treatment at CPE.
15 Q. So when they first talked to you, they did
16 not have a pain management practice; is that fair or
17 not?
18 A. That's correct. They did not have one.
19 Q. They wanted to start one?
20 A. Yes.
21 Q. And did you start it for them?
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. Tell us about that. What was -- what was
24 it like?
25 A. Well, at first I started seeing patients in

Page 46

1 their -- in the main office at Centennial. And it --
2 and the volume just grew from there, as they got -- as
3 they got comfortable with me and saw what I could do,
4 then we moved over to -- we needed more dedicated
5 space, so we moved over to Doctor's Pavilion. The
6 group had a CT scanner over there. So -- and so we
7 got some space adjacent to the CT scanner area, and
8 started seeing patients there.
9 Q. What was the clinic called, or whatever it
10 was?
11 A. It didn't have a separate name. It was
12 just still Neurosurgical Associates.
13 Q. But there was a site dedicated to pain
14 management. Is that right; yes?
15 A. A location, yes.
16 Q. How long did you work with this group?
17 A. Until they split up in 2005.
18 Q. When did you start working for them?
19 A. In '99. July, I believe. Yeah.
20 Q. I know it varied, it had to have. But give
21 us an estimate, as you moved towards the end of your
22 time with this group, working in the pain management
23 area, about how many ESIs you did a year?
24 A. Let's say -- I probably did 15 a day plus
25 some other procedures. But let's -- that's probably

Page 47

1 conservative. 15 epidurals a day, five days a week,
2 75 times -- I probably worked 46 weeks a year. So 75
3 times 46 would probably be a reasonable estimate.
4 Q. Now, in 2005 something happened to this
5 group. I think you said it split up?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Tell us about that split.
8 A. McCombs and Mathews and Arendall joined
9 Neurological Surgeons, and they asked me to come along
10 with them.
11 Q. So Hester, Schooley and Berkman did
12 something else?
13 A. Yes, they just remained as Neurosurgical
14 Associates.
15 Q. And where did you go? What was the name of
16 the new group?
17 A. Neurological Surgeons.
18 Q. Who all was in that when you joined?
19 A. It's the same group I'm with now. It's --
20 they've just changed the name to Howell Allen Clinic.
21 So Everett Howell, Vaughan Allen, Tim Schoettle, Greg
22 Lanford, Jason Hubbard, Arendall, McCombs and Mathews.
23 Although Arendall and Mathews eventually left for
24 other reasons.
25 Let's see. Carl Hampf, Scott Standard, and

Page 48

1 now Adam Reig and Richard Lebow and Brian
2 O'Shaughnessy. If I missed one, don't tell them.
3 Q. When you went over there to Neurological
4 Surgeons, did they have a pain management location?
5 A. Yes. Ben Johnson was doing pain management
6 with them, but it was mostly he ran more of a headache
7 clinic, I believe. It was located at Skyline, but
8 some of the anesthesiologists at St. Thomas Outpatient
9 Neurosurgical Center were doing ESIs there. So when I
10 came over, when we joined the group, at that point
11 they were about to open what's now called Hospital For
12 Specialty Surgery, behind Baptist. And so those three
13 anesthesiologists went over there to provide
14 anesthesia services, and I took over the pain
15 management at St. Thomas Outpatient Neurosurgical
16 Center.
17 Q. Did it already exist by that name when you
18 went over there?
19 A. Yes. And if it's okay with you, we'll call
20 it STOPNC.
21 Q. Yes.
22 A. Okay.
23 Q. All right. STOPNC already existed; right?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. Ben Johnson was a doctor?

1 A. Yes. He still is, yes.
 2 Q. He's not with the group anymore?
 3 A. No.
 4 Q. You took his place?
 5 A. No, we worked together.
 6 Q. Okay. Well tell us about how long you
 7 worked together?
 8 A. He left maybe five years ago -- I don't
 9 remember exactly when -- and started working with -- I
 10 believe it was with Dr. Le, out at Summit. Then he
 11 went down to maybe Columbia. I think they asked him
 12 to run a pain management center down there.
 13 Q. When did you become the medical director of
 14 STOPNC?
 15 A. About the same time that I joined the
 16 group. As the other anesthesiologists were leaving
 17 and I moved -- and I moved in there to do the pain
 18 management stuff, and I became the medical director.
 19 Brad Worthington had been the medical director, but
 20 since he was no longer going to be over there, they
 21 needed someone else to do that, to fill that role.
 22 MR. KINNARD: Well, I think this would be a
 23 good time to take a break. I promised every 50
 24 minutes. I might have run a little too long there.
 25 So we'll take a few minutes.

1 VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the end of
 2 Tape No. 1 --
 3 MR. GIDEON: We've got a lot of
 4 people on the phone, Randy. How long do
 5 you want to take this break. Five minutes,
 6 seven minutes --
 7 MR. KINNARD: Seven minutes sounds
 8 good. Thank you.
 9 VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the end of
 10 Tape No. 1. We're off the record and the
 11 time is 9:58 a.m.
 12 (A recess was taken.)
 13 VIDEOGRAPHER: Here begins Tape No. 2
 14 in the deposition of John W. Culclasure,
 15 M.D. We're back on the record, and the
 16 time is 10:09 a.m.
 17 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Ready, Doctor?
 18 A. Yes, sir.
 19 Q. Look at the front page of your curriculum
 20 vitae again, please.
 21 A. Yes, sir.
 22 Q. I don't know how we managed to do this, but
 23 we've skipped something in here. The -- look under
 24 pain management, next item to the last. You've got
 25 Carolina's Pain Management Center. June '95 through

1 May '97. Above that is The Pain Management Group, PC
 2 in Hermitage, Tennessee. Tell us about that group,
 3 please.
 4 A. Yes. And in fact, just as I sat down I
 5 looked down at the CV and saw that. I did not go
 6 from -- and I hadn't thought about the sequence in a
 7 long time, so I apologize. I joined -- from North
 8 Carolina I joined The Pain Management Group here in
 9 Nashville and worked with -- the doctor's name was
 10 Steve Long there. Steve later -- he was difficult to
 11 work with. He eventually had his license summarily
 12 suspended. He was carrying a weapon with him to work
 13 and probably -- and getting some medication --
 14 diverting medication.
 15 So it was a difficult to work with him and
 16 so that's actually when I met the folks in Johnson
 17 City and took a job there. So...
 18 Q. That -- while working there is when you
 19 first met doctors from Johnson City?
 20 A. Yeah, at a meeting, I guess. I don't
 21 remember the exact -- that'll be about the only way I
 22 would have met them, I think, was at a pain management
 23 meeting of some sort.
 24 Q. You're not taking any drugs today, are you?
 25 A. No, sir.

1 Q. You're not under the influence of anything
 2 today except perhaps coffee or water?
 3 A. Both, yes.
 4 Q. All right. So what did you do at The Pain
 5 Management Group?
 6 A. Full-time pain management.
 7 Q. Did you go into the OR at all?
 8 A. Only to do stimulator implants or pump
 9 implants.
 10 Q. Now look back at Page 2, the second item
 11 down, staff anesthesiologist in Hendersonville, North
 12 Carolina. Is that information correct there?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. All right. Now, why did you go from
 15 Nashville here at The Pain Management Group to Johnson
 16 City?
 17 A. Because I found it extremely difficult to
 18 work with Dr. Long.
 19 Q. And so there was a work opportunity in
 20 Johnson City, is that it?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. And you've told us about that work over
 23 there already, haven't you?
 24 A. Yes, sir.
 25 Q. Have we gone over your work history

1 accurately now?

2 A. Yes, sir. I believe we have.

3 Q. Is there anything about your education that
4 we haven't covered?

5 A. Oh I -- you know, I will just say that when
6 I went back to finish my residency at Walter Reed that
7 they were just -- they were great guys and they
8 supported me and I appreciated that. And they gave me
9 the award for the outstanding resident that year at
10 Walter Reed. So that was part of my education, I
11 guess.

12 Q. Anything else you want to tell us about
13 your education?

14 A. I think that covers it.

15 Q. So now we're up to St. Thomas Outpatient
16 Neurosurgical Center, also known as STOPNC; right?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. In 2011, what percentage of your practice
19 was epidural steroid injections?

20 A. Generally, at STOPNC, four days a week. On
21 Wednesdays I go to our imaging center. And at the
22 imaging center I do other procedures: Discography,
23 kyphoplasties, spinal cord stimulator trials. So
24 about 80 percent of my time, roughly, would be done --
25 would be spent doing epidurals when I'm at STOPNC.

1 Although there are some other procedures I do at
2 STOPNC, but 90 percent or so would be epidurals.

3 Q. 90 percent?

4 A. Yes, sir.

5 Q. Has that increased over the years or always
6 been about the same?

7 A. I don't -- I'd have to -- I'd have to look
8 at something. I don't know. I don't have those
9 numbers handy. But...

10 Q. But in 2011, your practice was about
11 90 percent ESI at STOPNC?

12 A. At STOPNC, yes, sir.

13 Q. Of your overall practice, what did ESIs
14 represent?

15 A. Well, that one day a week I don't do
16 them -- you're asking me to do math on the fly. So I
17 would just guess probably 75 percent, 80.

18 Q. Was the same thing true about your
19 percentages in 2012?

20 A. Yes, sir.

21 Q. And is it the same today?

22 A. Percentages, yes.

23 Q. Who owns STOPNC?

24 A. I believe it's owned equally by Howell
25 Allen Clinic and Saint Thomas Hospital.

1 Q. What's -- in 2012, what was done in STOPNC
2 for patients?

3 A. Procedures, epidural steroid injections,
4 facet joint injections, facet joint denervations, some
5 sacroiliac joint injections. That would be -- that
6 would be the -- that would be most of it, 99 percent
7 of it. Occasionally some other unusual -- less common
8 procedure.

9 Q. This is all pain management?

10 A. Yes, sir.

11 Q. If it's pain management, why is it called a
12 neurosurgical center?

13 A. Well, it was originally used for outpatient
14 surgery that was neurosurgical in nature.

15 Q. When was that?

16 A. Up until 2005.

17 Q. Why didn't the name change after 2005?

18 A. Sir, I have no idea.

19 Q. But in 2011 and 2012, St. Thomas Outpatient
20 Neurosurgical Center was a pain management center; is
21 that fair?

22 A. Yes. Procedure only, no medication
23 management.

24 Q. Can we call it a pain management clinic?
25 Is that fair or not?

1 A. That would not be accurate.

2 Q. Okay. What's the accurate kind of generic
3 description of this center?

4 A. It's a surgery center; an ambulatory
5 surgery center where pain management procedures are
6 performed.

7 Q. Is any surgery done in there?

8 A. No, sir.

9 Q. Did any surgeons work in there in 2012?

10 A. No.

11 Q. You're not a surgeon?

12 A. No, sir.

13 Q. Do you know what Tennessee authority
14 regulates this center?

15 A. The Department of Health, I guess. I think
16 some occupational and safety health people come in
17 too.

18 Q. Is it licensed as some facility?

19 A. Yes, sir.

20 Q. What is it licensed as?

21 A. As an ambulatory surgery center.

22 Q. Let's talk about your compensation for a
23 moment. Are you an employee or a member of Howell
24 Allen Clinic?

25 A. I'm an employee.

Page 57

1 Q. Are you paid a salary?
 2 A. No, sir.
 3 Q. So how do you get paid?
 4 A. I get paid based on what I do, a percentage
 5 of that.
 6 Q. Now is that percentage based on some
 7 formula, or is it just a set like you get half of
 8 whatever you generate or what?
 9 A. It's set.
 10 Q. It's set. All right. What's the
 11 percentage you get for whatever you generate for
 12 Howell Allen?
 13 A. 60 percent.
 14 Q. Was that the case in 2012?
 15 A. Yes, sir.
 16 Q. Now, in 2012, what were the sources of your
 17 income?
 18 A. I don't understand the question.
 19 Q. How did you make money in 2012?
 20 A. By doing the procedure that's we've been
 21 discussing.
 22 Q. Did you make money any other way in your
 23 life?
 24 A. Oh, I do some expert witness work
 25 sometimes. That would be -- that would be my job and

Page 58

1 then sometimes that.
 2 Q. So you've testified as an expert witness
 3 before?
 4 A. I was just trying to remember during break.
 5 I don't -- I don't -- I may have been deposed. Most
 6 of the time I reviewed medical records and worked with
 7 the attorney. And you know, things rarely -- I'm not
 8 even sure I was ever deposed during that work.
 9 Q. You're not sure what?
 10 A. That I was ever deposed because of the
 11 expert witness work that I did. The cases just almost
 12 never went to -- they all settled. So I never even
 13 got deposed, I don't think. I don't remember being
 14 deposed for that.
 15 Q. You have no memory of ever giving a lawyer
 16 a deposition as an expert witness before; is that
 17 true?
 18 A. I believe so, yeah. I mean, that's true
 19 about my memory, but yeah.
 20 Q. Have you ever testified in court before as
 21 an expert?
 22 A. Once.
 23 Q. And was it for a medical care provider?
 24 A. I don't understand the question.
 25 Q. Was it on behalf of a medical care provider

Page 59

1 or on behalf of a patient?
 2 A. A patient.
 3 Q. Where was that?
 4 A. Hendersonville, North Carolina.
 5 Q. When was that?
 6 A. Probably '98.
 7 Q. Did you testify that some medical care
 8 provider had violated standards of care?
 9 A. Yes, I did.
 10 Q. Do you remember any of the names of the
 11 people involved in that case?
 12 A. I do not remember the name of the
 13 anesthetes -- no. None of the names.
 14 Q. What year did you go to court?
 15 A. I think '98.
 16 Q. And you went in Hendersonville, North
 17 Carolina?
 18 A. Yes, sir.
 19 Q. Where were you practicing at the time?
 20 A. At The Pain Management Group.
 21 Q. Where was that located?
 22 A. Out at Summit.
 23 Q. Here in Nashville?
 24 A. Yes, sir.
 25 Q. Do you remember the lawyer who employed

Page 60

1 you?
 2 A. I do not.
 3 Q. What had happened to the patient?
 4 A. She died.
 5 Q. What caused her death?
 6 A. Lack of oxygen to the brain.
 7 Q. All right. And caused that?
 8 A. The anesthesiologist failed to properly
 9 intubate her.
 10 Q. Did you testify during that trial that
 11 there was a national standard of care pertaining to
 12 the provision of anesthesia during that procedure?
 13 A. I don't have a specific memory of my -- of
 14 that testimony. I'm sure they probably asked, but I
 15 don't have a specific memory of it.
 16 Q. If they asked, would you have had knowledge
 17 of a national standard of care?
 18 A. Regarding intubation, yes.
 19 Q. The more ESIs you do, the more money you
 20 make; true?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. And ESIs are your bread and butter; true?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. Can we call this STOPNC a center? Is
 25 that -- how should we call this in one word? I'm

Page 61

1 looking for something like center, clinic, something
2 like that.

3 A. ASC, ambulatory surgery center.

4 Q. Okay. It's an ASC. But can you and I call
5 it center and we'll know what we're talking about?

6 A. Sure I can do that.

7 Q. All right. In 2012, what days of the week
8 was the center open?

9 A. I believe Monday, Tuesday, Thursday,
10 Friday. We've had that pattern for a while.

11 Q. So it was not even open on Wednesday; is
12 that right?

13 A. Correct. The staff worked ten-hour days on
14 those four days, so they make their 40 hours.

15 Q. How many weeks where you were open four
16 days a week a year was the center open?

17 MR. GIDEON: Excuse me, object to the
18 form.

19 THE WITNESS: Could you --

20 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Okay. Sure. How many
21 weeks per year was the center open?

22 A. I don't remember if we had to -- if I'm --
23 at that time I had some people coming in to help,
24 because I couldn't get all of the -- all of the work
25 done. And so if I went out of town they would

Page 63

1 Q. If you were able to do all the ESIs on one
2 day, you'd just do them without any help?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. For your involvement with an ESI procedure,
5 how much time of your time does it take?

6 A. It depends on if it's a -- if it's the
7 patient's first time at the center, or if they're --
8 you know, if they're coming in for maybe a second or
9 third injection out of a series. The first time takes
10 longer because I'm -- they usually have more questions
11 when I'm talking to them prior to the procedure.

12 So a new patient, I would review the chart,
13 talk to the patient, explain the procedure, cover
14 the -- go over the risks, and then -- and then do the
15 procedure. At a followup visit it was a bit quicker.
16 Check on how they were doing, how they were responding
17 to the previous injection, counseled them again if
18 they wanted to hear it again, and then do the
19 procedure.

20 Q. Okay. For a new patient, how much of your
21 total time would be required?

22 A. Including the procedure time?

23 Q. Yes.

24 A. 20 to 30 minutes.

25 Q. For a followup how much of your total time?

Page 62

1 generally be able to fill in. But sometimes if they
2 couldn't fill in and I was out of town, then the
3 center would close on those days. So generally it was
4 open four days a week. But there would be times, I
5 believe, that we -- it might have closed because of no
6 physician being available to staff it.

7 Q. Would the clinic -- excuse me, the center,
8 be closed for Thanksgiving?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Other holidays it would be closed?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. When ESIs were being done Monday, Tuesday,
13 Thursday, Friday, on average how many were being done
14 a day at the center in 2012?

15 A. I believe I was probably doing 20 to 22 or
16 '3. And then if there was another physician there,
17 then they would have a similar schedule. I think at
18 that point, we had help two days a week and I was
19 there the other days by myself.

20 Q. Who would come in to help?

21 A. Dr. Arney -- Tim Arney, Dr. Steve
22 Dickerson, Dr. Gilberto Carrero, Dr. Rachel Rome.

23 Q. Would they come in because you physically
24 weren't able to do all the ESIs that were needed?

25 A. Yes.

Page 64

1 A. 15 to 20.

2 Q. How long did it take you to perform an ESI?

3 A. Ten minutes.

4 Q. Did over 99 percent of the patients who
5 came to this center get there from Howell Allen?

6 A. Yes, sir.

7 Q. If efforts to help the patient with pain
8 didn't work through ESI, would that sort of patient
9 get referred back to the doctor at Howell Allen?

10 A. They would always follow up with their
11 referring surgeon, whether they got better or not.

12 Q. And would many of these people be operated
13 on?

14 A. Some certainly would. I don't know the
15 percentage.

16 Q. They'd get operated on by doctors at the
17 Howell Allen Clinic?

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. And where would they be operated on?

20 A. They could have surgery at any number of
21 locations, from Saint Thomas West to Saint Thomas
22 Midtown, the Hospital For Spine Surgery, Summit -- I
23 mean excuse me, Skyline. The surgeons operated at all
24 of those locations.

25 Q. Where did they perform most of their

1 surgical procedures on these sorts of patients when
2 they needed it?

3 A. Probably the Hospital For Spine Surgery,
4 HHS.

5 Q. Where is that?

6 A. Behind Baptist. Behind Saint Thomas
7 Midtown.

8 Q. And what's that facility called?

9 A. I think it's now called the Hospital for
10 Speciality Surgery.

11 Q. Does Saint Thomas have some sort of
12 interest in that facility?

13 A. Yes, sir, I believe they do.

14 MR. SCHRAMEK: Objection to form.

15 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) What's their interest
16 there?

17 A. They're part owner.

18 Q. The state of Tennessee -- I want you to
19 assume this is true -- reflects that in 2011, 548
20 patients of this center came from Kentucky. What do
21 you know about Kentucky people coming down here?

22 A. Could you be more specific? I don't
23 understand.

24 Q. I don't know. I just -- is there some
25 reference, referable service -- excuse me, a referral

1 A. Yes, sir.

2 Q. Did Howell Allen pay you for the ESIs done
3 at this center?

4 A. Howell Allen collected the money from the
5 insurance companies and the patients for the work that
6 I did, they retained 40 percent of that to cover my
7 overhead and expenses, and then paid me the remaining
8 60 percent.

9 Q. But they would collect money -- Howell
10 Allen would collect money for ESIs done at this
11 center; correct?

12 A. For the ones that I did, yes.

13 Q. All right. Did this center pay you some
14 money as medical director?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Did the center pay you anything for
17 anything?

18 A. No, sir.

19 Q. So the way you got your money for your work
20 over there was through Howell Allen; true?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. You didn't charge the patients personally?

23 A. No. They got a bill from Howell Allen
24 Clinic.

25 (Exhibit 122 was marked for

1 clinic or something service in Kentucky that sends
2 patients to Howell Allen in Kentucky?

3 A. No, sir. Howell Allen's been around for a
4 long time. Dr. Allen and Dr. Howell are well known.
5 Patients come from Alabama as well as -- and Kentucky
6 as well as Tennessee.

7 Q. Is this center accredited by anybody?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Who is it accredited by?

10 A. A Joint Commission.

11 Q. Does this center, and did it in 2011 and
12 2012, maintain a policy and procedure manual?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. Is this center a member of the Freestanding
15 Ambulatory Surgery Center Association of Tennessee?

16 A. I don't know. I don't know if the centers
17 join that or individuals join that organization.

18 Q. Are you a member of it?

19 A. No, sir.

20 Q. Did you have some idea in 2012 how much
21 money you would actually make per ESI?

22 A. No, sir.

23 Q. Is it fair that it would be 60 percent of
24 whatever the amount was paid to Howell Allen; is that
25 right?

1 identification.)

2 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Doctor, we've marked as
3 Exhibit 122, diagrams of the floors at St. Thomas
4 neurosurgical clinic and Neurological Surgeons PC.
5 This is also STOPNC Document 0727.

6 MR. GIDEON: Is this supposed to be a
7 sequential exhibit number? This last one
8 was 133.

9 MR. CLAYTON: It's not sequential,
10 no. But we have it filled up from 122.

11 MR. GIDEON: Okay.

12 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) This is a three-page
13 document. What we've done is enlarged one floor on
14 Page 35 of this document and on Page 36 enlarged
15 another floor. Do you have the document in front of
16 you, Doctor?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. Let me give you the one that's marked as an
19 exhibit. Page 2 is an enlargement of Neurological
20 Surgeons PC. Are you familiar with this layout?

21 A. Yes, sir.

22 Q. What does this represent?

23 A. That's the office on the 8th floor.

24 Q. When a patient in 2012 would come to this
25 building for an ESI, would they report to the 8th

1 floor or not?
2 A. I don't remember.
3 Q. What all is done on the 8th floor?
4 A. Office visits.
5 Q. For pain management or what?
6 A. No, generally with the neurosurgeons.
7 Q. So neurosurgeons work in that clinic?
8 A. Yes, sir.
9 Q. On that floor?
10 Look at the next page, please. Tell us
11 what this is.
12 A. That's the center.
13 Q. All right. This is the STOPNC center;
14 right?
15 A. Yes, sir.
16 Q. Okay. Would you mark on there where the
17 door is a patient would come through?
18 A. Probably here. Oh okay, they come in
19 the -- well, they could come in one of two ways. I
20 see the nurses bring them in different ways. So
21 sometimes they'll -- they could come in either. It
22 just depends on the nurses preference, really. They
23 pick them up from the waiting room.
24 Q. Okay. If you would write "waiting room" on
25 there, that'll help us -- just the word "waiting

1 room." And then draw an arrow to it.
2 A. (The witness complies.)
3 Q. And now draw -- well, write "entrance" to
4 one entrance and "entrance" to another one, and draw
5 an arrow to those.
6 A. (The witness complies.)
7 Q. Did you do that?
8 A. Yes, sir.
9 Q. Okay. Thank you. I want you to highlight
10 in blue where the patients would wait.
11 A. You mean the waiting room?
12 Q. Yes.
13 A. I'm just going to highlight that side. I
14 mean, I guess those are the -- it's slightly different
15 than this. I don't quite -- that's not quite
16 accurate. But that's the waiting area as it stands.
17 Q. Obviously, a patient would go in and wait
18 in the waiting area until something would happen;
19 either somebody would come out or a name would be
20 called. What usually would happen?
21 A. I'm not over there when -- when all that
22 happens. There's a receptionist and she checks them
23 in, and then one of the nurses -- I guess she notifies
24 the nurses at the center, which is just across the
25 hall, and one of the nurses would go and get the

1 patient, and escort them back into the center.
2 Q. All right. Then when they escort the
3 patient in, where does the patient go?
4 A. There are six holding rooms or patient
5 rooms, and they would be placed in one of those.
6 Q. Is that room where a procedure like an ESI
7 will occur?
8 A. No, sir.
9 Q. So there are six rooms that are what --
10 what do you call them?
11 A. Well, the -- it's a patients' -- kind of
12 like a holding room. The nurses take their --
13 complete their nursing history with the patient in
14 that room. I'd go in and talk to the patient while
15 they're in that room, counsel them, answer their
16 questions, mark them. We have to mark them with a
17 marker, based on the procedure that's going to be
18 done. So all of that happens in that -- in those
19 rooms.
20 Q. Could you outline those rooms in red,
21 please.
22 A. (The witness complies.)
23 Q. And off to the side, write something?
24 A. Patient rooms. How about that?
25 Q. That's fine.

1 A. And oftentimes the family member is in
2 there with them, and the family member waits in that
3 room until they come back, usually.
4 Q. Do you get the patient to sign the informed
5 consent document or does somebody else do that?
6 A. It could be either.
7 Q. What percentage of time do you actually get
8 the patient to sign a consent form?
9 A. Actually, up until late 2014 I did -- I
10 actually witnessed all the consent forms. And then
11 after discussing it with the nurse manager, it
12 wasn't -- it's not really necessary for me to witness
13 it. Anyone can witness the signature. So now it
14 could be me or it could be one of the nurses.
15 Q. Well, when you would witness the signature,
16 does that mean you saw every patient sign the consent
17 form?
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. Now, there are procedure rooms in here,
20 obviously. Will you highlight those in yellow?
21 A. (The witness complies.)
22 Q. How many did you highlight, Doctor?
23 A. Three.
24 Q. Are ESIs done in all three of those rooms?
25 A. Yes, sir.

Page 73

Page 75

1 Q. Is that where the majority of the
2 procedures are, in those rooms?

3 A. 100 percent of the procedures are in those
4 rooms.

5 Q. Does anything else happen in those rooms?
6 Any other procedures besides ESI?

7 A. Oh, yes.

8 Q. Like what?

9 A. Facet injections, facet denervations, SI
10 joint injections, spinal cord stimulator trials,
11 sometimes pain pump trials. That would be the
12 majority of things.

13 (Exhibit 123 was marked for
14 identification.)

15 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) I'm going to hand you
16 Exhibit 123, which is also PSC Exhibit 31, and ask you
17 to look at that, please. Do you recognize this
18 document?

19 A. Yes, sir.

20 Q. What is this?

21 A. It's part of the consent form. It looks
22 like the first and last pages of the consent form.

23 Q. Are some pages missing from it?

24 A. Yes, sir.

25 Q. What's missing?

1 Q. Why don't you use the word procedure
2 instead of operation?

3 A. The form was created before I started
4 working at the center.

5 Q. Look at Paragraph 6. "I/We hereby
6 authorize all doctors, pharmacists" -- what is that
7 referring to "pharmacists"?

8 A. I don't know.

9 Q. Paragraph 12, what is that about?

10 A. Could you be more specific?

11 Q. What's the intent of Paragraph 12?

12 A. I think if a referring physician has an
13 ownership interest in a facility, that has to be
14 disclosed to the patient.

15 Q. And this Paragraph 12 has that "I am aware
16 that my physician or his practice does/does not have
17 ownership interest in the St. Thomas Outpatient
18 Neurosurgical Center."

19 So what's circled here?

20 A. It would be does.

21 Q. And that's referring to who?

22 A. Dr. Shetley, who referred the patient.

23 Q. Look at the next page, please, Doctor.
24 This is the last page, you say, of the consent form?

25 A. Yes, sir.

Page 74

Page 76

1 A. Two pages.

2 Q. Now, what's on the other two pages?

3 A. I couldn't tell you exactly. It's a lot of
4 small type.

5 Q. Well, you're familiar with the two pages
6 you see here?

7 A. Yes, sir.

8 Q. Well, let's go over this first page.
9 First, at the top we see St. Thomas Outpatient
10 Neurosurgical Center; right?

11 A. Yes, sir.

12 Q. So is it fair that the first time the
13 patient is seeing this form is at the center?

14 A. Yes, sir.

15 Q. Look at the big letters underneath the
16 patient's name: "This paragraph authorizes the surgeon
17 to operate." Is that what it says?

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. You're not a surgeon?

20 A. No, sir.

21 Q. Paragraph 1, "I hereby authorize and direct
22 John Culclasure, M.D., and associates or assistants of
23 his choice, to perform the following operation." This
24 is not an operation, is it?

25 A. It's a procedure.

1 Q. And for some reason we're missing two pages
2 of it. But this is the last page; right?

3 A. Yes, sir.

4 Q. There's a place for the patient's
5 signature, time and date, witness to signature. Is
6 that your signature?

7 A. Yes, sir.

8 Q. All right. Let's go -- you can put that
9 down, Doctor. Let's go to, say, a new patient coming
10 to the center. Is this the first time you meet this
11 person?

12 A. If it's a new patient almost always, yes.

13 Q. If you had met them before it just would
14 have been an accident someplace; you bumped into them
15 or something?

16 A. No, not necessarily.

17 Q. You could have had something to do with
18 them?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. But the majority of the time you meet them
21 for the first time in this center; right?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And you meet them in one of the rooms you
24 highlighted, in the patient room?

25 A. Yes.

Q. Typically for an average patient who is going to get an ESI, take us through the moment you enter that room to the moment you step back out again. What happens? What do you say and what happens to them?

A. Excuse me. I walk in and introduce myself and then I tell the patient that I need to see their blue wristband, and I make sure that the chart I picked up -- that the name tag on the chart matches their wristband. And so I usually try to -- usually they're nervous, so I try to be a little bit funny and say, Well, I'm glad I got the right patient to do the right procedure." Something like that.

And so then I look at the medical information that's already in the chart about the patient. I look at what the surgeon has ordered for that patient. I review their medical history with them, confirm their allergies, confirm -- find out -- confirm whether or not they're taking a blood thinner and other -- and go over other -- any other coexisting medical problems that they might have. I find out where their pain -- where they're hurting, what other treatment they may have had. And then I explain the procedure to them and then I counsel them. And then I have them sign the consent form, once I've counseled

back, we don't make them change into a gown. Once they get on the table they just move their shirt up and their trousers or slacks down and we just prep the area.

Q. When you say you explain the procedure, tell us typically what you tell the patient.

A. Let's see. Well, I go through the sequence that I'm going to follow once they get back to the room. I'll tell them, you know, when you get to the room -- well, let me back up.

I tell them the x-ray person is going to come get them in a few minutes and take them to the room and get them ready. They'll be lying on their stomach on the table and the x-ray person will -- the x-ray person will clean them off with the antiseptic. And I'll come in, I'll look at their back or neck with the x-ray and identify the level for the injection.

At that point, once that's done, I'll numb the skin with a very skinny needle. I tell them they'll feel a bee sting as the numbing medicine goes in. And then I'll tell them after that I'll put the next needle, the epidural needle, through that numb spot, and using the x-ray I will guide the needle into the epidural space or spinal canal.

I'll inject some x-ray dye at that point

them. And then I mark their back or neck or wherever the procedure is going to be carried out.

And sometimes they'll ask why I'm writing on them and I tell them so I won't cut off the wrong leg. So again, just trying to make them laugh a little bit, because they're all a little bit nervous about getting an injection. I'm not a good comedian.

Q. I'm just waiting for you to finish your answer. I don't --

A. At that point we're done in the room.

Q. Now, when you first come in that room you told us about, where the patient is, what's the patient dressed like?

A. Street clothes.

Q. I'm sorry?

A. Usually.

Q. Street clothes?

A. Yes, sir.

Q. Okay. Then do they have to change later or what?

A. If we're doing a neck -- a cervical epidural steroid injection or a cervical procedure of some type, then we have them put on a gown. Because I can't prep them and maintain a sterile field if they've got a shirt on. But if it's just their lower

when I think I'm in the right place, and the x-ray dye will tell me whether I am indeed in the epidural space or not. If the dye pattern is consistent with the needle tip being in the epidural space, then at that point I'll inject the steroid and take the needle out.

Q. Now, is that your standard procedure, as you do it?

A. That's the description of the procedure and then I counsel -- go over the risks with them.

Q. Okay. Well, what are the risks?

A. Sure. I tell them that the risks include infection, internal bleeding, nerve damage, paralysis, allergic reaction to the medicines used and headache if the needle goes into the spinal fluid sac. And then I ask them if they have any other questions, or if they would like me to elaborate on any of those things I mentioned.

Q. I didn't hear the word "death," Doctor. You don't mention death?

A. That's not -- that would be an exceptional event for an epidural steroid injection and so that's not -- I don't discuss death as part of the counseling process.

Q. And have you told us about everything that happens in there while you're with the patient?

Page 81

Page 83

1 A. I believe I have, yes, sir.
 2 Q. Well, in the deposition, if something
 3 occurs to you -- Hey, I left this out -- will you tell
 4 us?
 5 A. Yes, sir.
 6 Q. Now, typically, after you leave the room,
 7 what happens next, as far as you're concerned?
 8 A. I may have a patient -- excuse me, another
 9 patient waiting for their injection in one of the
 10 treatment -- one of the procedure rooms. So if that's
 11 the case then I would leave that patient and go to the
 12 procedure room and perform that injection. If
 13 nobody's ready and there's not another patient waiting
 14 to be seen, then I would just go sit at my desk or
 15 wait outside until the x-ray person picked the patient
 16 up.
 17 Q. So if you leave Patient A and there's
 18 Patient B in a procedure room waiting for you to come
 19 in and do the procedure, you could go there, do the
 20 procedure; right?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. And you could go to Patient C, who is on a
 23 table waiting for an ESI, that you've already talked
 24 to; right?
 25 A. Yes.

1 as we need to, to explain.
 2 You ready to do that?
 3 A. Yes, sir.
 4 MR. KINNARD: All right. We'll have
 5 to set this up. This is going to take a
 6 moment for the people on the telephone.
 7 (Video was played.)
 8 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) First of all, have you
 9 had a chance watch it?
 10 A. Yes, sir.
 11 Q. Is it a fair representation of what it
 12 showed -- attempted to show?
 13 A. Yes, sir.
 14 Q. And when you do this procedure yourself, do
 15 you do it like that?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. Is this what it's called?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. Let me know, as you look at it the second
 20 time, if any of the words are improper or inaccurate.
 21 (Video was played.)
 22 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Is all that accurate
 23 there, Doctor?
 24 A. Yes, sir.
 25 Q. Is that how you do the needle placement?

Page 82

Page 84

1 Q. And do that procedure?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. And then Patient A could have been taken
 4 into a procedure room, and you come in and do the
 5 procedure on patient A?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. So the cycle continues while you perform
 8 ESIs for that day?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. What time of the day typically does the
 11 center open?
 12 A. 7:00 for bringing patients in, I believe,
 13 over to the -- to the -- 7:00 for bringing a patient
 14 to the patient room.
 15 Q. And what time does your work actually
 16 start, normally?
 17 A. 7:30.
 18 Q. And what time does your day normally end,
 19 looking after the patients?
 20 A. It varies somewhat, but 4:30 to 5:30.
 21 Q. Doctor, we're going to show you a video now
 22 of a lumbar ESI; okay? The first time I show it to
 23 you, I don't want to you say anything. I just want to
 24 you watch it. It lasts about two minutes. After
 25 you've looked at it, we'll play it again and stop it

1 A. Not exactly.
 2 Q. How do you do it differently?
 3 A. Well, I would never advance it that much
 4 without stopping and checking the x-ray. That was a
 5 large -- a pretty long distance to push the needle in
 6 without taking a look.
 7 Q. Do you check your location of the needle
 8 with fluoroscopy?
 9 A. Yes, sir.
 10 Q. Does the dye enter something like this?
 11 A. Yes, sir.
 12 Q. What is this here, Doctor?
 13 A. It's a cross-section through the lumbar
 14 spine.
 15 Q. Now tell us what this is showing, Doctor,
 16 as it goes along.
 17 A. At this point the animation is showing the
 18 needle being advanced into the intervertebral foramen.
 19 Q. Now what's happening?
 20 A. It's -- the animation is showing the
 21 injection of the contrast.
 22 Q. Did you mean the steroid?
 23 A. Could you go back? I thought that was
 24 the --
 25 Q. Sure.

1 A. Just to the end. If you can get to just
2 end, when the blue substance was showing up in the
3 animation.

4 Q. We'll just have to watch and stop it,
5 because I can't make it go faster.

6 A. Okay.

7 Q. This is for the fluoroscopy, correct, that
8 solution, the contrast?

9 A. Yes, it shows up on fluoro.

10 Q. Now this is the steroid; correct?

11 A. Okay, yeah. They titled that "medication
12 administered." Okay. So that would be the steroid, I
13 assume.

14 Q. Now, this represents the steroid; is that
15 fair?

16 A. We could -- yes. Because they titled it
17 "medication." The reason I thought it was the
18 contrast was because in the animation, that's the
19 first thing that's being injected after the needle was
20 placed. So that would really normally be the
21 contrast. And the animation and the actual fluoro
22 images don't match. In the fluoro image the contrast
23 is in the ventral epidural space, and in the animation
24 it's in the dorsal epidural space.

25 Q. Any way else it's not consistent with what

1 rough sketch of what you're talking about. Why don't
2 you use blue for that and you can use colors as you
3 need to explain.

4 A. (The witness complies.)

5 Q. Okay. If you would hold up what you've
6 drawn for the camera and explain what you've drawn.
7 Let him get it focused first, though?

8 VIDEOGRAPHER: Zoom in?

9 MR. KINNARD: Yeah, you should zoom
10 in and pick it up.

11 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) He's going to zoom in.

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. Okay. That's good.

14 MR. GIDEON: Can you see it, John?

15 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

16 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Go ahead.

17 A. If I can get my glasses to focus on the
18 right spot. Okay, this is the skin. The patient's
19 skin. And in this instance the patient would be lying
20 on his or her stomach. And that's the syringe and
21 needle. This is one vertebra, in blue. So that
22 little -- that bone that sticks up is called the
23 spinous process. If you see someone without a shirt
24 on and they bend forward, you will see little bumps
25 under the skin and that bone is what's making that

1 you do?

2 A. No, not that I'm aware of.

3 Q. Okay. Well we'll mark this as -- or we had
4 marked it as Exhibit 124?

5 (Exhibit 124 was marked for
6 identification.)

7 THE WITNESS: That is only one type
8 of epidural. That's not the one that I
9 used the most often.

10 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) What do you use most
11 often?

12 A. Translaminar.

13 Q. And what is translaminar?

14 A. It's the needle placed -- the needle is not
15 directed into the intervertebral foramen. Instead
16 it's inserted between the laminae, which is the bone
17 that forms sort of the -- like a house. It's like the
18 roof over the spinal cord and spinal canal. And
19 there's a ligament that connects one laminae to the --
20 to the one below. And the epidural space, that's the
21 boundary of the epidural space. And so when the
22 needle passes through that ligament, the tip of the
23 needle is then in the epidural space. And that's
24 really the more common way to do it.

25 Q. If you would, can you draw us an anatomical

1 bump.

2 This is the vertebral body. That's the
3 bone that is in the front of the spine and it supports
4 our -- the weight of the upper body. And this -- this
5 bone and this bone going out to the side, those are
6 transverse processes. This bone, both of these on
7 each side, that's the laminae. And this bone and that
8 bone that come up, those are pedicles. And what I
9 was -- when I show this to patients, if I'm explaining
10 in a little more detail to them, I just tell them
11 that's kind of like a house, and so they can see,
12 there's the roof and there are the walls and inside
13 that is the spinal fluid sac with the spinal cord
14 inside.

15 Usually, if I'm showing this to a patient
16 they've asked me something about a previous surgery,
17 and they had a laminectomy and they don't understand
18 what that meant. And so I draw this and I tell them,
19 you know, this is the laminae. So if the surgeon did
20 a laminectomy, he has removed that bone to relieve
21 pressure that's on the -- on the nerves in the spinal
22 cord.

23 So let me go back to the procedure. This
24 is the needle. It crosses the laminae, and that's why
25 it's called translaminar, because it's crossing the

1 laminae. Usually when it gets to about -- just before
 2 it enters the epidural space, which I've labeled here,
 3 the needle engages the ligamentum flavum, or yellow
 4 ligament. And at that point, if I'm trying to inject
 5 sterile saline through that needle with that syringe,
 6 I can't inject, it's because the needle is embedded in
 7 the ligamentum flavum. So while maintaining pressure
 8 on the plunger of the syringe, I slowly advance the
 9 needle forward. And as soon as it passes through that
 10 ligament, I can inject -- the syringe will -- it'll,
 11 you know, it will let me inject because the resistance
 12 is no longer there. The epidural space generally
 13 takes -- allows the -- it will accept the liquid
 14 easily.

15 So that is called loss of resistance
 16 technique, and that's the technique that's used when
 17 we do translaminar epidural steroid injections. Or
 18 for that matter, labor epidurals, that's the same
 19 technique that's used for that.

20 So at that point then I would -- to confirm
 21 that I really am in the epidural space, I would inject
 22 a contrast and look at that with the fluoro.
 23 Sometimes there are false losses of resistance.
 24 Sometimes you can inject into the ligaments and there
 25 may be a plain in that ligament that will -- that

1 accepts some contrast. And sometimes if you're not
 2 all the way in, in the muscle you'll get a loss of
 3 resistance. So the contrast pattern helps -- help me
 4 confirm that I'm in the epidural space and not in one
 5 of the -- you know not outside of the spinal canal.
 6 It also tells me if I'm in the spinal fluid sac,
 7 because the pattern then is different than when it's
 8 in the epidural space. I think that's pretty much
 9 everything.

10 Q. Then you inject the steroid?

11 A. Correct. Once I've ascertained that the
 12 needle tip is in the epidural space.

13 Q. And does that complete the procedure?

14 A. Once I remove the needle; yes.

15 Q. Okay. I need to mark this drawing as
 16 Exhibit 134.

17 (Exhibit 134 was marked for
 18 identification.)

19 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Can I have that blue pen
 20 back, Doctor. The other one.

21 A. Uh-huh (affirmative).

22 Q. Now, the way you performed this procedure
 23 as you've explained it, using Exhibit --

24 A. 134?

25 Q. -- 134, is that within nationally

1 recognized standards of acceptable professional
 2 practice for this procedure?

3 A. Yes, sir.

4 Q. And is it within nationally recognized
 5 standards of acceptable practice for this procedure,
 6 regardless of whether it's being done in Nashville,
 7 Tennessee, Louisville, Atlanta, or Boston?

8 A. Is it still the acceptable standard of
 9 care?

10 Q. Yes.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. I'm going to pass you Exhibit 125 now.
 13 This is a PSC Exhibit 33.

14 (Exhibit 125 was marked for
 15 identification.)

16 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) You recognize this?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. What is it?

19 A. This is our procedure note form.

20 Q. How is this note generated?

21 A. The computer system generates -- or we have
 22 a template in it for each procedure and then we modify
 23 it with the dose or the level that we did the
 24 procedure at.

25 Q. So what -- somebody has to type in

1 something -- some information for this to be
 2 generated?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. But is it a pretty standard form and this
 5 is the way it goes in each procedure?

6 A. Yes, sir, pretty much, unless we note a
 7 deviation or something.

8 Q. So how does the computer know when things
 9 are started? It says, "started," "printed,"
 10 "anesthesia record"? How does the computer know that?

11 A. The x-ray person starts it when we -- as we
 12 start the procedure. In fact, that made me a bit
 13 uncomfortable when I started working there. That's
 14 why the third comment that comes up is "Times assigned
 15 to the procedure, sequence or an artifact of the
 16 software." So it just simply shows the sequence and
 17 the times are not necessarily accurate.

18 Q. So for this procedure 2:52 may not be the
 19 time it actually started?

20 A. It's most likely about the time that it
 21 started. I mean you know, start time can vary
 22 depending on what's -- what we want to determine is
 23 the start time. It could be when I walked into the
 24 room. It could be when I numb the patient's skin. So
 25 the start time, I mean, is a little bit variable. But

Page 93

1 the sequence of events would be accurate. You know,
2 the second one follows the first. The third follows
3 the second. The sixth following the fifth.

4 Q. Is the time, 2:52 to 3:08 -- is that
5 accurate in terms of how long it takes to do these
6 things?

7 A. That's pretty accurate. It varies.
8 Sometimes they're more difficult than others.
9 Sometimes they're easier. It just depends on the
10 patient's anatomy.

11 Q. Now, is the O2 sat monitor already on the
12 patient's finger when you come in the procedure room?

13 A. Usually, or the patient -- or the x-ray
14 person might be attaching it when I come in. It just
15 depends. They'll call me to try to hurry me up, and
16 so sometimes I might surprise them and get in while
17 they're still putting the blood pressure cup on the
18 patient and the pulse oximeter.

19 Q. And are the words that are used on this
20 form accurate in describing the procedure from start
21 to end?

22 A. Let me read through it to be sure.

23 Yes.

24 Q. Now look at the second page of this exhibit
25 and tell us why it's in a different format.

Page 95

1 Q. And you're familiar with recognized
2 national acceptable standards of care for this type of
3 procedure, aren't you?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. I want to talk with you now about the
6 center, its responsibilities. You've made statements
7 to other people that this center observes high
8 standards, haven't you?

9 A. I don't remember a specific conversation,
10 but I would say that we do; yes.

11 Q. As the medical director, you're familiar
12 with the recognized standards of acceptable
13 professional practice for centers such as this,
14 providing ESI care to patients in 2012, aren't you?

15 A. Yes, sir.

16 Q. For short, from now on, can we call that
17 the standard of care for the center? Is that fair?

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. And you're also familiar with national
20 recognized standards of acceptable professional
21 practice for a medical director of a center such as
22 this providing services in 2012; is that true?

23 A. Yes, sir.

24 Q. And we can call that the medical director
25 standard of care; okay?

Page 94

1 A. It's just the way the software prints it
2 out. It's not necessary to have both. The
3 software -- that's just how it does it. It's the same
4 text.

5 Q. When you do ESIs, do you use some sort of
6 an ESI tray?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Is it a B-U-S-S-E tray?

9 A. I don't know.

10 (Exhibit 126 was marked for
11 identification.)

12 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Let me pass you what we
13 marked as Exhibit 126, PSC Exhibit 41. Have you seen
14 this before?

15 A. I don't remember. It's not something I
16 would normally see.

17 Q. Look at the list of things that are in the
18 tray and tell us if these are the same type things you
19 had in your tray.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Doctor, do you believe that the way you
22 performed ESIs on your patients in 2012 was within
23 recognized and acceptable professional standards for
24 this type procedure?

25 A. Yes. Excuse me. Yes.

Page 96

1 A. Yes, sir.

2 Q. We may call these standards of care
3 "standard," "standard practice" or whatever, but when
4 we use the word "standard," that's what we're going to
5 be talking about; okay?

6 A. Yes, sir.

7 Q. Now, in your opinion, did the standard of
8 care for this center in the performance of ESIs in
9 2012 differ from the standards expected of a clinic if
10 it was called a pain management clinic?

11 A. Could you -- could you elaborate on that?

12 Q. All right. This -- some places where ESIs
13 are performed are called pain management clinics;
14 right?

15 A. Yes, sir.

16 Q. You-all have chosen to call yourself a
17 surgery -- an ambulatory surgery center; right?

18 A. We didn't choose to call ourselves that.
19 It is, yes.

20 Q. Well, that's what it is. But the name is
21 St. Thomas Outpatient Neurosurgical Center.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. STOPNC; right?

24 A. Yes, sir.

25 Q. This center in 2012 performed ESIs; right?

Page 97

1 A. Yes, sir.
 2 Q. You're aware that there were other places
 3 who performed ESIs like you-all did, but they called
 4 themselves different names; true?
 5 A. Yes, sir.
 6 Q. And some call themselves "pain management
 7 clinics"; right?
 8 A. Yes, sir. They may be office space, which
 9 means they're not a surgery center, and that they
 10 don't have accreditation, so it makes it -- it's sort
 11 of -- it's a bit different.
 12 Q. But for the performance of providing ESI
 13 care to a patient in 2012, whether it was being done
 14 at a center like yours or in a pain management clinic,
 15 the standards were the same; you agree?
 16 A. For the procedure itself, yes.
 17 (Exhibit 127 was marked for
 18 identification.)
 19 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Now I'll hand you
 20 Exhibit 127, Doctor. This is STOPNC_629. Just read
 21 to yourself the mission first, please, Doctor.
 22 Have you read it?
 23 A. Yes, sir.
 24 Q. Now, this STOPNC policy is titled "Mission
 25 and Goals." Mission -- would you read to us what it

Page 98

1 says, please.
 2 A. "The mission of St. Thomas Outpatient
 3 Neurosurgical Center is to provide safe, timely and
 4 effective care to the patients we serve. We strive to
 5 implement innovative, cost-effective techniques that
 6 will ensure optimal patient outcomes in pain
 7 management."
 8 Q. Do you agree with that mission?
 9 A. Yes, sir.
 10 Q. Did the standard of care for this center
 11 require it to provide safe and timely and effective
 12 care to the patients it serves?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. Is it fair that the standard of care for
 15 the center required that the center must provide safe,
 16 timely and effective care to the patients it serves?
 17 A. Say that -- I'm sorry. Repeat the
 18 question.
 19 MR. KINNARD: If the court reporter
 20 will read it back, please.
 21 (The record was read by the reporter
 22 as requested.)
 23 THE WITNESS: Yes.
 24 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Okay. Doctor, you can
 25 put that down.

Page 99

1 Doctor, did you take the Hippocratic oath?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. First do no harm?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. Do you agree that the standard of care for
 6 a center requires that the center not needlessly
 7 endanger its patients?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. Do you agree that the standard of care for
 10 a center is that it must put patient safety first?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. Do you agree that the standard of care for
 13 a center requires that it must act in the best
 14 interest of the patient?
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. Do you agree that the standard of care for
 17 the center is that it must take all steps necessary to
 18 ensure that the product being injected into the
 19 patient's spine is safe?
 20 A. I would say that it take all reasonable
 21 steps that are part of the standard of care.
 22 Q. So you would say that the surgery center
 23 standard of care -- strike that -- that the center
 24 standard of care is that it must take all reasonable
 25 steps to ensure that the product that is being

Page 100

1 injected into a patient's spine is safe?
 2 A. That are part of the standard of care. All
 3 reasonable steps that are part of the standard of
 4 care.
 5 Q. Now, you're familiar also with the
 6 recognized standards of acceptable professional
 7 practice for an anesthesiologist caring for patients
 8 by means of epidural steroid injections in 2012, are
 9 you not?
 10 A. I am.
 11 Q. Those standards are national in nature,
 12 aren't they?
 13 A. Generally. I guess there may be some
 14 regional variation, but there's a pretty consistent
 15 national standard.
 16 (Exhibit 128 was marked for
 17 identification.)
 18 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Now I'm going to pass you
 19 Exhibit 128, STOPNC_628, and ask you to look at that.
 20 Read the philosophy part, please, Doctor.
 21 A. "St. Thomas Outpatient Neurosurgical Center
 22 will provide and facilitate care to those patients
 23 who, because of their general physical condition and
 24 the nature of the procedure to be performed, do not
 25 require acute hospitalization. Patients using this

Page 101

1 service shall receive the same quality of care as
2 those who are inpatients."

3 Q. Now, first, do you agree with that?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And when it says "inpatients," that means
6 if they are in the hospital; true?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And so the center standard of care requires
9 that patients at that service must receive the same
10 quality of care as they would as if they were in a
11 hospital?

12 A. Well, I'm not sure that it requires that.
13 That's a philosophy statement. But in -- and the
14 standard of care for a surgery center is not the same
15 as for an inpatient facility.

16 Q. Well, you do agree that patients at the
17 center should receive the same quality of care as they
18 would if they were in a hospital. You agree with
19 that?

20 A. They should have good quality care. But
21 in -- but there are other -- other standards that
22 apply to a hospitalized patient and the services
23 provided at a full hospital compared to those at a
24 surgery center.

25 Q. Do you agree that the standard of care for

Page 103

1 Q. Have you ever bought a home, Doctor?

2 A. Yes, sir.

3 Q. How many homes have you bought?

4 A. Three. Yes.

5 Q. Three?

6 A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)

7 No, four, excuse me.

8 Q. Have you had the experience that the seller
9 likes to brag about the quality of the home he or she
10 wants to sell?

11 A. Well, I've never met the seller prior to
12 the sale, so I don't know.

13 Q. Have you ever had a home inspection done of
14 a home before you bought it?

15 A. Yes, sir.

16 Q. Why did you do that?

17 A. To make sure that there were no hidden
18 problems or unrecognized problems in the -- in the
19 home.

20 MR. KINNARD: We'll take a lunch
21 break.

22 THE WITNESS: Okay.

23 VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the end of
24 Tape No. 2. We're off the record. And the
25 time is 11:41 a.m.

Page 102

1 the center includes that the center must not allow
2 center profits to jeopardize patient safety?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Do you agree that the standard of care for
5 the medical director is that he must make and keep
6 safety of the patients as his top priority?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Are you familiar in general with the
9 facility director's job?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And who was the facility director in 2011
12 and 2012?

13 A. Debra Schamberg.

14 Q. Now, why do -- why does the center have
15 policies and procedures?

16 A. To provide a framework for our operations.
17 It gives us something to refer to if we have a
18 question about how to proceed in a given situation.

19 Q. And do you know if people over there are
20 required to look through and read the policy and
21 procedures?

22 A. I don't know. I don't know if the staff
23 members when they're hired have to read the entire
24 policy and procedure manual or just parts they might
25 be responsible for. I don't know.

Page 104

1 (A lunch recess was taken at 11:41
2 a.m. and the deposition reconvened at 12:41
3 p.m.)

4 VIDEOGRAPHER: Here begins Tape No. 3
5 in the deposition of John Culclasure, M.D.
6 We're back on the record and the time is
7 12:41 p.m.

8 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) You ready, Doctor?

9 A. Yes, sir.

10 Q. What is your understanding of what a
11 deposition is?

12 A. It's a chance for you to, I guess, question
13 me about events that you're interested in, under oath.

14 Q. Okay. Do you understand that a deposition
15 is where you take an oath to tell the truth, and then
16 one or more lawyers may ask you questions?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. And that at the deposition there's a court
19 reporter?

20 A. And I'm sorry, I didn't --

21 Q. There's a court reporter like this lady at
22 the end of the table --

23 A. Uh-huh (affirmative).

24 Q. -- taking down your answers to questions;
25 right?

Page 105

1 A. Yes.
2 Q. So you do understand what a deposition is?
3 A. Yes, sir.
4 Q. Now, earlier in your testimony, you said
5 you had no memory of giving a deposition as an expert
6 witness before; is that right?
7 A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)
8 Q. True?
9 A. Yes, sir.
10 Q. You have to say yes or no.
11 A. Oh, yes, sir.
12 Q. Are you John W. Culclasure, M.D.?
13 A. Yes, sir. I am.
14 Q. Can you see that all right, Doctor?
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. This document appears to be -- it says the
17 deposition of John W. Culclasure, M.D. Is that you?
18 A. Yes, sir.
19 Q. Taken on December 12, 2012. Do you see
20 that?
21 A. Yes, sir.
22 Q. And in the First Circuit Court of Davidson
23 County Tennessee -- and there's the style of the case
24 up there. Humphrey versus Mack Wilson Griffith, M.D.
25 Do you see that?

Page 106

1 A. Yes, sir.
2 Q. It looks like a malpractice case, doesn't
3 it?
4 A. Yes, sir.
5 Q. Do you remember now serving as an expert
6 witness in that case?
7 A. Yes, sir. I remember reviewing that. I
8 didn't remember whether we did a deposition or not,
9 so...
10 Q. There's a stipulation on the Page 4 that
11 the deposition of John W. Culclasure was taken by the
12 plaintiff at the law offices of Miller & Martin. Do
13 you see that?
14 A. Yes, sir.
15 Q. This ring a bell now?
16 A. I don't remember the questions or the
17 exact -- the deposition. But I -- I certainly
18 reviewed the case. I know Dr. Wilson -- I mean Dr.
19 Griffith.
20 Q. Well --
21 A. I remember the details of the case.
22 Q. The question is not whether you remember
23 the questions. It's whether you remember giving the
24 deposition. Do you remember it?
25 A. I remember now. It's just -- yes, sir. I

Page 107

1 remember.
2 Q. Mr. Beveridge is my law partner. And one
3 of the first questions he asked you is "Have you given
4 a deposition before?" What did you say?
5 A. 20 or so, 25 maybe. Mostly workers'
6 compensation.
7 Q. But you said fewer for malpractice cases.
8 A. Yes, sir. I don't remember how many I've
9 done for malpractice. Most of the ones that -- excuse
10 me -- most of the time when I served as an expert for
11 the case, they don't -- they generally didn't go to
12 even a deposition, I don't think. I don't remember
13 doing a lot of depositions for malpractice cases.
14 Q. The point is, you've testified in more than
15 one medical malpractice deposition, haven't you?
16 A. I mean, I see this one. I don't know how
17 many, sir.
18 Q. But you did do it; right?
19 A. Yes, sir. I guess so.
20 Q. Now, is there something wrong with your
21 memory?
22 A. Not generally, no.
23 Q. Okay. Let's talk --
24 MR. KINNARD: Let's shut this Elmo
25 down. Thank you.

Page 108

1 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) About how many total ESIs
2 have you done in your career?
3 A. A rough guess would be probably be 40,000,
4 somewhere around that. Just based on the average
5 number and the number of years I've been doing it.
6 Q. Before this catastrophe we've referred to
7 in the first couple of minutes of your testimony
8 happened, did you ever have a patient develop
9 arachnoiditis as a result of your injecting epidural
10 steroid injection steroids into the patient?
11 A. Not that I'm aware of.
12 Q. Since the catastrophe happened, have any of
13 your patients that you injected epidural steroids into
14 developed arachnoiditis?
15 A. I don't know.
16 Q. You don't know of any?
17 A. Correct.
18 Q. Whatever steroid products you used before
19 2011, you were satisfied and content that they were
20 safe; is that true?
21 A. Yes, sir.
22 Q. After the catastrophe occurred, whatever
23 steroid product you used for epidural steroid
24 injections, you are content and satisfied with as
25 being safe; true?

Page 109

1 A. Yes. True.
 2 Q. What were you using before you switched to
 3 a product made by NECC?
 4 A. Methylprednisolone acetate.
 5 Q. MPA? Can we -- MPA?
 6 A. Yes. We can call it MPA.
 7 Q. Okay. Did it have preservative in it?
 8 A. Yes, sir.
 9 Q. What was the preservative?
 10 A. Picolinium.
 11 Q. And what is that?
 12 A. I couldn't tell you exactly, but it's used
 13 as a preservative in some injectable medications.
 14 Q. But to your knowledge, none of your
 15 patients that you used that with ever developed
 16 arachnoiditis; is that right?
 17 A. Correct.
 18 Q. After the catastrophe --
 19 A. Well, none developed it as a result of that
 20 injection, as far as I know. There are other causes
 21 of arachnoiditis.
 22 Q. Yeah. But not connected to the ESI?
 23 A. Correct.
 24 Q. After the catastrophe, what did you use for
 25 the steroid?

Page 110

1 A. Methylpredni -- MPA.
 2 Q. Manufactured by whom?
 3 A. Pfizer.
 4 Q. Did Pfizer manufacture the steroid you used
 5 before the catastrophe?
 6 A. I believe they did.
 7 Q. Were you able to get all the steroids you
 8 needed after the catastrophe?
 9 A. Yes, I believe we have been.
 10 Q. Now, somebody came to you at some point in
 11 time and said, We're having some trouble with the
 12 supplier of our MPA. True?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. Was that person Ms. Schamberg?
 15 A. No.
 16 Q. Who was it?
 17 A. I think it was either Cindy McLendon or
 18 Sandra Littleton.
 19 Q. What is Cindy's last name?
 20 A. McLendon, M-C-L-E-N-D-O-N --
 21 Q. Or?
 22 A. Sandra or Sandy Littleton.
 23 Q. Do you know which one it was?
 24 A. No, sir, I don't. It was just mentioned --
 25 I think -- I think both of them may have ordered

Page 111

1 medications for us at different times. But one or
 2 both of them informed me that we were running low on
 3 that medication.
 4 Q. Did they tell you why?
 5 A. Not that I remember, other than it was back
 6 ordered.
 7 Q. What does "back ordered" mean?
 8 A. It means they put in the order and there's
 9 none available, and they'll fill the order as soon as
 10 they get more -- more in.
 11 Q. Did you ever have to not do an ESI because
 12 of a short shortage of MPA shortage?
 13 A. No.
 14 Q. In other words, you always had enough MPA
 15 to perform the ESIs?
 16 A. Yes, but we came down to I think a one- or
 17 two-day supply a couple of times.
 18 Q. But you never ran out? With no --
 19 A. With no -- correct. With no guarantee of
 20 when the next order might be shipped.
 21 Q. So was that your first knowledge by Ms.
 22 McLendon or Ms. Littleton about some sort of issue?
 23 A. I believe so, yes.
 24 Q. What did you tell them to do?
 25 A. I don't remember specifically. I probably

Page 112

1 asked them if there were other sources that we could
 2 get it from.
 3 Q. Probably or do you remember?
 4 A. I don't remember that specifically. This
 5 would have been a conversation when I'm -- when I
 6 probably left a patient room after talking to them and
 7 counseling them for the procedure. And they would
 8 have just stopped me as I was headed to the procedure
 9 room to take care of another patient, and just say,
 10 you know, Dr. Culclasure, we're running really low on
 11 the steroid and we're having trouble getting it. And
 12 so it would not have been a sit-down meeting, it just
 13 would have been mentioned to me in passing.
 14 Q. What did you do as a result of that
 15 conversation in the hallway?
 16 A. I probably either -- well, asked them to --
 17 or if they knew why or was there a way around that,
 18 could we -- is there a way to procure the medication?
 19 I probably went to Debra Schamberg and just asked her
 20 what our options were.
 21 Q. I'm not fussing with you, Doctor. I want
 22 to know, though, the difference between what you
 23 remember and what your memory tells you, and what
 24 think you probably would have done. Do you understand
 25 there's a difference?

Page 113

Page 115

1 A. I certainly do.

2 Q. Okay. What do you remember -- what do you
3 actually remember telling either Ms. McLendon or Ms.
4 Littleton?

5 A. I don't remember anything verbatim.

6 Q. But in your mind, as a result of one of
7 those people or both of them talking to you, what were
8 you thinking at the time? Do you remember that?

9 A. I was thinking that I didn't want to run
10 out of the supply of that medication.

11 Q. And how short was this picture that they
12 painted for you?

13 A. I thought that -- I think they said a few
14 days or one to two days' supply. I thought that we
15 got down to that low on a couple of occasions where we
16 were about to run out.

17 Q. But you don't remember whether it was one
18 or two days or a few days?

19 A. That's right. It just didn't -- that was
20 not a big distinction at that point.

21 Q. And then what happened, according to your
22 memory, next?

23 A. I don't remember how many times we got
24 close. But I discussed the situation with Debra
25 Schamberg and she said that she had met a

1 staff, probably, as I said, Cindy or Sandy and then
2 Debra.

3 Q. Are the only people you would have talked
4 with about this supply of steroids been Cindy, Sandy
5 and Debra?

6 A. Yes, sir.

7 Q. It's true you never talked to anybody else
8 about this situation at that point?

9 A. I think to the best of my recollection
10 that's true. It wasn't a -- it wasn't a crisis. It
11 wasn't something that stood out dramatically. It was
12 just something to deal with in the course of taking
13 care of the patients.

14 Q. Is there anything else about these
15 conversations up to this point in time you haven't
16 told us about yet? Anything?

17 A. Well, somewhere in the sequence, Debra
18 showed me some of the information from NECC. I don't
19 know whether that was the first time I talked to her
20 about it or when she told me that she thought about
21 reaching out to them. But she did have some -- I
22 don't remember whether it was a folder or whether it
23 was a one-page -- I mean a one-sheet on back and
24 front, but it just -- it was some advertising material
25 from NECC. So I saw that at some point during the

Page 114

Page 116

1 representative from a company called NECC at the FASCA
2 meeting that she attended.

3 Q. At a what meeting?

4 A. The Freestanding Ambulatory Surgery Center
5 Association. I think that may not be exactly it, but
6 something along those lines.

7 Q. And?

8 A. And so she asked if it was worthwhile to
9 check with them and see if they could supply the
10 medication. I said that would be fine. Check with
11 them and see what they can do.

12 Q. Anything else about that conversation?

13 A. I don't know whether at that same time or
14 later that day or the next day, she told me that she
15 had seen them at that meeting for at least two years,
16 maybe that was all. But they had been there -- she
17 had seen them there exhibiting for a couple of times,
18 that they supplied all kinds of medications including
19 steroid. And she thought they might be an answer to
20 our -- our threatened supply shortage.

21 Q. Anything else you remember about -- up to
22 this point in time, about speaking with anybody about
23 this issue?

24 A. I never spoke to anyone from NECC. The
25 only people I discussed this with would have been

1 process.

2 Q. Were you leaving it up to Debra Schamberg
3 to decide where to purchase these steroids?

4 A. She -- it was, I guess, more of a
5 collaboration. She just asked me if I thought that
6 was reasonable, and I said, Yeah that's very
7 reasonable, that they -- it looks like they do
8 everything correctly. They've got -- they follow, you
9 know -- it looks like they maintain high standards,
10 everything looks like it's state of the art. So I
11 said, That's fine.

12 Q. Was this in the hallway also?

13 A. It could have been in her office. Probably
14 in her office.

15 Q. Now, did she ever let you know anything
16 about price?

17 A. I think -- you know, she may have mentioned
18 some things about price. That just wasn't something
19 that concerned me, so I didn't really -- I didn't care
20 whether it was 50 cents more or less or a dollar more
21 or less. That wasn't a large sum of money. I mean if
22 we're talking about four or five hundred vials a
23 month, a dollar a vial wasn't going to -- it wasn't a
24 huge change in whether the center made money or not.

25 Q. Well, what if it had been \$3 more? Would

Page 117

1 that have made a difference to you?

2 A. Well, I don't know what the cut-off point
3 would have been. It wasn't -- that's not my issue.
4 I'm not the -- I'm not managing the surgery center.

5 Q. Well, do you know whether the patient would
6 have had to pay more -- if the switch occurred in
7 steroids, that a few dollars more were charged to the
8 center; do you know that?

9 A. That wouldn't change anything that the
10 patient -- anything in the patient's bill. So no.

11 Q. But what it would change is the profit of
12 the center?

13 A. Yes, it would.

14 Q. And we've already established that the
15 standard of care for a center is to never let profit
16 take priority over patient safety; true?

17 A. True. And it never did.

18 Q. Are you telling us and the jury that money
19 had nothing to do with this decision, Doctor?

20 A. I said that profit did not affect the
21 patient care.

22 Q. Did money have anything to do with the
23 decision to switch?

24 A. Not with my decision, no.

25 Q. Did it have anything to do with the

Page 119

1 than NECC, that was preservative-free?

2 A. I don't know. I think there might have
3 been a betamethasone formulation that was
4 preservative-free, but I just don't remember exactly.
5 I didn't use betamethasone routinely, so -- or ever,
6 really, probably.

7 Q. But the MPA that you're familiar with does
8 have a preservative in it?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Right?

11 And that's what -- how many thousands of
12 injections of that MPA, which has a -- of the
13 preservative in it have you done?

14 A. Well, probably close to 40,000. It would
15 be -- I use that almost -- I use the MPA almost all
16 the time.

17 Q. If Cindy, Sandy and Debra had never had a
18 conversation with you about some potential shortage of
19 MPA and there had not been any sort of shortage of
20 MPA, you would have kept on using it, wouldn't you?

21 MR. GIDEON: Object to the form.

22 THE WITNESS: Yes. If I had -- as
23 long as the -- it was supplied to us, then
24 I would have continued to use it.

25 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) In other words, as long

Page 118

1 center's decision to switch?

2 A. The center was just looking for a reliable,
3 safe source of the medication. And I think Debra as
4 part of her job tried to negotiate the best price --
5 which is what her job would require of her.

6 Q. Do you know what supplier was supplying the
7 MPA to you-all before this catastrophe occurred?

8 A. No, sir.

9 Q. You don't really care about that, do you?

10 A. I don't care what wholesaler sends the
11 medication over.

12 Q. Did you have a discussion with Ms.
13 Schamberg, Find me steroid that's preservative-free?

14 A. I don't think we -- I think it was more
15 that she said, One other advantage for NECC is they
16 provide preservative-free steroid. We weren't
17 actually -- we weren't actively searching for a
18 preservative-free steroid at that time. It's always
19 desirable -- it's desirable to have a
20 preservative-free formulation if we're going to inject
21 it into the spine. But it's very hard to get that for
22 a lot of the medications. So that wasn't what really
23 drove the decision to go with NECC. But the fact that
24 they offered preservative-free I thought was a bonus.

25 Q. Have you ever used a steroid for ESI, other

Page 120

1 as you could have gotten MPA like you were getting it
2 from Pfizer, you would have kept using it?

3 A. Yes.

4 MR. GIDEON: Objection.

5 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) I want to be certain
6 about some things in respect to what you did about
7 this switch to NECC. Is it true you never called a
8 pharmacist about this potential switch?

9 A. Yes, that's true.

10 Q. Is it true you never consulted with any
11 doctors in your group?

12 A. Yes, that's true.

13 Q. Is it true, other than some brochures that
14 Ms. Schamberg showed you from NECC, that that's the
15 only documents you ever saw about this proposed
16 switch?

17 A. Yes, that's true.

18 Q. You never went to a computer and Googled
19 NECC, did you?

20 A. I never Googled the name of any
21 manufacturer or supplier that we got supplies from.

22 Q. The question is did you ever go to a
23 computer and Google anything about NECC?

24 A. No, sir.

25 Q. Other than these three ladies you told us

Page 121

1 about, did you ever talk to anybody about NECC before
2 the catastrophe?

3 A. No, sir.

4 Q. How much trouble would it have been,
5 Doctor, to consult with a qualified pharmacist about
6 the question of whether what NECC does is safe?

7 A. I don't know.

8 Q. Is there anything in writing about the
9 decision that was made to switch to NECC?

10 A. If there is something in writing, it would
11 be from Debra, since she was doing the ordering or
12 initiating the contact. I would not have made any
13 notes that I'm aware of.

14 Q. If it there were any questions about the
15 quality of steroids at NECC, did you expect Ms.
16 Schamberg to find that out?

17 A. No, I expected the FDA and the Tennessee
18 department of pharmacy and the Massachusetts Board of
19 Pharmacy to be on top of that.

20 Q. Did you know, when Ms. Schamberg talked to
21 you, that NECC was a compounding pharmacy?

22 A. Yes, sir.

23 Q. What did you know a compounding pharmacy
24 was?

25 A. Compounding pharmacies take raw material

Page 123

1 Did you call any doctors or colleagues and
2 ask them, Do you use NECC?

3 A. No, sir.

4 Q. Do I understand that what Ms. Schamberg --
5 MR. GIDEON: Schamberg.

6 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) -- showed you from NECC
7 was their sales promotional materials?

8 A. I believe that's correct.

9 Q. Did it ever cross your mind to ask whether
10 this compounder was -- that their drugs were
11 FDA-approved or not?

12 A. No, it did not. I didn't know that a drug
13 could be sold in the United States and not be
14 FDA-approved.

15 Q. Anything else you want to add to that?

16 A. I think that's sufficient.

17 Q. Okay. Saint Thomas Health Services was a
18 50-percent owner of this center; is that right?

19 A. I've never seen the documents about that,
20 but I think that's true.

21 Q. Assume it is, that according to the
22 documents they've supplied, they're 50-percent owner;
23 okay?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. You did know that they had an ownership

Page 122

1 and package it for an injectable drug in a sterile
2 form.

3 Q. Did you know whether or not it was
4 FDA-regulated?

5 A. I did not.

6 Q. Did you assume it was?

7 A. I did.

8 Q. That was a mistake, wasn't it?

9 A. I don't know.

10 The FDA did go in in early 2013 and inspect
11 and shut down some compounding pharmacies. So that
12 makes it appear that they did have the power to do
13 that at that time.

14 Q. Do you know why?

15 A. I don't know it offhand, but I remember
16 seeing some news reports about that.

17 Q. Do you know the difference between a
18 compounding pharmacy and a manufacturer of drugs?

19 A. I -- not exactly.

20 Q. Do you know what triggers FDA involvement
21 when a compounder starts manufacturing drugs?

22 A. I don't.

23 Q. Did you ever go to the Framingham facility?

24 A. No, sir.

25 Q. Never been.

Page 124

1 interest, didn't you?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. You could have called a Saint Thomas
4 Hospital pharmacist and asked for some help if you
5 thought you needed it?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Tell us every step, Doctor, that you
8 haven't mentioned already, to perform due diligence to
9 ensure that NECC was a safe supplier of these
10 steroids.

11 A. Those were all the steps.

12 Q. There's nothing else, is there?

13 A. No, sir.

14 Q. Did anybody ever come to you and say,
15 Doctor, we're getting the steroids from NECC, and now
16 they want a patient-specific prescription? Did
17 anybody ever do that?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Did you ever learn, before the catastrophe,
20 that NECC wanted from the center, patient-specific
21 prescriptions, by name?

22 A. No. They never asked for a prescriptions,
23 that I'm aware of.

24 Q. Did they ever want a list of names of
25 patients before they would supply the steroids?

Page 125

1 A. Yes, they did.
 2 Q. Were you aware of that?
 3 A. Yes.
 4 Q. How did you become aware of that?
 5 A. Debra Schamberg informed me.
 6 Q. When did she tell you?
 7 A. I don't remember.
 8 Q. What did she tell you?
 9 A. That NECC wanted a list of patients because
 10 the -- they told her that it was a requirement from
 11 the Massachusetts Board of Pharmacy.
 12 Q. What did you tell her?
 13 A. I said that was fine. See what they need
 14 and supply them with the information.
 15 Q. What did you think was going to be supplied
 16 to NECC?
 17 A. Debra and I discussed it. She was
 18 concerned about relaying too much information about
 19 the patients. And so I think she negotiated with them
 20 a little bit about what they needed. So I think they
 21 got basically just a list of patient names.
 22 Q. Okay. We're using words that worry me a
 23 little bit, "think." I want to know your memory,
 24 Doctor. Let's start over. So what did she tell you
 25 NECC wanted?

Page 126

1 A. Well, sir, that's the best I can do. These
 2 were events that at the time were not -- were not that
 3 dramatic or unusual, and so I don't remember the day
 4 of the week or the time of the day or anything like
 5 that. I don't remember the month.
 6 So she just stopped me while -- you know,
 7 at work or got my attention, and just said, Now they
 8 want patient names. And she was concerned about
 9 protected health information. So I just said, Find
 10 out what they need and, you know, we can -- if they're
 11 a supplier then we can provide them with that kind of
 12 information, if necessary.
 13 Q. Did you understand that they wanted the
 14 names of patients who were to receive these
 15 injections?
 16 A. I don't know. There was some -- Debra
 17 informed them that we wouldn't know at the time the
 18 list was sent, which ones got which medications. You
 19 know because they were -- other people used different
 20 steroids. Not every patient got MPA. And so -- but
 21 they were satisfied with having the list that way. I
 22 just -- I assumed that it meant that if for some
 23 reason something came up or the Massachusetts Board of
 24 Pharmacy wanted information from them, they could
 25 always backtrack from that list and see who got what.

Page 127

1 They could call us and we could look up the patient
 2 and tell them, Ms. Smith got MPA and Mrs. Jones got
 3 betamethasone.
 4 Q. So the list, as far as you thought, was not
 5 designed to tell NECC who is going to get epidural
 6 steroid product, but any product from NECC?
 7 A. I'm -- I don't --
 8 Q. You're going to have to explain, please,
 9 for all of us, what you mean, about the list of the
 10 patients' names could be for what?
 11 A. I'm not understanding your question
 12 exactly. But almost all the patients got epidural
 13 steroid injections, so...
 14 Q. Is it your understanding that each
 15 patient's name that went to NECC was injected with
 16 something later?
 17 A. Yes, or they wouldn't have been a patient
 18 at the center.
 19 Q. And the something they were injected with,
 20 may not have been an epidural steroid, but something
 21 else?
 22 A. It could have been, yes.
 23 (Exhibit 131 was marked for
 24 identification.)
 25 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Let me hand you what we

Page 128

1 marked as Exhibit 131. It's a collective exhibit,
 2 STOPNC_696. What is this, Doctor?
 3 A. It's the policy, the title is Ethical
 4 Business Behavior.
 5 Q. Part of STOPNC's policy manual?
 6 A. Yes, it appears so.
 7 Q. Looking at Page 3, do you see Principle
 8 One, Legal Compliance?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. Would you read that for us all, please,
 11 Doctor.
 12 A. "STOPNC is committed to conduct its
 13 activities in compliance with applicable laws and
 14 regulations. The following standards are meant to
 15 guide employees in compliance. These standards do not
 16 completely cover all applicable laws and regulations.
 17 Regardless, employees are expected to comply with all
 18 applicable laws, regulations and guidelines, use good
 19 judgment, and consult with their supervisor."
 20 Q. You agree with that?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. Now, look at Page 4, please, Principle Two,
 23 Business Practices. Read that first paragraph,
 24 please.
 25 A. "STOPNC is committed to the highest

Page 129

standards of business ethics and integrity. Employees are charged with representing STOPNC accurately and honestly, refraining from any activity intended to defraud anyone of money, property or services, and at all times act in good faith and in the best interest of STOPNC."

Q. Do you agree with that?

A. Yes, sir.

Q. And will you please read the next paragraph.

A. "The following standards provide guidance to help ensure STOPNC's business activities reflect high standards of business ethics and integrity. Employee conduct not specifically addressed by these standards must still be consistent with this principle. Questions regarding the interpretation or application of this principle should be directed to the supervisor."

Q. You agree with that?

A. Yes.

Q. Then the Page 10 -- you on Page 10?

A. I'm on Page 5.

Q. Well go to 10, please, sir. Read the second question, and then the answer, please.

A. "Who is responsible for understanding and

Page 131

downstairs at a certain time on the 8th floor, after seeing a patient downstairs. So they would -- the system, to my understanding, doesn't allow a placeholder. So they would just use Mickey Mouse or Minnie Mouse, I think, as a -- as placeholders. Those names are clearly not real people, and so it just let's the staff know that -- not to book something in that slot because I was going to be elsewhere.

I think they also used those -- attached to those names are a full set of made-up demographics in the system, and when new employees come on board they train -- they learn how to put data in, do charges and things like that, using Mickey Mouse and Minnie Mouse, because those are clearly not real patients, whereas Joe Smith or John Doe could be a real patient.

Q. Have you finished?

A. Yes, sir.

Q. That is an internal arrangement the center has?

A. Yes.

Q. It's not -- the use of Mickey Mouse is not intended to go out of the center, is it?

A. No. It wasn't intended to.

Q. Do you know why she used the name Mickey Mouse?

Page 130

complying with the laws and regulations that apply to my work area? All employees are responsible for complying with laws and regulations as well as STOPNC policies and procedures that relate to their jobs and apply to their respective work areas. Familiarize yourself with this document for expectations regarding your business conduct. If you have questions, ask your supervisor for clarification."

Q. You agree with that, don't you?

A. Yes, sir.

Q. Did Ms. Schamberg ever come to you and say to you, I need to put the name Mickey Mouse on this document that lists the patients to NECC?

A. No.

Q. You didn't know anything about the use of Mickey Mouse's name to NECC, did you?

A. No.

Q. If she had come to you and said, Doctor, I want to use the name Mickey Mouse on this list of patients with NECC, would you have told her, Don't do that?

A. I would have asked her to redact that from the document, because there's no patient named Mickey Mouse. That's a placeholder that we would use to let the staff upstairs know that I was going to be

Page 132

A. I have no idea. I think that was set up long before I came. But it was explained to me that it was chosen partly because everyone would know that that was not a real patient.

Q. You mean NECC would know it was not a real --

A. No, no, no. That other employees at the -- at STOPNC would know that -- it was -- if that showed up, they knew not to book something in that slot at the center, because I was going to be elsewhere. I would be maybe downstairs on the 8th floor seeing a consult, would be the most common reason. So otherwise I would -- I could get double-booked.

The -- because the office -- the scheduling system is different for the center and for the practice. And so the -- so it would have been possible for someone to book me to see a consult as part of me being -- me being a part of Howell Allen Clinic on the 8th floor, and at the same time the center staff could have booked me to do injections on the 9th floor.

And so by having those filler names in, it was apparent to the center staff that I was not going to be there, not to book anyone in those slots.

They tended to be the first slots after

Page 133

1 lunch, because I would eat lunch and then go
 2 downstairs and see consults, if I had consults to see
 3 downstairs.
 4 Q. But that was never intended to communicate
 5 with NECC or anybody like NECC?
 6 A. Correct. Those were just placeholder
 7 names.
 8 Q. Did Ms. Schamberg tell you that the Board
 9 of Pharmacy in Massachusetts wanted NECC to get a list
 10 of names of patients?
 11 A. No, sir.
 12 Q. Do you get a flu shot each year?
 13 A. I have for the last several.
 14 Q. Do you know how much a flu shot is?
 15 A. I have no idea.
 16 Q. Do you have good insurance?
 17 A. I have --
 18 Q. Health insurance?
 19 A. Yes, sir.
 20 Q. Where do you get your flu shot?
 21 A. Debra administers it to center staff.
 22 Q. Well, if you didn't have that advantage,
 23 Doctor, and you were like the rest of us who have to
 24 go to places sometimes like Walgreens, to get a -- you
 25 ever get a flu shot at Walgreens?

Page 134

1 A. No, sir.
 2 Q. You don't have any idea how much a flu shot
 3 cost at Walgreens, do you?
 4 A. Not at all.
 5 Q. Well, if you went to Walgreens to get your
 6 flu shot, and they said, You're going to have to copay
 7 \$10 instead of \$5, would you do it?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 MR. KINNARD: Okay. We'll take a
 10 five- to seven-minute break.
 11 VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the end of
 12 Tape No. 3. We're off the record. The
 13 time is 1:25 p.m.
 14 (A recess was taken.)
 15 VIDEOGRAPHER: Here begins Tape No. 4
 16 to the videotaped deposition of John
 17 Culclasure. We're back on the record and
 18 the time is 1:40 p.m.
 19 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Ready, Doctor?
 20 A. Yes, sir.
 21 Q. Other than with NECC, which asked
 22 Ms. Schamberg to send a list of patient names, was
 23 there ever any other manufacturer or provider of
 24 steroids that asked for such a list?
 25 A. No, sir.

Page 135

1 (Exhibit 135 was marked for
 2 identification.)
 3 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Doctor, we've marked as
 4 Exhibit 135, STOPNC 65, 59, 58, 57, 56, as this
 5 exhibit. Do you see down here where it says physician
 6 name, signature? Do you see that, Doctor?
 7 A. Yes. Yes. Yes.
 8 Q. Is that your signature?
 9 A. No, sir.
 10 Q. Who signed your name there?
 11 MR. GIDEON: Object to the form.
 12 THE WITNESS: I don't know.
 13 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) You don't know who signed
 14 your name?
 15 A. Well, that doesn't look like --
 16 MR. GIDEON: Object to the form.
 17 THE WITNESS: That doesn't look like
 18 an attempt at a signature. It looks like
 19 they were putting my name down as requested
 20 by the form.
 21 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Oh, did you write your
 22 name there?
 23 A. No, sir. I didn't. But it's -- I'm saying
 24 it doesn't look like someone tried to fake my
 25 signature.

Page 136

1 Q. What did you say?
 2 A. It looks like someone printed my name. It
 3 says -- the form says "physician's name/signature."
 4 So I would assume that meant the first thing to do
 5 would be to write the physician's name out, and then a
 6 signature. And that looks like my name written out,
 7 not a signature.
 8 Q. So you never signed this, obviously?
 9 A. No, sir.
 10 Q. All right. Do you know what the shelf life
 11 for MPA manufactured by Pfizer was?
 12 A. No, sir.
 13 Q. All right. Did the procedure that you told
 14 us about, when you went in to meet with the patient
 15 for the first time, who is going to undergo an ESI,
 16 change any when you were using this product from NECC?
 17 A. No, sir.
 18 Q. I'm going to put up on the Elmo now, STOPNC
 19 2386, which is Exhibit 39 from Ms. Schamberg's
 20 testimony at her deposition. Please read that,
 21 Doctor.
 22 A. "Do I have to use certain vendors for
 23 ordering? I would like to do some price comparison
 24 with other vendors other than Cardinal. I'm not
 25 pleased with our Cardinal rep, and I know there are

Page 137

1 some hungry vendors that would love our business.
2 Also, I have Solar Tinting coming next week to frost
3 the two windows looking into the ORs. Cost will be
4 \$175."

5 Q. Have you ever seen this document?

6 A. No, that -- if I did, it would have been
7 just looking through materials that I was provided to
8 review. But, I mean, that was hundreds of pages. I
9 don't remember that specifically.

10 Q. Okay. You're talking about after
11 litigation started in this matter, somebody sent you
12 documents to look at?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. Who sent you the document?

15 A. My attorneys.

16 Q. I'm going to put up there now on the Elmo,
17 STOPNC 2472, 2473 and 2474. This is from you to Debra
18 Schamberg on July 26, 2012; right? Apparently you
19 sent her this letter you got; is that right?

20 A. Yes, sir.

21 Q. Now, do you remember getting this letter?

22 A. Yes, sir. We were concerned about the --
23 about the contrast. The contrast came in very large
24 vials and I don't remember now how many, 50 cc vials,
25 and we were only using two or three ccs from each one.

Page 138

1 It just seemed awfully wasteful, and plus we were
2 dumping them back into the environment if we threw
3 them away immediately. So we wanted to -- and so we
4 had been using them multiple times on the same day,
5 cleaning each one -- cleaning in between times and
6 never it with -- only entering it with new needles.

7 And so there -- and then that became
8 controversial and the organization ASIP, which is up
9 there, next to Dr. Manchikanti's name, they were
10 concerned about that too, and they thought there
11 should be a way for practices to split up the contrast
12 into smaller aliquots or have a compounding pharmacy
13 do it under a sterile hood and then ship it.

14 And so that was why I sent that to her.

15 Q. Well, here's the doctor's name. Do you
16 recognize that name now?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. Do you know him?

19 A. Yes, sir. I've met him.

20 Q. How do you say his name?

21 A. Manchikanti.

22 Q. All right. He says, "Thus even if a
23 compounding pharmacy, which we consider not to be very
24 safe, revised it, it would be doable" -- excuse me,
25 "double or triple the price we would be paying when we

Page 139

1 used a single dose vial on multiple patients."

2 Now, what did you take it to mean he was
3 saying, "Thus even if a compounding pharmacy which we
4 consider to be not very safe." What does he mean?

5 A. That didn't really concern me at the time.

6 I wasn't -- that was not my focus about the letter.

7 It was the fact that he was supporting our position
8 that we should have some alternative to wasting so
9 much contrast on multiple patients.

10 My experience by that time with NECC had
11 been a year of being a client of theirs with no
12 problems with their medication. So that -- my
13 experience was not that. And over the years, we've
14 used compounding pharmacies to make pump medications,
15 to compound pump medications for patients that have
16 implanted pumps. And those are complicated mixtures
17 of drugs and they only come from compounding
18 pharmacies.

19 So -- and throughout that time, with many,
20 many years of using compounding pharmacies, I'd never
21 had a problem with a compounding pharmacy. So my
22 experience -- because of that experience I was not
23 very concerned about his -- that one line in that
24 letter. And that wasn't the focus of the letter. The
25 focus of the letter was about having CMS allow us to

Page 140

1 split the vials of contrast.

2 Q. Here's a memo from -- excuse me, an e-mail
3 from Debra Schamberg to Bobbi Doty. Who is Bobbi
4 Doty?

5 A. She's a clerical person in the practice.
6 She's my secretary and she schedules procedures for
7 me.

8 Q. Dated 12/9/2010. Ms. Schamberg said, "We
9 may start ordering from Clint Pharma. They are local
10 and I think they will give us better \$\$. What do you
11 interpret that to mean?"

12 A. I assume that's just her shorthand for a
13 better price.

14 Q. I'm going to show you now STOPNC 4231, an
15 e-mail. What does it mean, "from John W. Culclasure,
16 Doctor, to John Culclasure, Senior." What does that
17 mean?

18 A. She -- let me see. That means I forwarded
19 that from my work e-mail to my personal e-mail.

20 Q. Okay. Why did you do that?

21 A. I'm not sure. Let me...

22 Q. Let's see what this said. Maybe it'll help
23 you.

24 A. To ASA 13. Oh, that's the other guys that
25 came in, and that was in October. I guess I must have

1 been -- I don't know, I guess I was obviously out of
2 town. Sometimes -- usually what I save is when she
3 sends me just, like, totals of what we've done, I
4 usually save that in a folder on my personal e-mail.
5 But I'm not sure why I saved that.

6 Q. Well, she told you, "We have an increase of
7 50 procedures over the last year." Right?

8 A. Yeah. But that doesn't seem worth saving.
9 So I just don't remember why I would have saved that.

10 Q. She says "You have done 37 more procedures
11 to ASA 13." What does that mean?

12 A. That's the group's -- the abbreviation of
13 the group's name for the guys who came over to help
14 me. Dr. Dickerson, Carrero, Arney, Rome.

15 Q. They were all combined?

16 A. Yes, they were all within that group.

17 Q. And who is Dr. A she gave a flu shot to?

18 A. That would be Dr. Arney.

19 Q. And is there any sort of animosity with her
20 or him? Is it a woman or man?

21 A. It's a man. He was a very nice man. He
22 passed away because of multiple myeloma and we were
23 all very close to him, so there was no animosity.

24 Q. Now, when was the first time -- strike
25 that.

1 Before somebody told you there's a possible
2 connection to ESIs performed in the center during that
3 summer before, were you getting any sense of there are
4 more patients returning to Howell Allen with problems
5 after the ESIs than usual?

6 A. No, sir.

7 Q. Nobody at Howell Allen alerted you to, "Hey
8 we're getting more people in here for more tests after
9 ESIs," anything like that?

10 A. No, sir.

11 Q. So you -- you were oblivious to any problem
12 with the ESIs until somebody told you something; is
13 that right?

14 A. I was unaware of any problems with the ESIs
15 until I was informed that there was a patient at
16 Vanderbilt who had a fungal meningitis.

17 Q. Who told you that?

18 A. I think I got a call from Debra, who'd
19 gotten a call from the infection control nurse at
20 Saint Thomas.

21 Q. Did you know the patient?

22 A. I didn't know him. I had done his
23 injections. I don't think he was -- he was not a --
24 someone that I had seen for years like some of the
25 patients.

1 Q. What was the date of that information?

2 A. It was September 18th. My dad's birthday
3 is the 19th, so that's why I remember that.

4 Q. And what did you do about that information?

5 A. Debra told me -- Debra called me. I was
6 already home and she told me that Candace wanted to
7 know if a -- just said there was a patient at
8 Vanderbilt who was sick and he had been diagnosed with
9 an Aspergillus meningitis and wanted to know if he had
10 received injections at STOPNC. And I asked her if she
11 wanted me to go back in and find out then and she
12 said, no, it's not -- that's not urgent. Candace just
13 wanted to know tomorrow if he had been a patient.

14 So when I went in the next day to the
15 imaging center where I am on Wednesdays, I pulled up
16 his information and he -- there was a telephone note
17 in the chart. He told -- he was calling to let Dr.
18 McCombs know that he was doing better after his
19 injections, but that he had been diagnosed at
20 Vanderbilt with Rocky Mountain spotted fever
21 meningitis. And -- but since that note was made, he
22 had been re-admitted and they made the diagnosis of
23 Aspergillus meningitis.

24 So I guess I contacted both -- I think I
25 probably just talked to Debra. I don't know if I

1 called Candace at that point, but I told her what I
2 saw in the record and I said, you know, I don't see
3 how this could come from us. If someone had -- if we
4 had had a contaminated injection, I would expect it to
5 be, one, bacterial, and, two, an abscess, not a
6 meningitis because that's what would happen after an
7 epidural injection.

8 And so I said this seems very unusual, and
9 I said apparently they diagnosed him with Rocky
10 Mountain spotted fever, I said, and he had a spinal
11 tap in July at Vanderbilt. And I said, you know,
12 that's when the new residents and interns are there.
13 It almost seems more likely to me that they could
14 have, you know, con -- gotten -- you know, broken
15 sterile technique and in the process of doing the
16 spinal tap, they could have maybe gotten -- you know,
17 put some aspergillus spores into him and maybe that's
18 how this happened. But I was -- that was -- the
19 possibility of a fungal meningitis occurring so long
20 after this man's procedures, it just -- at that point
21 it seemed like the more likely explanation was
22 something else. But I reported that back. And so --
23 and so that's what happened on the 19th.

24 Q. And then what happened next as far as
25 you're concerned?

1 A. I went in to work on Thursday sometime in
2 the morning. We were -- Candace got in touch and said
3 there might be two more patients in the hospital who
4 have -- who have symptoms of meningitis. And so we
5 checked to see what -- see if they had been patients
6 at the center and they had.

7 I think at that point, I asked Cindy to
8 call our suppliers and see if any of them had had any
9 reports of unusual infections following use of their
10 supplies or medication. I think she -- I think she
11 called -- got in touch with GE because they supplied
12 the contrast. We called the people who put the trays
13 together. We called NECC so -- to try to see if
14 anything -- if they had any reports of anything
15 unusual, and they all said no.

16 But -- but so that afternoon, after sort of
17 digesting all of this even though it just -- I could
18 not in my mind connect the dots, I called Scott
19 Butler, the practice manager, and I told him that I
20 didn't know what was going on, that there were three
21 patients who had appeared to have meningitis, and I
22 thought that we should close the center until we knew
23 what was going on.

24 Q. Would you like to take a break?

25 A. I'm all right. Let's go.

1 Q. All right. Then what happened?

2 A. We -- I told the staff that they needed to
3 call the patients and just -- and tell them that, you
4 know, we -- that we had an equipment problem that we
5 were having to reschedule their cases for the next
6 day. I think also that -- no, on Friday morning, I
7 think Dr. Latham, the infectious disease specialist at
8 Saint Thomas West, came up to -- and Candace, they
9 came up and sort of walked around, they looked at the
10 facility. And the Department of Health may have
11 gotten some people out that Friday too.

12 From that point on, we really just became
13 an arm of the Tennessee Department of Health. We
14 just -- you know, they came in and told us what they
15 needed, what we should do. And so from that point on
16 we were basically, you know, just following their
17 instructions on everything. I had no experience with
18 anything like this, and so we just did whatever they
19 said. Dr. Marion Kainer was involved. She's an
20 epidemiologist. So she thought that if we went
21 through the records and got lots of patient
22 demographic data when they had their injections, what
23 they were injected with, that we should be able to
24 figure out what was going on.

25 So for a -- for quite a while we had no

1 diagnosis. But for -- but every day, we would get,
2 you know -- there would be two or three more people
3 being admitted to the hospital. And at one point Dr.
4 Latham even thought that it wasn't infectious. That
5 instead it was -- might have been a chemical
6 contaminant in some of the stuff because he gave some
7 of the patients steroids and they got better
8 temporarily, but then they all got worse about 24 to
9 36 hours later.

10 And so that -- that next week it was --
11 Debra set up a process to try to call all the
12 patients. At first they just wanted to ask -- they
13 being the department of health -- they just wanted to
14 us ask the patients if they were -- how they were
15 doing and if they had any unusual symptoms, and if
16 they did, then we were going to -- we were going to
17 instruct them to come back to Saint Thomas and be
18 evaluated. We did not mention the word meningitis
19 because the department of health told us not to.

20 Apparently they had an outbreak of
21 meningococcal meningitis at MTSU sometime prior to
22 that and before they got that assessed and under
23 control word got out, I think I was told on Twitter or
24 something about men -- meningococcal meningitis at
25 MTSU. That's very infectious and it tends to infect

1 young people, college age, people in the military
2 living in close quarters. And so that got out ahead
3 of them being prepared to deal with it. So they
4 didn't want the word meningitis mentioned until they
5 knew it really was meningitis.

6 So we weren't even clear on the diagnosis
7 for probably for another week after that. One patient
8 instead of developing meningitis had an abscess, and
9 Dr. Standard opened her up to clean it out and then
10 that was the first time we had tissue and it was -- I
11 talked to the pathologist and he said it was -- it
12 looked like fungus. It was black. And so then they
13 tested it and it came back Exserohilum, which is not
14 the same fungus that the first patient was growing.
15 In fact, I think he was the only patient who ever grew
16 Aspergillus.

17 I'm sorry. I don't remember the question.
18 I probably --

19 Q. What we're going to do is take a break.
20 I'm going to take -- just a brief five-minute break.
21 We'll pick up right there when we come back; all
22 right?

23 A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)

24 VIDEOGRAPHER: We're off the record.

25 The time is 2:06 p.m.

1 (A recess was taken.)

2 VIDEOGRAPHER: We're back on the
3 record and the time is 2:17 p.m.

4 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) You ready, Doctor?

5 A. Yes, sir.

6 Q. Okay. You want to continue the answer that
7 you were giving us?

8 A. Could you repeat the question. I want to
9 make sure whether I --

10 MR. KINNARD: What was the last
11 subject matter he was talking about? Give
12 us a hint of the last few lines.

13 THE WITNESS: And I'd also like to
14 hear the question.

15 MR. GIDEON: I think the question
16 was, "And then what happened?"

17 THE WITNESS: Oh, okay.

18 (The record was read by the reporter
19 as requested.)

20 THE WITNESS: Yeah. Prior to the
21 biopsy of the abscess, we -- everybody
22 thought it was Aspergillus because of the
23 first patient who went to Vanderbilt. And
24 so they -- the infectious disease guy sent
25 off a special -- sent off CSF, cerebral

1 to treat these infections for a lot of the

2 folks because they would have problems with
3 the medication that they needed to take.

4 So I think I've sort of run out of anything
5 else to say at this point.

6 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) What was the date that you
7 started doing ESI injections again?

8 A. I think November 1st. I remember seeing
9 that on a document. Oh, that's when the center opened
10 back up, I think November 1st. I did some ESIs at the
11 imaging center.

12 Q. And that was where, the imaging center?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. Where was that located?

15 A. On Ellison Place near Saint Thomas Midtown.

16 Q. A Howell Allen facility; right?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Or --

19 A. Not a facility, but owned by Howell Allen.

20 Q. Okay. STOPNC 2718 is an e-mail from you to
21 Scott Butler. Would you please read the first
22 paragraph.

23 A. "Debra and I talked yesterday evening.
24 We're going to have the staff write down everything
25 they remember. Debra and I will do the same. We will

1 spinal fluid, for a special test. I'm
2 blanking on the name of it. But anyway,
3 it's an antigen test that should be
4 positive if the patient is infected with
5 Aspergillus.

6 So we all just thought that it would
7 confirm that the patients in the hospital
8 had Aspergillus, and that came back
9 negative. So then that was -- that was
10 very confusing because then we had really
11 no idea what was going on. We didn't know,
12 well, maybe -- maybe what the patients had
13 that are at Saint Thomas have is different
14 from what Mr. R. had at Vanderbilt. And so
15 it wasn't until Dr. Standard got the biopsy
16 that we were able to actually get a
17 diagnosis.

18 The problem -- and for a lot of the
19 patients the problem of the -- of it being
20 a fungal infection was that the fungal
21 medications are hard on people,
22 particularly older folks. It's hard on
23 their livers and kidneys and so that made
24 treating them -- for the infectious disease
25 guy, that made it very difficult for them

1 create memorandum and sign and date it. In the future
2 we can refer to this statement, not rely on our memory
3 a year from now."

4 Q. Okay. Do you know if that was done?

5 A. I didn't because I think about that time we
6 started compiling everything from all the notes that
7 the staff had made and we put all of the information
8 on patient phone calls and everything into an Excel
9 spreadsheet. And so I think -- so once that
10 started -- once that was done, that sort of had all
11 the -- all that kind of information.

12 Q. Well, what happened to the notes, do you
13 know?

14 A. I didn't maybe -- I don't know. I mean, I
15 didn't make -- I didn't make a separate note myself.
16 But initially when the staff was calling people, they
17 would -- I think they printed out the logs from each
18 day and they would call the patients and make -- just
19 write next to each name, you know, patient answered,
20 doing okay, no answer, call back, just notes like that
21 so they would know what to do.

22 Q. So have you seen any of those document s in
23 preparation for your deposition today?

24 A. I have not seen the spreadsheet
25 information, no.

Page 153

Page 155

1 Q. Have you seen any of the notes, any
2 handwritten notes or anything like that?
3 A. I saw them while they were -- I mean, I saw
4 them at that time. I've not seen them in any of the
5 materials I've reviewed for the deposition.
6 Q. Do you know if they were kept or destroyed?
7 A. I don't know. I would be surprised if
8 Debra -- anything would be destroyed. She's pretty
9 careful about documents.
10 (Exhibit 136 was marked for
11 identification.)
12 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) I'm going to mark as
13 Exhibit 136 STOPNC_1597, which is a two-page document.
14 It also includes 1594. It's dated October 3rd, 2012.
15 You familiar with this letter?
16 A. Yes, I believe so. I think I saw it.
17 Q. Is this a competitor of STOPNC?
18 A. He has another pain practice in town. I --
19 I don't usually think of it as a competitor. We're
20 closed. I mean, I'm not -- he's not -- so I don't
21 compete with him for patients. I mean, we're a closed
22 center. We don't take outside referrals.
23 Q. Okay. There's a sentence in the first
24 paragraph where he says, "The medications utilized by
25 the physicians at Center for Spine, Joint and

1 A. I may have. I don't remember. It sounds
2 like I -- I might have forwarded it -- could have
3 forwarded it to Scott to let him know that this was
4 going around.
5 Q. Do you know whether Scott Butler took some
6 action about the letter?
7 A. I don't know.
8 Q. Did you ever call this gentleman who sent
9 the letter?
10 A. I don't think so. Don't remember.
11 (Exhibit 137 was marked for
12 identification.)
13 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Exhibit 51 to Ms.
14 Schamberg's deposition we've marked as Exhibit 137
15 here, and I want to show you a copy of that. Do you
16 recognize this?
17 A. I don't think so.
18 Q. Are you saying you've never seen this
19 before?
20 A. I don't remember seeing a lot of things
21 from Clint so I don't know.
22 Q. Clint makes the representation in this,
23 "All products distributed by Clint Pharmaceuticals are
24 FDA approved and are not implicated in this outbreak.
25 FDA approved corticosteroids have been and are still

Page 154

Page 156

1 Neuromuscular Rehabilitation are FDA approved
2 medications from manufacturers and not" -- not being
3 in all caps -- "from compounding pharmacies."
4 Did you see that sentence at the time?
5 A. I believe I did, yes.
6 Q. Now, as a result of -- did you see this
7 letter at or about the time he sent it?
8 A. Yes. I think -- I don't really -- I think
9 he might have come -- come to us because we were
10 probably on the mailing list, or came to me.
11 Q. Were you upset seeing this?
12 A. Yeah, I was upset.
13 Q. Were you angry about it?
14 A. Possibly. Yeah, because that was -- at
15 that point things were still -- we still didn't really
16 even know -- I imagine by then we had the biopsy
17 diagnosis, but, yeah, yeah, I was angry.
18 Q. Why were you angry?
19 A. It just made it sound like we had done
20 something wrong.
21 Q. Okay. And what did you do about that
22 letter?
23 A. I think I showed it to Debra probably.
24 Q. Did you show it or send it to any of the
25 members of Howell Allen?

1 readily available through Clint Pharmaceuticals."
2 Now, do you agree or disagree with that
3 statement?
4 A. That FDA approved corticosteroids have been
5 and are still readily available through Clint
6 Pharmaceuticals?
7 Q. Right.
8 A. If they say that they were, then I guess
9 they had a supply.
10 Q. So you can't say this is incorrect; right?
11 A. If they had it on their shelves, I guess
12 that's accurate.
13 Q. Before this catastrophe occurred, you did
14 not know how many states NECC was licensed in, did
15 you?
16 A. It's hard to say when Debra told me, you
17 know, what about NECC some of those kind of details.
18 I thought she told me early on in the process that
19 they were licensed in every state in the country when
20 we started to order from them, but, I mean, that
21 wasn't -- that -- I couldn't put a date on that or
22 even a rough time, but I thought that that was
23 mentioned to me early on.
24 Q. Well, you didn't mention that when I asked
25 you to tell us everything Ms. Schamberg told you

Page 157

1 before y'all placed the orders.

2 A. Well, that's true. I can't think of a long
3 list of things always, but I gave you the best answer
4 I could at the time.

5 Q. Well, did you know before switching to NECC
6 anything about whether hospitals used NECC?

7 A. I don't know when I became aware of that.
8 Probably more after this occurred -- after the
9 outbreak occurred.

10 Q. People told you things about NECC after the
11 catastrophe; correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. People fed you information about NECC, what
14 it did, who all used it; correct?

15 A. I guess -- yes. They -- I got other
16 information provided to me about NECC.

17 Q. Where did you get that information?

18 A. Probably mainly from Debra.

19 Q. Anybody else?

20 A. I don't remember. Most of the discussions
21 about NECC were from Debra because she had a contact
22 with the company and I didn't.

23 Q. You also did not tell us earlier when I
24 asked you about your conversation with Ms. Schamberg
25 that an NECC rep had told her that Vanderbilt was an

Page 159

1 A. Oh. "When you have a patient stating they
2 will not pay for care rendered at STOPNC during the
3 affected time period, make sure you kindly advise them
4 of their responsibility. I will seek direction from
5 Mr. Butler regarding how to handle these accounts and
6 future appointments if patients elect not to pay. I
7 would assume standard collection protocol would be
8 followed, but I will keep you abreast of the decision
9 as soon as I speak with Mr. Butler."

10 Q. Now, what's standard collection protocol?
11 What is that?

12 A. I don't know. I don't work in the billing
13 office.

14 Q. Were you aware that the center would sue
15 patients for money?

16 A. I know that this probably came because
17 either the patients -- the patients were complaining
18 or I reached out to Shreka just asking if we could not
19 charge them considering what all happened. So it
20 could have been either one of those things. But we
21 also -- and, I mean, I'm not a business person, but it
22 is my understanding that with the insurance company we
23 were not able to waive a fee or, I mean, it was a
24 contractual obligation to, you know, balance bill the
25 patient for their part of the service and stuff like

Page 158

1 NECC customer. You didn't tell us that part. Did she
2 tell you that before the switch?

3 A. I don't remember.

4 Q. Likely after?

5 A. I don't remember.

6 (Exhibit 138 was marked for
7 identification.)

8 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) We've marked as
9 Exhibit 138 STOPNC_4565. What does this appear to be,
10 Doctor?

11 A. Okay. I'm sorry, what was the question
12 about the document?

13 Q. What is this?

14 A. This looks like a letter from our business
15 manager to -- well, I'm replying to her. She must
16 have -- she sent it to me and then I wrote back saying
17 thanks.

18 Q. This is dated 10/17/2012; right?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You were aware of the catastrophe by then?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And she's -- please read the fourth full
23 paragraph that she sent you.

24 A. The one that starts off with --

25 Q. "When you have."

Page 160

1 that. It's considered an illegal inducement if we
2 waive the copay or the deductible.

3 Q. Here's another e-mail dated 10/4/2012. Do
4 you recognize this now?

5 A. Yeah, I see it.

6 Q. Okay. You sent it to Greg Lanford and
7 copied several people; right?

8 A. Yes, looks like it.

9 Q. Who is bholt@babc.com?

10 A. I have no idea. It could have also been a
11 list of people who -- I wouldn't have had Dr.
12 Batchelor's e-mail or Dr. Latham's. It's probably
13 people that I had an e-mail that included those and I
14 thought -- and I probably just copied them because I
15 thought they all should have seen that. But I don't
16 know who bholt is.

17 Q. Did you author, that is, type this e-mail
18 where it starts saying, "We started using NECC"?

19 A. It's sent through my iPhone, so yes.

20 Q. Were these statements true when you made
21 them?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Down below, there's an e-mail from somebody
24 named Rebecca Cline. You see that?

25 A. Yes.

Page 161

1 Q. Who is she?
 2 A. She's at St. Thomas.
 3 Q. What does she do?
 4 A. You know, right now, I couldn't tell you.
 5 Q. The title there says chief communications
 6 and marketing officer. Do you see that? You can't
 7 see that?
 8 A. Oh, okay.
 9 Q. Does that help you identify who she is?
 10 A. Yes. Okay.
 11 Q. Okay. Would you read to us, please, the
 12 sentence she wrote, "We are starting to get."
 13 A. Sure. "We are starting to get inquiries
 14 regarding the use of materials from the NECC and from
 15 compounding pharmacies in general. Given that
 16 hospitals don't use compounding pharmacies, this is
 17 going to be best answered by a representative from the
 18 center. They're going to ask why centers use
 19 compounding pharmacies" -- something -- "previous
 20 problems." I can't see the rest.
 21 Q. Well --
 22 A. "That have -- pharmacies that have -- there
 23 have been previous problems," et cetera.
 24 Q. Did you know whether or not hospitals used
 25 compounding pharmacies?

Page 162

1 A. I don't think I did at the time know one
 2 way or the other.
 3 (Exhibit 139 was marked for
 4 identification.)
 5 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) I'm going to mark that
 6 e-mail we just discussed as Exhibit 139, STOPNC-4422.
 7 Here's an e-mail from you to Debra
 8 Schamberg, copying Scott Butler, 11/21/2012.
 9 MR. SCHRAMEK: If there aren't copies
 10 of the exhibits, could you read out the
 11 Bates number.
 12 MR. KINNARD: I'm sorry. Yes.
 13 STOPNC_3097. I'm sorry.
 14 MR. SCHRAMEK: Okay.
 15 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) In that -- down here, you
 16 say, "I do not want to be responsible for ordering the
 17 imaging studies and having to follow up on those."
 18 What do you mean by that?
 19 A. If I ordered the tests, then it's my
 20 responsibility to the patient to then make sure I get
 21 the results and then get in touch with them about
 22 those results. At that point, there was so much going
 23 on, I didn't have the --
 24 Q. You want the date?
 25 A. I see. It's the 12th of November -- 21st

Page 163

1 of November. But that was not what -- I was not their
 2 primary care physician. I'm not an infectious disease
 3 specialist. And so that was just me saying that the
 4 most efficient way for them to get studies done and
 5 make sure that they got proper followup was to have it
 6 done with the emergency room or with -- with their own
 7 physician.
 8 Q. We're going to mark Exhibit 140
 9 STOPNC_0775. It's a photograph. What would this
 10 appear to be a photograph of?
 11 (Exhibit 140 was marked for
 12 identification.)
 13 THE WITNESS: Depo-Medrol.
 14 Q. (By Mr. Kinnard) Do you know when this
 15 photograph was made?
 16 A. No, sir.
 17 Q. I see an expiration date of 05/2013. Do
 18 you see that?
 19 A. Yes.
 20 Q. Is it fair to assume that that was the
 21 expiration date for this product?
 22 A. I assume so given that the only information
 23 I have is the picture again.
 24 Q. When this catastrophe occurred -- excuse
 25 me -- before the switch to NECC, do you know if this

Page 164

1 drug was around, Depo-Medrol?
 2 A. It's been around for years.
 3 Q. Did you have it on your premises at the
 4 center?
 5 A. I have no idea.
 6 Q. Have you ever been sued before, Doctor?
 7 A. Once.
 8 Q. Was it dismissed?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. You didn't go to trial?
 11 A. No, sir.
 12 Q. Are you married now?
 13 A. Yes, sir.
 14 Q. This is the second time?
 15 A. Yes, sir.
 16 Q. How many children do you have?
 17 A. Three.
 18 Q. Where do they live?
 19 A. My oldest son lives in western North
 20 Carolina, Franklin, North Carolina. My next son
 21 lives -- well, I'm not sure where he lives. He and
 22 his wife travel all over southeast Asia. They have no
 23 kids at this point so they just travel. And my
 24 daughter lives in Seattle. She got married this
 25 summer and she's a principal at a grammar school.

Page 165

1 Q. Now, what county and state did you get your
2 divorce in?
3 A. Bexar, Texas.
4 Q. How do you spell Bexar?
5 A. B-E-X-A-R.
6 Q. B-E what?
7 A. X-A-R.
8 Q. Pronounced Bexar?
9 A. Yes, sir.
10 Q. Who filed for the divorce, you or your
11 wife?
12 A. I don't remember. We didn't -- it
13 wasn't -- we didn't contest it. So it was -- it was
14 pretty amicable.
15 Q. These patients who developed meningitis
16 after receiving the steroid injections were not guilty
17 of any fault, were they?
18 A. No, sir.
19 Q. Would you inspect a vial of steroids before
20 you injected them into the patient?
21 A. Not formally, but the way we do it, the
22 x-ray person holds the vial up for me. So I check the
23 vial for the expiration date, confirm it's the steroid
24 that I want, and then I draw it up. So the vial is
25 about 6 to 8 inches from my face. So I see what I'm

Page 166

1 drawing up and then I also see the contents in the
2 syringe. So it's -- while it's not a formal
3 inspection process of the vial, I do clearly see the
4 contents of the vial.
5 Q. Now, did you take a vacation starting
6 about -- well, actually starting October 4th, 2012?
7 A. I think I went to Chicago.
8 Q. On October 4th?
9 A. I don't remember exactly.
10 Q. Why did you go to Chicago?
11 A. Just to get out of town for a little bit.
12 It had just been a very intense time period. I wasn't
13 being utilized for any patient care so I just went up
14 for the weekend.
15 Q. How long were you gone?
16 A. I think just the weekend.
17 Q. A weekend.
18 A. The center wasn't open on the weekend so it
19 wasn't really --
20 Q. Did you take a vacation in October of 2012
21 other than this weekend off?
22 A. I don't -- I don't remember.
23 Q. But you wanted to get out of town?
24 A. Yes, sir.
25 Q. Did you call any patients while you were up

Page 167

1 there in Chicago?
2 A. I don't remember. If I got a message from
3 Debra or someone that a patient had a question, I
4 could have called them, but I just don't -- I don't
5 remember.
6 Q. Are your parents alive?
7 A. Yes, sir.
8 Q. Both of them are?
9 A. Yes, sir.
10 Q. Do you feel that you have an addiction gene
11 of any type?
12 A. I don't know. I think there's evidence
13 that there's a genetic component to addiction.
14 Q. You've probably thought about this; right?
15 A. Yeah.
16 Q. Do you think you do or not?
17 A. Well, the data suggests that that's --
18 that's possible. So I think if that's true, then -- I
19 don't think it's proven, but I think there's strong
20 evidence that there is that component. It's the --
21 like many things, it's -- the outcome is a mix of
22 genetics and environment.
23 Q. What does your current wife do?
24 A. Well, my current wife is a husband, and
25 he's a real estate agent.

Page 168

1 Q. I'm sorry.
2 A. That's okay.
3 Q. I beg your pardon.
4 A real estate agent?
5 A. Yes, sir.
6 Q. Okay.
7 A. 22 years together. We got married in the
8 fall of 2013.
9 MR. KINNARD: Okay, Doctor. What
10 we're going to do is take just a quick
11 break. You can take as long as you want.
12 I'm not sure how long we'll be, but we're
13 going to talk amongst ourselves --
14 THE WITNESS: All right.
15 MR. KINNARD: -- and resume.
16 I don't think it'll be much longer.
17 THE WITNESS: Okay.
18 MR. KINNARD: Thank you.
19 VIDEOGRAPHER: We're off the record
20 and the time is 2:47 p.m.
21 (A recess was taken.)
22 VIDEOGRAPHER: Back on the record and
23 the time 3:05 p.m.
24 EXAMINATION
25 BY MR. CLAYTON:

Page 169

Page 171

1 Q. Dr. Culclasure, Daniel Clayton. I have a
2 few questions for you.

3 A. Okay.

4 Q. You mentioned previously that you have used
5 compounding pharmacies in the past. You recall that
6 testimony?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. What sort of products have you ordered from
9 those compounding products -- compounding pharmacies?

10 A. Combinations of medications used to fill
11 implanted pain pumps, those generally pump medication
12 into the spinal canal, the spinal fluid sac, and
13 usually those involve two and sometimes three
14 different medications all combined into that, you
15 know, one refill when we do it. And then -- so that's
16 multiple drugs combined. And then a couple --
17 sometimes we would order alcohol, absolute alcohol
18 when I had a neurolytic procedure to perform.

19 Q. Explain that for me, please. What do you
20 mean a neurolytic procedure?

21 A. Alcohol destroys nerves. So there's some
22 nerves that are amenable to destruction. Some nerves
23 can't be destroyed because they provide motor function
24 to an arm or a leg. But some nerves only provide
25 sensory function, and those nerves can be destroyed

1 Midtown. I don't remember the name of the pharmacy.
2 I mean, I can drive you there, but I don't remember
3 the name.

4 Q. Near the old Baptist --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- Health and Wellness Pharmacy?

7 A. I think it is that, yes.

8 Q. Mark Binkley?

9 A. I don't know the name of the pharmacist.

10 Q. Did the -- in order to obtain the absolute
11 alcohol, was a patient-specific prescription required?

12 A. I believe it was, yes.

13 Q. And did you sign that prescription?

14 A. I don't have a rec -- specific
15 recollection, but if that was what was required, then
16 we probably -- I probably signed it.

17 Q. In other words, the absolute alcohol had to
18 be used on a patient that you were obtaining it for
19 through the Health and Wellness Pharmacy; correct?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. With regard to the medications used to fill
22 the implanted pain pumps, have you done that at
23 STOPNC?

24 A. No, that's done in an office setting, not
25 in a facility.

Page 170

Page 172

1 without causing a problem for the patient.

2 An example would be something called a
3 celiac plexus, and it's a collection of nerves that
4 supply sensation to the part of the abdomen. And so
5 if someone has pancreatic cancer, I can do an
6 injection with the absolute alcohol and destroy that
7 collection of nerves and give them some pain relief.

8 Q. So had you done that type of procedure
9 using the absolute alcohol at STOPNC?

10 A. Yes, I believe so. Yes. Because we had to
11 order it -- I don't think I did it in the operating
12 room at St. Thomas. I think it was at STOPNC.

13 Q. On how many different patients?

14 A. Probably two or three. It's not a common
15 procedure.

16 Q. So how many times have you done that at
17 STOPNC using the absolute alcohol?

18 A. Two or three probably. Not a lot.

19 Q. When was the last time you did that
20 procedure?

21 A. Gee, probably at least two, three years
22 ago.

23 Q. And where did you get the absolute alcohol
24 from?

25 A. There's a pharmacy near Saint Thomas

1 Q. So would that be done at the Howell Allen
2 imaging clinic where you go on Wednesdays?

3 A. No. It would generally be done in the
4 office on the 8th floor below STOPNC.

5 Q. Did -- were any ESIs ever performed on the
6 8th floor?

7 A. No.

8 Q. They would not be allowed to be performed
9 on the 8th floor; correct?

10 A. Well, they could be.

11 Q. Do you know if any physicians performed
12 ESIs on the 8th floor?

13 A. Not that I'm -- none that I'm aware of.

14 Q. Okay. So how often would you need
15 medications used to fill implanted pain pumps at
16 the -- is it the Howell Allen Clinic on the 8th floor?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. There could have been -- oh, gosh. It
20 would depend on when. But because at times we might
21 have had a hundred -- a hundred pump patients. So
22 there could have been six to ten to 15 pump refills on
23 a given week. It just depends on when they're due to
24 run out or if we -- if -- because of side effects or
25 lack of efficacy, we would have to remix the --

Page 173

1 rebalance the drugs that we ordered.

2 Q. Would each patient be different or would it
3 be something that you could use the same on any
4 patient?

5 A. Generally -- generally different. It might
6 be the same medication but in different concentrations
7 because a patient who had been on that a long time
8 would have a higher tolerance and would need a higher
9 dose. Someone who had not been on it very long would
10 have less tolerance and would be on a lower dose.

11 Q. And when was the last time that you have
12 used medications to fill implanted pain pumps?

13 A. Oh, gosh, probably a year and a half or two
14 years ago. We just referred all the pain pumps out to
15 other providers in Nashville. It was just -- it was
16 hard for me to provide the supervision for those
17 patients with my other duties. It's sort of a lot to
18 keep up with. We had trouble keeping a nurse
19 practitioner who was trained. And so some practices
20 have four or five nurse practitioners because they're
21 bigger and they -- and so if one nurse practitioner
22 takes another job, then there's still others who can
23 help do the pump refills. But if there's just one and
24 that person leaves, then I have no one else to do
25 that, so it would be hard for me to do that and take

Page 174

1 care of STOPNC.

2 Q. Did -- or when did you start referring
3 those patients out?

4 A. I don't remember exactly. One and a half
5 to two years ago would be my best guess.

6 Q. Would it have been after this catastrophe
7 happened at STOPNC?

8 A. I don't -- I don't remember the sequence of
9 events.

10 Q. Where would you obtain the medications used
11 to fill the implanted pain pumps?

12 A. That varied. And sometimes it depended on
13 the insurance company. I think Blue Cross/Blue Shield
14 of Tennessee designated a specific pharmacy --
15 compounding pharmacy in Tennessee. Other patients we
16 would use a different -- a different place. I don't
17 remember all the different ones that we used over
18 time.

19 Q. Tell me the names of any of them that you
20 used over time?

21 A. I couldn't. I don't know.

22 Q. Any of them out of state?

23 A. I don't -- I just don't know. I didn't do
24 the actual ordering. The nurse practitioner did. So
25 I don't know the -- I just don't know the name of the

Page 175

1 company.

2 Q. Who was the nurse practitioner?

3 A. There were several. Keri Weber, Allison --
4 I'll think of her last name in a minute, but there
5 were three or four that -- that did that for me.

6 Q. Did they work at the Howell Allen Clinic
7 there on the 8th floor?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Do they still work at the Howell Allen
10 Clinic?

11 A. No.

12 Q. None of the four do?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. Do you have something that you can look at
15 to help refresh your memory of the names of those four
16 people?

17 A. Nothing handy.

18 Q. But back at the office you think you have
19 it?

20 A. I wouldn't have a list of them.

21 Q. For the medications used to fill the
22 implanted pain pumps, were those patient-specific
23 prescriptions?

24 A. I think they were ordered on a different
25 DEA form, and I don't know that they -- on that form

Page 176

1 it includes any information about the patient. I
2 think it's just numbering, the drugs and
3 concentrations. So it's not actually like a
4 prescription that we normally would give to a patient
5 to take to a pharmacy.

6 Q. Was the prescription for the absolute
7 alcohol something that you would give to the patient
8 to take to the pharmacy?

9 A. No. We would probably -- probably have
10 faxed it to the pharmacy or somebody would -- I would
11 have had the secretary drop it by if they couldn't
12 take it by fax. So the patient didn't pick up that
13 drug. They -- we either then picked it up or they
14 delivered it. I don't remember.

15 Q. For the medications used to fill the
16 implanted pain pumps, then, you're saying there may
17 have been some form that was signed that would not be
18 patient specific?

19 A. I think that's correct. I haven't seen
20 that form in a while, so I'd have look at it to
21 refresh my memory.

22 Q. Would you even sign any of those forms,
23 because nurse practitioners are allowed to sign them,
24 aren't they?

25 A. I did at one time, but -- earlier in my

Page 177

1 career when I was ordering them myself, I did fill
2 that form out, but the nurses -- the nurse
3 practitioners did do most of that afterwards, yes.

4 Q. When you said earlier in your career, would
5 that have been at the Howell Allen Clinic or somewhere
6 else?

7 A. No, somewhere else. Primarily when I was
8 in North Carolina I know I did it myself then. And at
9 times if somebody was on -- if the nurse practitioner
10 was on vacation, if someone needed to be refilled
11 early, then I would -- then I would have to order it.

12 Q. So are you saying while you have been
13 practicing medicine in Tennessee that you have written
14 orders for medications used to fill implanted pain
15 pumps that have been sent to compounding pharmacies
16 that were not patient-specific prescriptions?

17 A. I think that's the case. I'd have to see
18 the form. It's been a long time since I filled a form
19 out myself.

20 Q. I'm talking about in Tennessee whether or
21 not you have done that.

22 A. Oh, I understand your question. I'm saying
23 I just don't remember.

24 Q. Was there any prescription written for the
25 compounding products that were received from NECC?

Page 179

1 Q. Well, what is it that you recall she gave
2 to you?

3 A. I've seen some of the things -- some of the
4 materials from NECC since that time. So I don't
5 really -- it's a little bit hard to say what I saw at
6 the time. I -- earlier today, I said I thought
7 what -- one thing that I saw was a two -- a glossy
8 two-sided sheet of paper with information on the
9 processes that they use, the standards that they met.
10 It could have also been a four-page foldout. I just
11 don't remember.

12 Q. Your ex-wife -- what was your ex-wife's
13 name?

14 A. Maiden name?

15 Q. Her name, please.

16 A. Elizabeth Penny, P-E-N-N-Y.

17 Q. And where does she currently live?

18 A. Chicago.

19 Q. And when were the two of you divorced?

20 A. Probably 1987.

21 Q. And are your children a result of the
22 marriage from her?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You were subpoenaed to give testimony to
25 the grand jury in Boston?

Page 178

1 A. Not that I'm aware of, no.

2 Q. You saw earlier that prescription order
3 that had your name printed or written on it, but you
4 said that was not your signature or you had not -- you
5 did not write your name on that.

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. Is that not considered under Tennessee law
8 a prescription order?

9 A. I don't know.

10 MR. GIDEON: Objection.

11 Q. (By Mr. Clayton) You don't know?

12 A. I don't know if that's considered a
13 prescription or not, no.

14 Q. And was that the only type of order that
15 was used to obtain the products from NECC?

16 A. I don't know.

17 Q. Have you ever allowed anyone to sign your
18 name to a prescription for a medication?

19 A. No.

20 Q. That would not be allowed, would it?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Did you review all of the brochures that
23 Debra Schamberg gave you regarding NECC?

24 A. If she gave them to me, I -- I would have
25 looked at them, yes.

Page 180

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Did you go?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Did you ever invoke the Fifth Amendment?

5 A. Never.

6 Q. With regard to the fentanyl abuse, how did
7 you account for the missing fentanyl that you stole?

8 A. Usually by saying that I gave two vials --
9 two vials instead of one. So the patient always got
10 an adequate amount. I just -- I just wrote on the
11 record that I gave, you know, more as if the patient
12 had a high tolerance. So the record would balance
13 out, but...

14 Q. So you would falsify patient records in
15 order for you to cover up your fentanyl use?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And did you do that during both occasions
18 whenever you were abusing the fentanyl?

19 A. I don't remember -- I don't remember in
20 Johnson City whether I had access to the records there
21 or not. So I don't know, but definitely the first
22 time in the Army, yes.

23 Q. Well, if you didn't have access to the
24 records in Johnson City, then how did you account for
25 the missing fentanyl there?

Page 181

Page 183

1 A. Well, there was waste. And so if the nurse
 2 set the syringe down, I could pick up the syringe.
 3 Q. Any other way?
 4 A. No, sir, not that I remember.
 5 Q. You had sent an e-mail asking How -- asking
 6 if Howell Allen was going to pursue a claim on your
 7 behalf for lost wages. Do you remember sending that
 8 e-mail?
 9 A. Vaguely, yes.
 10 Q. Okay. Tell me the reasons why you sent
 11 that e-mail.
 12 A. I think someone told me that that was --
 13 that that was possible. And so I just asked if that
 14 was -- if that was part of the -- if that was the
 15 plan.
 16 Q. Who told you?
 17 A. I don't remember.
 18 Q. What were you told when you sent that
 19 e-mail?
 20 A. Probably there were -- it was possible to
 21 collect damages because of lost income.
 22 Q. I'm sorry, I did not hear what you --
 23 A. It was possible -- someone -- I guess
 24 someone told me it was possible to collect damages
 25 because of lost income and so I guess I was just

1 other than the 60 percent that you would receive from
 2 Howell Allen for performing the ESIs?
 3 A. No.
 4 Q. So there was no separate stipend from
 5 anybody to be the medical director?
 6 A. Correct.
 7 Q. Do you personally know any compounding
 8 pharmacists who live in the Nashville area?
 9 A. Yes. First name, though. I don't
 10 remember -- his name is John.
 11 Q. That's a -- you don't know his last name?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. Do you know the name of the company he
 14 works for?
 15 A. No.
 16 Q. How long have you known him?
 17 A. Three or four years.
 18 Q. You were aware back in 2011 and 2012 that
 19 there were compounding pharmacies in Tennessee;
 20 correct?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. And compounding pharmacists in Tennessee;
 23 correct?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. For the fentanyl -- you're -- for your

Page 182

Page 184

1 inquiring if that was a possibility.
 2 Q. And what was the response that you
 3 received?
 4 A. I don't remember.
 5 Q. Well, you're aware that -- or are you aware
 6 whether or not Howell Allen has filed a claim in the
 7 bankruptcy for its losses?
 8 A. I'll not sure.
 9 Q. Or lost money?
 10 A. I don't know.
 11 Q. Is it --
 12 A. I'm not a partner so I don't attend
 13 business meetings and things like that. So I don't
 14 know what's been filed.
 15 Q. Whenever these other physicians from ASA
 16 would perform the ESIs at STOPNC, if I understand
 17 correctly, Howell Allen would not pay them directly;
 18 is that correct?
 19 A. Correct. They did their own billing.
 20 Q. Would you receive any sort of compensation
 21 for ESIs that were performed by the ASA folks at
 22 STOPNC?
 23 A. No.
 24 Q. Did you receive any type of separate
 25 compensation for being the medical director of STOPNC

1 fentanyl use, was there ever any -- or were there ever
 2 any criminal charges that were brought against you?
 3 A. No.
 4 Q. Were you ever threatened with any criminal
 5 charges?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. Did you go straight from being a
 8 non-illegal drug user to starting to use fentanyl?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. Had you abused any other drugs of any kind,
 11 whether they were prescription or illegal drugs, prior
 12 to using fentanyl?
 13 A. I smoked some marijuana in college.
 14 Q. Were any of the -- were you familiar with
 15 any of the other physicians' preference, whether they
 16 preferred using Depo-Medrol versus MPA over at STOPNC?
 17 A. A preference between Depo-Medrol over MPA?
 18 Q. Yes.
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Or Depo-Medrol over a compounded
 21 pharmaceutical like the one that NECC provided.
 22 A. No.
 23 MR. CLAYTON: Short break.
 24 VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the end of
 25 Tape No. 3. We're off the record and the

Page 185

1 time is 3:25 p.m. I'm sorry. That was
2 Tape No. 4.

3 (A recess was taken.)

4 VIDEOGRAPHER: Here begins Tape No. 5
5 in the deposition of John Culclasure, M.D.
6 We're back on the record and the time is
7 3:31 p.m.

8 Q. (By Mr. Clayton) Dr. Culclasure, have you
9 ever attended any CMEs regarding being a medical
10 director?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Have you ever had any training to be a
13 medical director?

14 A. No.

15 Q. So while you were in your treatment program
16 in Nashville, the folks who ultimately formed the
17 Howell Allen Clinic, one of the people there came to
18 you and asked you to be a medical director --

19 MR. GIDEON: Objection.

20 Q. (By Mr. Clayton) -- of the pain clinic?

21 A. He called me and then asked me to come --
22 if I could come interview. So I -- yes. So that's
23 how that happened.

24 Q. Is it your position as the medical director
25 of STOPNC that STOPNC obtained the MPA from New

Page 187

1 MR. REHNQUIST: Go over a little bit,
2 yes.

3 MR. GIDEON: Besides Jim who always
4 has some more questions. Anybody else?
5 Okay.

6 EXAMINATION

7 BY MR. REHNQUIST:

8 Q. Good afternoon, Dr. Culclasure. My name is
9 Jim Rehnquist. I'm a lawyer for a company in this
10 case called UniFirst. I'm just going to ask you a few
11 followup questions.

12 As I recall, your first job after your
13 relapse was with neurological associates?

14 A. Neurosurgical Associates.

15 Q. I'm sorry. Neurosurgical Associates. And
16 you fully informed them of your substance abuse
17 issues?

18 A. Yes. That was -- when the treatment center
19 let me go interview, that was a requirement. They
20 said the first thing I had to do is tell them I was in
21 treatment and discuss that with them.

22 Q. And then you informed them of both the
23 original incident and then your subsequent relapse?

24 A. I don't remember that -- exactly what we
25 discussed in that. That was in 1999.

Page 186

1 England Compounding Company without ever writing a
2 prescription?

3 A. Would you repeat that.

4 Q. Is it your position as the medical director
5 of STOPNC that STOPNC obtained the MPA from New
6 England Compounding Center without ever writing a
7 prescription?

8 A. I'm not sure if that form is considered a
9 prescription. So if it's considered a prescription,
10 then we submitted a prescription. If it's not a
11 prescription, then we didn't. I can't answer the
12 question any better than that.

13 Q. And if it's considered a prescription, then
14 it's a prescription that's being submitted without
15 your signature on it; right?

16 A. Yes, in that example that you showed me.

17 Q. And how does that comply with Tennessee
18 law, do you know?

19 A. I don't know.

20 MR. CLAYTON: That's all I have.
21 Thank you.

22 MR. GIDEON: Next. That's two for
23 the PSC. Is there anybody else who is not
24 with the PSC that wants to ask any
25 questions?

Page 188

1 Q. Well, what do you remember of what you
2 informed them about your substance abuse issues?

3 A. I told them -- I don't remember clearly. I
4 probably told them -- well, I told them I was in
5 treatment at that time, that it was -- it was -- I
6 abused opioids. And the main thing I remember from
7 the meeting was when -- because I was really nervous
8 about having to tell them that because I needed to get
9 a job after I got out.

10 And so I said, "So I'm an addict and I'm in
11 treatment," and they all started laughing and one of
12 them said, well, we're all addicts. And so they --
13 they just made me feel -- I don't know what he meant
14 by that exactly because they're not all addicts, but
15 it may have been just him trying to make me feel
16 better or at least have their own unique issues or
17 something. So that's the thing I remember mostly from
18 that interview, was that they all started laughing and
19 I was not quite sure what they were laughing about at
20 first.

21 Q. Did you tell them the substance you abused
22 was fentanyl?

23 A. Probably.

24 Q. I mean, fentanyl is used with the
25 administration of anesthesiology; correct?

Page 189

Page 191

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. And you think you probably told them that
3 or you're positive?

4 A. Well, I don't remember the details of the
5 discussion. It's likely that I did since that was my
6 drug of choice. If I told you today that I remembered
7 specifically saying that, that would not be true
8 because I don't.

9 Q. And did they put any -- did the people at
10 Neurosurgical Associates put any sort of conditions or
11 restrictions on your work because of the substance
12 abuse issues?

13 A. I don't. The Tennessee Medical Foundation
14 did initially, and I don't remember the -- exactly --
15 the exact number of hours, but they -- they make us
16 restrict our work hours for three months or some
17 period of time after treatment, but I think that was
18 from the TMF, not from the practice.

19 Q. Did the practice put any conditions or
20 restrictions on your work with them as you recall
21 because of your past?

22 A. I don't remember any specific restrictions.

23 Q. Did they require you to continue going to
24 AA and NA meetings?

25 A. Well, the TMF did and the board, the

1 they were -- I don't remember however many there were
2 with Howell Allen at the time, eight or nine. And so
3 the three guys that I had worked with and I joined
4 Howell Allen.

5 Q. And the -- I'm sorry.

6 A. So there were eight or nine guys I had not
7 worked with before.

8 Q. And what steps did you take to fully inform
9 the eight or nine members of Howell Allen that you
10 hadn't worked with before about your substance abuse
11 issues?

12 A. I don't remember. I've always been pretty
13 open about it. It's not anything that's hidden. The
14 board knows. I don't remember any specific document
15 that I gave them. But it was not a -- it was not a
16 secret, but I don't remember a formal notification
17 process.

18 Q. Do you remember doing anything to inform
19 these new members or the eight or nine that you hadn't
20 worked with before about your past?

21 A. I don't remember.

22 Q. You were asked questions about the name
23 STOPNC and why the name Neurosurgical is in that name
24 even though there's no neurosurgery being performed
25 there. Remember that question?

Page 190

Page 192

1 Tennessee Medical Board did.

2 Q. And have you done that since you left
3 treatment?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And I believe you testified that you left
6 Neurosurgical Associates when that group sort of split
7 up and you eventually ended up working at STOPNC --
8 I'm sorry, you ended up with the Howell Allen Clinic?

9 A. Yes, it was like a -- an immediate job
10 change. It wasn't a -- it wasn't eventually. It was
11 just a transfer.

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. So my employment date with Howell Allen
14 actually goes back to when I joined Neurosurgical
15 Associates because it was somehow they -- I don't know
16 all the reasons for that, but it was as if I had been
17 with Neuro -- with Howell Allen for the whole time.

18 Q. So when the -- with the name change and the
19 change in that practice, the people you were working
20 with after the name change and the change in the
21 practice were the same people you had been working
22 with before?

23 A. Well, Neurosurgical Associates had six
24 members and three of them joined Howell Allen and they
25 wanted me to come along. So then I joined -- and then

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Were there any -- were there ever any
3 discussions within Howell Allen about the disconnect
4 between the name of STOPNC and the functions that
5 STOPNC was performing?

6 A. Because I'm not a partner, if they
7 discussed that at a business meeting, I wouldn't be
8 aware of it.

9 Q. So you weren't aware -- regardless of
10 whether they discussed it at a business meeting or
11 otherwise, you weren't aware of any such discussions?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. Was there ever any confusion among
14 patients, to your knowledge, about being referred to a
15 facility with the word "neurosurgical" in the title
16 when they weren't getting neurosurgery?

17 A. I never had a patient ask me about that.

18 Q. Did you ever hear about a patient asking
19 anyone at STOPNC that?

20 A. Not that I recall.

21 Q. You testified that your payment terms are
22 that you receive 60 percent of what Howell Allen is
23 able to collect from the procedures that you perform?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. What happens if Howell Allen can't collect

Page 193

1 from a procedure that you performed from an insurer or
2 a third-party payor?

3 A. Then there's just no money collected for
4 that particular procedure.

5 Q. If the money is collected from the patient
6 directly, do you receive the same 60 percent of that
7 if it's collected?

8 A. I would assume so. I've never had that
9 discussion with anybody.

10 Q. Are you aware of any situations where any
11 insurance or other third-party payors have not
12 provided reimbursement to Howell Allen for an ESI
13 procedure that you performed?

14 A. Not specifically. I mean, there are a lot
15 of reasons that -- that can cause a problem. If
16 it's -- if a procedure is approved for a certain date
17 or a range of dates, sometimes it's just one day, some
18 of them are really difficult, and then the patient
19 reschedules and the staff doesn't catch that, then
20 they won't reimburse. So if they're supposed to come
21 in on Tuesday but we had an ice storm and they came in
22 on Friday, then some insurance companies will not
23 reimburse that. So...

24 Q. But you don't recall any issues other than
25 those kind of administrative issues coming up?

Page 194

1 A. That's primarily it. I mean, if they -- if
2 the patient got scheduled and they're with a
3 particular -- and their diagnoses didn't establish
4 medical necessity with their insurance company, then
5 we can do the procedure and not be reimbursed. I
6 mean, if that's -- I generally ask the billing not to
7 balance bill patients if there are errors that
8 occurred because of something that we missed. If I'm
9 aware of it, I don't want the patients billed.

10 Q. Do you remember any ESI patients not being
11 reimbursed for medical necessity reasons?

12 A. Not specifically. I don't get a report
13 from the business office about how many are not being
14 reimbursed because of a problem. That's just not the
15 data that I get.

16 Q. So if there were medical necessity issues
17 that came up, you wouldn't have known about them?

18 A. Probably. I've asked the billing office if
19 there is a problem, you know, to let me know if they
20 need, you know, help with diagnosis codes or anything
21 like that or that I can help with, but I don't know of
22 any -- they don't -- I haven't gotten a call about any
23 specific patients that didn't -- you know, insurance
24 denied payment for.

25 Q. What entity handles the billing for STOPNC?

Page 195

1 A. It's internal to the practice -- or Howell
2 Allen. Excuse me. The Howell Allen billing office, I
3 believe, handles them.

4 Q. A patient who's considering getting an
5 epidural steroid injection presumably like most
6 procedures has other options; correct?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. What are the other options that a patient
9 has in lieu of getting an ESI?

10 A. Time, analgesics, physical therapy. Those
11 would be the main ones.

12 Q. Who do you mean by time?

13 A. Just waiting, see if it gets better.

14 Q. You described the sort of initial consult
15 you -- that you do with the new patients earlier
16 today. And I believe you said, you know, you walk
17 into the room and the patient's got the blue wristband
18 and they're in street clothes and you go over things
19 with them for a few minutes, and then you might leave
20 that room to go and do a procedure, for example.

21 When you walk into the room the first time
22 to meet the new patient, what do you know about that
23 patient as you walk into their room?

24 A. Well, I've already picked up the chart and
25 I look at the chart. So I see some basic demographic

Page 196

1 data like their age, sex. And the nurses have the
2 nursing history filled out so I look at that. I look
3 at allergies, make sure they're not on a blood
4 thinner. It lists their medications. I review those.
5 It lists medical illnesses that they've told the
6 nurses about. It lists their surgical history. So I
7 look through that and also their imaging. The nurses
8 print out their last imaging reports. So I have that
9 available too. So I'm aware of all that when I walk
10 into the room.

11 Q. And when do you become aware of that with
12 respect to the moment that you walk into the room?

13 A. Immediately before because I would be at
14 the -- at the nursing station there's a rack that they
15 put charts in that belong to patients that I have not
16 seen yet. So I pick up the next one, open it up, look
17 at that information that I just described and then I
18 walk into the room.

19 Q. How much time do you spend looking at that
20 information before you walk in the room?

21 A. It could be anywhere -- if they're young
22 and healthy, there's very little there. It could be a
23 couple of minutes. A lot of that is spent on the
24 imaging probably. Because if there's nothing filled
25 out, it's easy to scan. Not allergic to anything, no

1 significant past medication history, no surgeries.

2 If it's an older patient or a patient who
3 has other medical illnesses, then there's more to read
4 so that takes a little bit longer. It's hard to say.
5 I mean, it just depends on how much I have to go over.
6 And then I go into the room and I verify what they've
7 got. "You're not allergic to any medicines; is that
8 correct?"

9 "Yes." Because I just want to make sure
10 that -- you know, that what the nurses have recorded
11 is accurate, so...

12 Q. Now, these new patients, they are already
13 scheduled for both the consult with you and the
14 procedure on the same day; correct?

15 A. Yes. I wouldn't characterize it as a
16 consult. It's not --

17 Q. How would you characterize that, that 10-
18 or 15-minute part of that?

19 A. Well, consult has a specific meaning
20 about -- that it's a separate billable event and, you
21 know, and all that. This is just -- I just -- it's
22 just me reviewing -- it's integral to the procedure.
23 So there's no additional billing or anything. It's
24 just me answering their questions, describing the
25 procedure, counseling on the risks.

1 Q. Okay. And when you counsel them on the
2 risks and verify their information and so forth, do
3 you explain to them the other options they have
4 instead of actually getting an ESI?

5 A. Yes. Well, I may say, "Well, I see from
6 the history that you've already had physical therapy,
7 you're taking some pain medication and this has been
8 bothering you for three months." In that case, there
9 really is not -- the other alternative then is just
10 not to have it, and I always tell people you don't
11 ever have to have this injection.

12 Q. Do you ever recommend to patients that they
13 try other options or try other options for a longer
14 period of time and not have the ESI that day?

15 A. Some -- sometimes. The more common reason
16 I cancel a procedure is if -- if they come back and
17 they're doing well, and I'll go, "Well, your pain's --
18 you're rating your pain as a one or two. I can't make
19 you any better than that probably. Why don't we
20 cancel today's procedure and you just save it until
21 you need it down the road." So that's more common
22 than what you described.

23 Q. What percentage of the time do you
24 recommend to a new patient that they not have an ESI
25 that day?

1 A. It happens but it's not real common. I'm
2 trying to think about what those circumstances --
3 well, sometimes they'll come in and they've just
4 gotten better since the surgeon made the referral and
5 so I'll say, "Well, you know, you might stay -- you
6 might stay good for a long time. There's no reason to
7 do an injection since you're really doing well. Let
8 just see how long this lasts. Maybe you won't need
9 this."

10 Q. Would you say it's less than ten percent of
11 the time?

12 A. Oh, yeah. Oh, yeah. It's certainly less
13 than ten percent.

14 MR. GIDEON: Let him finish his
15 question before you start to answer.

16 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry.

17 Q. (By Mr. Rehnquist) Less than five percent
18 of the time?

19 A. For a new patient? Probably two to three
20 percent as a very rough guess.

21 Q. Do patients ever decide, apart from a
22 recommendation that you made, not to have an ESI that
23 day for any reasons?

24 A. I'm not sure that I understand the question
25 or how I would know if they didn't.

1 Q. I'm sorry. I think we just established
2 that you might recommend a patient of your own
3 volition not to have the ESI that day that's already
4 been scheduled in a rough guess of two to three
5 percent of the time; correct?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And are there patients that ever, even if
8 you don't make that recommendation, decide not to go
9 through with the ESI?

10 A. That would be extremely rare.

11 Q. It's already scheduled; right?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Now, with patients who are receiving a
14 second or a third injection, have you or anyone in
15 your office spoken to them between the first injection
16 and the day they show up for the second injection?

17 A. Generally not unless it's about scheduling.
18 But there -- they're informed by the nurses that if
19 they're doing well they can cancel -- they should just
20 call and cancel it and then reschedule it when they --
21 if and when their pain returns.

22 Q. They're told of that -- they're told that
23 by the nurses when they check out of the -- from the
24 first appointment?

25 A. Yes. Yes.

Page 201

Page 203

1 Q. How often -- I'm sorry -- in your
2 experience, how long does it generally take -- after
3 receiving an ESI of MPA or Depo-Medrol does it take
4 for the patient to know if the first injection has
5 worked?

6 A. I usually tell them that it may take
7 anywhere from a few days to a week to see what it's
8 going to do. I explain to them that it's a slow
9 release preparation and so it may -- you know, not to
10 expect a change in the first day or two, although some
11 people will experience that.

12 Q. You know that Debra Schamberg had her
13 deposition taken in this case?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Did you talk to her about her deposition
16 either before or after it?

17 A. When she came back I asked her how it went,
18 and she said, "I'm sorry, I can't tell you anything
19 about my deposition."

20 Q. Did you talk to her about it before she
21 went?

22 A. Some. Not real specific. I mean, I -- I
23 know she met with someone to do some preparation
24 before the -- before the deposition and she was really
25 pleased. She said it made her feel a lot better, more

1 A. Probably from Debra mentioning his name,
2 but other than that, I don't remember the context.

3 Q. Now, you aren't a pharmacist; correct?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. You don't have any pharmacy expertise?

6 A. None.

7 Q. Debra Schamberg is not a pharmacist and she
8 has no pharmacy expertise?

9 A. That's true.

10 Q. STOPNC has a pharmacy consultant named
11 Michael O'Neil; correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And Mr. O'Neil is retained by STOPNC for
14 the specific purpose of advising STOPNC on pharmacy
15 matters?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. But neither you nor Ms. Schamberg ever
18 reached out to him regarding the initial decision to
19 purchase NECC?

20 MR. GIDEON: Objection, peer-review,
21 68-11-272. You're instructed not answer.

22 MR. REHNQUIST: I think he already
23 answered that question, C.J.

24 MR. GIDEON: Huh?

25 MR. REHNQUIST: I think he already

Page 202

Page 204

1 relaxed.

2 Q. Did you feel the same way after your
3 preparation?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And did you talk to Debra Schamberg about
6 your deposition --

7 A. No.

8 Q. -- in the couple of weeks before it?

9 A. No, other than just, you know, that it was
10 coming up because she's aware of the scheduling, I had
11 to be out today.

12 Q. Did you read the transcript of her
13 deposition?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Do you know who the Saint Thomas Hospital
16 pharmacist is or was?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Does the name Martin Kelvas mean anything
19 to you?

20 A. That does -- Marty, I think. That does
21 sound familiar, Marty Kelvas, I believe.

22 Q. Do you know who he is?

23 A. I wouldn't know him if he walked in here.

24 Q. Do you -- do you have a memory of how the
25 name come up or how you became familiar with the name?

1 answered that question that he never
2 reached out to them.

3 MR. GIDEON: If he did, then he just
4 ignored what I said. Immaterial, isn't it?

5 Q. (By Mr. Rehnquist) Did you have any
6 discussions with Ms. Schamberg about whether you
7 should reach out to Michael O'Neil to ask him about
8 the decision to purchase product from NECC?

9 A. No, not that I remember.

10 Q. Why not?

11 A. Why don't I remember?

12 Q. Why didn't you reach out to him? Why
13 didn't you have discussions on that subject with
14 Ms. Schamberg?

15 A. I've never asked for any pharmacist
16 feedback on us purchasing, ordering medications from
17 any supplier. It's never become -- it's never been an
18 issue. Today it's different, but in -- in 2011 when
19 we decided to place that order, it was not. As I said
20 earlier, the FDA, the Department of Pharmacy in
21 Massachusetts, the Department of Pharmacy here in
22 Tennessee, all of those institutions are in place to
23 protect patients and make sure that the drugs are
24 prepared correctly. It never -- if never crossed our
25 minds that there would be -- that these -- that this

Page 205

1 entity NECC would not be regulated.

2 Q. Doctor, do you still have Exhibit 135 in
3 your stack there?

4 A. I do.

5 Q. And you were asked about this document and
6 I believe you said that you -- that's not your
7 signature?

8 A. Correct, that's not my signature.

9 Q. Do you recall seeing this document or
10 documents like this document prior to September of
11 2012?

12 A. I don't recall one way or the other. I was
13 not involved in the ordering so I -- I wouldn't have
14 seen it unless it just happened to be left out on the
15 desk and I just glanced at it or something, but I
16 don't remember -- I never filled one out. I don't
17 remember -- I never remember signing one.

18 Q. Is it -- I believe your testimony was that
19 you believe you heard about the MPA supply issues from
20 either Cindy -- Cindy McLendon or Sandy Littleton?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Is it possible you might have first heard
23 about those issues from Debra Schamberg?

24 A. It's possible, but to the best of my
25 recollection, it seems like I was at work, walking by

Page 207

1 Q. What other -- what other steroid options
2 would you have considered or what other -- I'm sorry?

3 A. Triamcinolone, betamethasone.

4 Q. So if the supply of MPA had literally run
5 out or it appeared to be on the verge of running out,
6 you could have ordered an alternative steroid?

7 A. Yes, or we had some on hand because some of
8 the other anesthesiologists who work there used other
9 steroids.

10 Q. But your preferred choice was to find a
11 source of MPA?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And approximately how much time elapsed
14 between the time that you first heard about the
15 shortage and the time that STOPNC began ordering from
16 NECC?

17 A. I don't know.

18 Q. Less than a week?

19 A. No. I think it would be longer than that
20 because it happened -- I think that they informed me
21 of shortages or supply problems at least twice or
22 maybe three times. So I think it was over they would
23 tell me we're about out and we would get a shipment
24 in. So it happened several times, so it wasn't -- it
25 wasn't a week after the very first time we encountered

Page 206

1 the desk where they sit, and I think one of them told
2 me -- that was when they would catch me because it was
3 very informal and they just -- I think at that point
4 they said -- because they're the ones who were
5 ordering, so they knew the status of the orders. So I
6 think it probably came from them rather than from
7 Debra, but if could have. I mean, it could have come
8 from Debra. I just don't remember.

9 Q. And I think you testified that the context
10 in which you were facing this, I think, you know,
11 one-day or two-day or a couple of days' supply, and
12 that was it, you said that wasn't a crisis; correct?

13 A. I think I did use that term. It wasn't
14 something that -- just being short was a concern, but
15 it wasn't at that point a crisis.

16 Q. Well, if -- if -- if you had run out of MPA
17 in two days, that would have been a crisis, wouldn't
18 it have been?

19 A. Well, I would substitute a different
20 steroid, but that was the one I started using in
21 training. That's one that I prefer because of its
22 long acting nature. So I would rather use that and
23 that's just what I'm used to using, but, I mean, I
24 could -- we could over the short term make altered --
25 change and use a different one.

Page 208

1 a problem.

2 (Exhibit 141 was marked for
3 identification.)

4 Q. (By Mr. Rehnquist) Dr. Culclasure, I'm
5 handing you a document that's marked Exhibit 141.
6 This is STOPNC's response to plaintiff's first set of
7 interrogatories in the case of Reed v. STOPNC. Can
8 you just look at that.

9 A. Sure. The entire thing or part of it?

10 Q. Well, I'm going to focus you on something
11 in a moment.

12 MR. GIDEON: Is there a particular
13 question you want him to look at?

14 MR. REHNQUIST: Yeah.

15 Q. (By Mr. Rehnquist) Can you look at Page
16 16. Can you read the question and answer to No. 8,
17 top of Page 16, please, Doctor.

18 A. Yes. "Describe each and every action St.
19 Thomas" --

20 Q. I'm sorry. You can read it to yourself.

21 A. Oh. Okay.

22 Q. In the third paragraph of the response it
23 states "Ms. Schamberg complied with the acceptable
24 standard of professional practices for drug
25 procurement practices by speaking to Mr. Notarianni

Page 209

1 regarding NECC, consulting with Dr. Culclasure, and
2 reviewing materials provided by NECC regarding the
3 sterility of its compounded processes."

4 Do you see that?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. What acceptable standard of professional
7 practice is being referred to there?

8 A. Well, I don't -- I don't know that there
9 was a -- the standard would -- at that time was to
10 order the medication from a licensed pharmacy. So
11 there was no -- there were no procedures in place.
12 I've gone to CME, I mean, classes for years. I've
13 never -- or conventions or meetings. I've never heard
14 anyone address anything about ordering from a
15 compounding pharmacy or any other source for that
16 matter.

17 So, again, as I mentioned earlier,
18 that's -- that's why, you know, we thought at the time
19 that the FDA was there, why the Massachusetts Board of
20 Pharmacy was there and why the Tennessee Board of
21 Pharmacy was there. It was their job to ensure that
22 the medication supply was safe.

23 Q. So are you now saying that there was no
24 acceptable standard of professional practice for drug
25 procurement at that time?

Page 211

1 Q. Did you at any point ask Ms. Schamberg to
2 determine whether NECC was accredited by anybody?

3 A. No.

4 Q. This has been previously marked in this
5 case as Exhibit 31. It's STOPNC -- begins at
6 STOPNC_513, but it doesn't appear to be consecutive
7 thread. It's Exhibit 31 to Schamberg.

8 Can you just look through Exhibit 31,
9 Doctor, and tell me if these are -- or appear to be
10 the materials that you received from Ms. Schamberg
11 regarding NECC.

12 A. It's hard for me to say that. I
13 remember -- I don't remember this many different
14 pages. So I just -- I don't remember the details of
15 the documents that I saw. But I don't think it was
16 this many individual documents.

17 Q. Did you read the materials that
18 Ms. Schamberg showed you?

19 A. The one that she showed me, yes.

20 Q. How long did you take reading it?

21 A. Gosh, I think it was -- as I said, it was
22 as few as two pages and maybe as many as four. So it
23 didn't take long to look at it. They were bullet
24 pointed items. It wasn't like there was paragraphs to
25 read.

Page 210

1 A. Well, the standard was to order the drug
2 from a licensed pharmacy.

3 Q. And where is that standard -- where was
4 that standard contained?

5 A. From my experience.

6 Q. It wasn't written down anywhere?

7 A. Not that I'm aware of.

8 Q. Is STOPNC accredited?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And by what body?

11 A. Joint Commission.

12 Q. And what is the significance to STOPNC of
13 being accredited?

14 A. I'm not sure exactly -- I mean, probably --
15 well, in order to have contracts with insurance
16 companies, I imagine that we have to show that we're
17 certified by one -- I think there's another certifying
18 body that also specifically credentials surgery
19 centers. So I don't remember the name of that one,
20 but that body and the Joint Commission both
21 credentialed ASCs.

22 Q. And being accredited as a healthcare
23 provider means that you are in compliance with the
24 accreditation body's standards?

25 A. Yes.

Page 212

1 Q. Can you look at document that has the Bates
2 stamp 522. It's probably about five, six pages in.

3 A. The date stamp five -- STOPNC_0522? Okay.

4 Q. Yeah. On Bates stamp Page 522, do you see
5 the heading GE dispensing?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And it said "Product is dispensed by
8 patient-specific prescriptions only. There must be a
9 specific practitioner/patient/pharmacist relationship
10 to dispense to an individual patient or facility."

11 Do you see that?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Do you recall seeing that language in the
14 materials that Ms. Schamberg showed you?

15 A. No.

16 Q. If you had seen that language in the
17 materials Ms. Schamberg showed you, would you have
18 done some followup?

19 A. If -- I don't know. I don't know.

20 Q. I mean, ultimately, you didn't write
21 prescriptions for individual patients for the MPA that
22 was ordered from NECC, did you?

23 A. Correct.

24 Q. Dr. Culclasure, you had previous experience
25 with compounding pharmacies before you bought MPA from

Page 213

1 NECC?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And were you aware of any of the published
4 literature about risks of using compounded drugs at
5 that time prior to ordering from NECC?

6 A. No.

7 Q. I'm showing you what's marked as Schamberg
8 32. It's a May 31st, 2007 FDA consumer health
9 information publication. Do you see that?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And do you see at the top of the middle
12 column on the first page, going back to the bottom
13 line on the previous column, but "Consumers need to be
14 aware that compounded drugs are not FDA approved,
15 Anderson says. This means that FDA has not verified
16 their safety and effectiveness."

17 Do you see that?

18 A. I do.

19 Q. And at the time you made the decision to
20 order from NECC, you did not know that compounded
21 drugs are not FDA approved either, did you?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. Would you have ordered those drugs from
24 NECC if you had known they were not FDA approved?

25 A. I don't know.

Page 214

1 Q. If you turn to the second page of this
2 exhibit, under the heading "What can you do," in the
3 third column on the right, the first say bullet point
4 says, "Ask your doctor if an FDA approved drug is
5 available and appropriate for your treatment." Do you
6 see that?

7 A. I do.

8 Q. None of the patients that you treated were
9 aware they were being injected with the drug from a
10 compounding pharmacy, were they?

11 A. That's correct. Also on that document
12 under enforcement on the second page, it says that
13 "The FDA historically hasn't directed enforcement
14 against pharmacies engaged in traditional compounding,
15 says Anderson, rather we focus on establishments as
16 activities raise the kinds of concerns normally
17 associated with the drug manufacturer and whose
18 compounding practices result in significant violations
19 of the new drug adulteration of misbranding provisions
20 of the Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act."

21 So it sounds like even in 2007 the FDA was
22 saying that a pharmacy like NECC would fall under
23 their scrutiny.

24 Q. And why did you chose to add that onto your
25 answer -- why did you choose to add that passage onto

Page 215

1 your answer?

2 A. Because I think it shows that even in
3 2000 -- that as far back as 2007, the FDA in this
4 communication is recognizing the fact -- is telling
5 people that they would be looking for problems with
6 entities like NECC. She also says that the FDA
7 recognizes that states have a central role in
8 regulating pharmacy compounding. That's just a point
9 that I made earlier. They were located in
10 Massachusetts. They were inspected by the
11 Massachusetts Board of Pharmacy and they had to get
12 permission to sell their drugs -- their medications
13 here in Tennessee. So that's why we have these
14 governmental regulating bodies, to ensure the safety
15 of our medication supply.

16 And so those two things right there point
17 out -- point to the fact that, one, the FDA says that
18 NECC was the type of facility they should be looking
19 at, they would be looking at, and that there's also a
20 significant state role. So both the FDA and the
21 states fell down or didn't live up to their
22 responsibilities in this situation.

23 Q. So you think this catastrophe was the
24 government's fault?

25 A. I said the regulating agencies. So they're

Page 216

1 part of the government, yes, sir.

2 Q. And you think -- you think it was their
3 fault this catastrophe happened?

4 A. Well, I think that it could have -- it may
5 have been preventable had they done their job with the
6 checking on NECC.

7 Q. Did STOPNC do anything wrong?

8 A. We ordered in good faith from NECC. I
9 don't -- at that time, I was unaware of any particular
10 issues involving compounding pharmacies. I don't
11 think we did anything wrong.

12 Q. You ordered in good faith based on a review
13 of their self-promotional materials?

14 A. We didn't order -- we didn't go and
15 purchase it from the back of a -- the trunk of a car
16 in a dark alley.

17 Q. Do you think you should have done more due
18 diligence with respect to NECC before you made the
19 decision to purchase from them?

20 A. I think we did what was appropriate at the
21 time. In ret -- now with all of this -- all of the
22 information and lots of other compounding pharmacies
23 having products recalled. In fact, big companies,
24 pharmacy companies like Johnson & Johnson have
25 frequent recalls of their medications. So now things

Page 217

1 are different, but at that time, this issue was not on
2 the radar of most practitioners and providers.

3 Q. Prior to 2012, had you ever heard of ESI
4 patients getting fungal meningitis from an injection?

5 A. I think I saw one report. I don't remember
6 when I saw that. I don't remember how the -- how the
7 contamination occurred. I don't remember whether I
8 saw that prior to our event or after.

9 Q. This has been marked as Schamberg 35.

10 A. Okay.

11 Q. I'm showing you Schamberg 35, which is a --
12 the CDC morbidity and mortality weekly report for
13 December 13th, 2002. Do you see that?

14 A. I do.

15 Q. Is this the report that you were referring
16 to?

17 A. I don't know.

18 Q. If you look at the first paragraph, it
19 references two cases of meningitis in North Carolina.
20 Do you see that?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And do you see that this refers to five
23 cases of fungal infection associated with contaminated
24 drugs prepared at the compounding pharmacy?

25 A. Yes.

Page 218

1 Q. And you think you might have seen this at
2 some point, but you don't recall whether it was before
3 or after our situation?

4 A. I probably would not have seen the MMWR. I
5 don't get copies of that. I don't subscribe to it. I
6 might have -- might have seen this referred to in --
7 online or something after -- after the outbreak
8 occurred with us.

9 Q. Do you think you might have seen it before
10 the outbreak occurred?

11 A. I've never gotten copies of MMWR. I never
12 got that prior to the outbreak.

13 (Exhibit 142 was marked for
14 identification.)

15 Q. (By Mr. Rehnquist) This is Exhibit 62,
16 Dr. Culclasure -- I'm sorry. No. It is --

17 MR. GIDEON: 142.

18 MR. REHNQUIST: 141?

19 MR. GIDEON: 142 is what the number
20 is that you put on there.

21 MR. REHNQUIST: Yeah, 142.

22 Q. (By Mr. Rehnquist) Do you recognize
23 Exhibit 142?

24 MR. GIDEON: STOPNC_352.

25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

Page 219

1 MR. REHNQUIST: I'm sorry.

2 Q. (By Mr. Rehnquist) And what is this? This
3 is an e-mail exchange that you're on?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And this is after the outbreak?

6 A. Yes, it appears to be.

7 Q. Who is Damon Dozier?

8 A. A pain management physician in Clarksville,
9 Tennessee.

10 Q. And do you recall why you were
11 communicating with him on this subject?

12 A. I got a lot of e-mails about that -- about
13 the issue of midlevel providers doing spine injections
14 because for several years I was the president of the
15 Tennessee Society of Interventional Pain Physicians so
16 a lot of people would contact me if they had issues or
17 they wanted me to be aware of something.

18 Q. Lax is the Laxmaiah Manchikanti whose name
19 came up earlier.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And he's a pretty big deal in this field?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. You say in the e-mail to Mr. Dozier, Dr.
24 Dozier in No. 2, referring to what Lax said, you said
25 that 60 percent of ESIs are unnecessary. Do you see

Page 220

1 that?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And then you add parenthetically, "That is
4 okay for discussion among us because ESIs are abused,
5 but I think not appropriate for discussion with the
6 general public especially at this time."

7 You see that?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. In what ways do you believe ESIs are
10 abused?

11 A. A lot of providers will -- they choose
12 patients who are inappropriate for ESIs. They
13 always -- they require the patients to have three ESIs
14 no matter whether they're doing better or not. I've
15 seen images from other providers where the contrast is
16 not in the epidural space. So there are a lot of
17 poorly trained or untrained people or -- I don't know
18 a lot, but there are a number who can -- they can do
19 these injections in their office, there's no
20 peer-review, there's no quality improvement process
21 that's in place.

22 And so it was a way for them to, you know,
23 submit charges to insurance companies and get
24 reimbursed for these procedures when they're not being
25 applied appropriately or correctly. And the -- I

Page 221

1 said the discussion is good -- it's okay for
 2 discussion among us at this time, but not the general
 3 public because it was in the midst of the -- or right
 4 after the meningitis outbreak and I just didn't think
 5 it was appropriate to -- it was a different issue
 6 about what people were doing and the issue of
 7 contaminated medicine.

8 Q. What is the -- what were STOPNC's
 9 procedures about the number of injections that -- the
 10 number of ESI injections that a patient could receive
 11 and the time frame within which a patient could
 12 receive those injections?

13 A. Generally -- generally we tried to not
 14 space them any closer than two weeks. If somebody was
 15 going out of town and they said, "I'd like to get my
 16 second one in ten days," then we would probably do
 17 that. And then generally a maximum of three in a
 18 series. Three within a six-month period is my rule of
 19 thumb.

20 Q. And was there -- was there any kind of a
 21 spacing requirement between the second -- the second
 22 and third? Was it the same?

23 A. Same, ten to 14 days.

24 MR. REHNQUIST: I have no further
 25 questions. Thank you, Doctor.

Page 222

1 THE WITNESS: You're welcome.

2 MR. GIDEON: Anyone else?

3 MR. CLAYTON: I have a couple
 4 followup.

5 FURTHER EXAMINATION

6 BY MR. CLAYTON:

7 Q. Dr. Culclasure, you mentioned a few times
 8 during your testimony about the Tennessee Department
 9 of Health, the Massachusetts Board of Pharmacy and the
 10 FDA, that you believe that they are somehow at fault
 11 for this catastrophe; is that right?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And explain to me how you think they are at
 14 fault.

15 A. They are the agencies that should have been
 16 regulating NECC.

17 Q. So back in 2011 and 2012 were you of the
 18 mindset that you thought that they would be the
 19 agencies that were relegating or watching over a
 20 company like NECC?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. So when did you contact the Massachusetts
 23 Board of Pharmacy to find out whether or not they had
 24 any investigations going on regarding NECC?

25 A. I did not contact them because we assumed

Page 223

1 that if they were in business, that they were good.
 2 If there was a significant problem, I assumed that the
 3 Massachusetts Board of Pharmacy or the FDA would have
 4 prevented them from selling their medications or that
 5 the Tennessee Board of Pharmacy would have stopped
 6 them from shipping medications to Tennessee.

7 Q. And so you mentioned the FDA. When did you
 8 contact the FDA or do any search on the FDA's website
 9 prior to purchasing from NECC to see what sort of
 10 investigations or what sort of warnings they had?

11 A. I didn't because as long as they were doing
 12 business, I assumed that they had clearance from the
 13 FDA.

14 Q. So your assumption -- you're assuming that
 15 as long as they're doing business, then they must okay
 16 with the Massachusetts Board of Health and the FDA and
 17 the Tennessee Board of Pharmacy?

18 A. Absolutely.

19 Q. In making that assumption, do you believe
 20 that that is consistent with the policies and
 21 procedures of STOPNC with regard to providing optimal
 22 care --

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. -- for its patients?

25 A. Yes.

Page 224

1 Q. And providing safe care for its patients?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What are you-all doing now at STOPNC to
 4 make sure that companies or compounding pharmacies
 5 like NECC are okay to deal with?

6 A. We're not ordering from any compounding
 7 pharmacies at this time.

8 Q. Have you ordered from any compounding
 9 pharmacies at all after this catastrophe?

10 A. I don't think so.

11 Q. So what are you doing in order to make sure
 12 that the -- the MPA that you're ordering from a
 13 manufacturer is safe?

14 A. Nothing different. We're ordering from
 15 Pfizer.

16 Q. So the only change that STOPNC has made
 17 after this catastrophe is to stop ordering from
 18 compounding pharmacies; correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. And you would agree with me that prior to
 21 2011 and 2012, there were warnings from the FDA and
 22 warnings in the medical literature regarding the
 23 dangers of ordering from compounding pharmacies, you
 24 would agree with me, wouldn't you?

25 A. There were, yes.

1 Q. And you just didn't know about it?

2 A. I didn't know about it.

3 Q. And you think that's acceptable, being a

4 medical director of a STOP -- of STOPNC to not know

5 about the warnings that were out there available

6 against ordering from compounding pharmacies?

7 A. I've never been instructed, I've never

8 attended a lecture, I've not read materials that said

9 that anything else needed to be done when you're

10 ordering from those pharmacies at that time. It's not

11 possible for me to review every -- everything that is

12 put out on the Internet or -- or studies. I -- I

13 depend on our professional societies to help with that

14 and I depend on the regulatory agencies to ensure that

15 the drug supply is safe.

16 Q. So are you blaming the professional society

17 too along with the government for this catastrophe?

18 A. Well, they don't have any power to do

19 anything about NECC.

20 Q. Well, are you blaming your professional

21 society for not putting out warnings about dealing

22 with compounding pharmacies?

23 A. I don't think the risk was clear then as it

24 is now.

25 Q. Why do you say that?

1 A. Well, there's never been an outbreak to

2 this prior to that.

3 Q. Have there been deaths associated with

4 compounds pharmacies before regarding ESIs?

5 A. Yes, I just -- we just reviewed one

6 document.

7 Q. And you weren't aware of that before --

8 A. No.

9 Q. -- y'all started ordering from NECC?

10 A. I was not.

11 Q. And you never even contacted a compounding

12 pharmacist who was in your back yard prior to ordering

13 from NECC, did you?

14 A. That's correct. I doubt that he would have

15 had any knowledge of NECC.

16 Q. He would have had knowledge about the

17 regulations regarding compounding pharmacies, wouldn't

18 he?

19 A. I don't know.

20 Q. Didn't you see the e-mail that was sent out

21 by the Health and Wellness Pharmacy, Dr. Mark,

22 Binkley, shortly after this catastrophe occurred that

23 went to your office?

24 A. I don't know. You'd have to show it to me.

25 Q. Doesn't it say specifically about

1 patient-specific prescriptions? You don't recall

2 seeing that e-mail?

3 A. I don't know.

4 Q. When did you first learn about the need for

5 patient prescription -- patient-specific prescriptions

6 when you were ordering from a compounding pharmacy?

7 MR. GIDEON: Objection, form.

8 Q. (By Mr. Clayton) You can go ahead, Doctor.

9 A. Are you asking when we were told that by

10 NECC that they needed patient names?

11 Q. No. I want to know when did you learn that

12 a patient-specific prescription was necessary in order

13 to obtain MPA from a compounding pharmacy?

14 MR. GIDEON: Objection.

15 THE WITNESS: I didn't know that

16 until after the outbreak when -- when

17 all -- when more information came out.

18 Q. (By Mr. Clayton) How far after the

19 outbreak did you learn that?

20 A. I don't recall.

21 Q. How did you learn that?

22 A. When it came up in discussions. I don't

23 remember exactly, but it was brought -- it was brought

24 up about the -- the Board of Pharmacy and

25 Massachusetts required patient-specific prescriptions,

1 but that was a requirement on NECC to obtain those.

2 I'm not sure that it applied to me to provide them

3 unless they asked me for those.

4 Q. Doesn't the Board of Pharmacy in Tennessee

5 also require back in 2011 and 2012 patient-specific

6 prescriptions?

7 MR. GIDEON: Objection.

8 THE WITNESS: I'm not sure.

9 Q. (By Mr. Clayton) Have you ever asked

10 anybody about that?

11 A. I don't think so.

12 Q. Would you agree with me that the name

13 Mickey Mouse was used to obtain MPA from NECC?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Have you not seen that list that went to

16 NECC in order to obtain MPA?

17 A. That was a clerical error on the part of a

18 clerical person who copied that log sheet and sent it

19 in.

20 Q. They sent it in to NECC; correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. So the name Mickey Mouse was used in order

23 to obtain MPA from NECC; correct?

24 A. If they didn't understand that that was an

25 error, then I guess it could have, yes.

Q. So that was an error on STOPNC's part for submitting that name along with the names of other patients who may or may not even be receiving the MPA. Is that what you're saying?

A. I said those were placeholder names and should not have been included in what was sent out.

Q. Were patients -- do you feel like patients of STOPNC were looking to STOPNC to make sure that whatever is being injected into their spine was safe?

A. I'm sorry, would you repeat that.

Q. Do you think the patients of STOPNC were looking to STOPNC to make sure that the -- whatever was being injected into their spine was safe?

A. Yes, just like I expected that what NECC was providing me was safe.

MR. CLAYTON: That's all I have. Thank you.

MR. GIDEON: Anybody else? Hearing none, that's it. We will read and sign.

VIDEOGRAPHER: This concludes the deposition. This is the end of Tape No. 5. We're off the record and the time is 4:31 p.m.

(Deposition concluded at 4:31 p.m.)

STATE OF GEORGIA:
COUNTY OF FULTON:

I hereby certify that the foregoing transcript was reported, as stated in the caption, and the questions and answers thereto were reduced to typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages represent a true, complete, and correct transcript of the evidence given upon said hearing, and I further certify that I am not of kin or counsel to the parties in the case; am not in the employ of counsel for any of said parties; nor am I in any way interested in the result of said case.

March 31, 2015

BLANCHE J. DUGAS, CCR-B-2290

DISCLOSURE

Pursuant to Article 10.B of the Rules and Regulations of the Board of Court Reporting of the Judicial Council of Georgia which states: "Each court reporter shall tender a disclosure form at the time of the taking of the deposition stating the arrangements made for the reporting services of the certified court reporter, by the certified court reporter, the court reporter's employer or the referral source for the deposition, with any party to the litigation, counsel to the parties, or other entity. Such form shall be attached to the deposition transcript," I make the following disclosure:

I am a Georgia Certified Court Reporter. I am here as a representative of Discovery Litigation Services, LLC. Discovery Litigation Services, LLC was contacted to provide court reporting services for the deposition. Discovery Litigation Services, LLC will not be taking this deposition under any contract that is prohibited by O.C.G.A. 9-11-28(c).

Discovery Litigation Services, LLC has no contract/agreement to provide reporting services with any party to the case, any counsel in the case, or any reporter or reporting agency from whom a referral might have been made to cover this deposition.

Discovery Litigation Services, LLC will charge its usual and customary rates to all parties in the case, and a financial discount will not be given to any party to this litigation.

Blanche J. Dugas
CCR No. B-2290

CAPTION

The Deposition of JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D., taken in the matter, on the date, and at the time and place set out on the title page hereof.

It was requested that the deposition be taken by the reporter and that same be reduced to typewritten form.

It was agreed by and between counsel and the parties that the Deponent will read and sign the transcript of said deposition.

DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
 DLS Assignment No. 21012
 Case Caption: In Re: New England Compounding
 Pharmacy, Inc. Products Liability
 Litigation
 Witness: JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D. - 03/23/2015

DECLARATION UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY

I declare under penalty of perjury that I have read the entire transcript of my deposition taken in the captioned matter or the same has been read to me, and The same is true and accurate, save and except for changes and/or corrections, if any, as indicated by me on the DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET hereof, with the understanding that I offer these changes as if still under oath.

Signed on the _____ day of

_____, 20__.

JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D.

DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

SIGNATURE: _____ DATE: _____

JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D.

CERTIFICATE
 STATE OF GEORGIA
 COUNTY OF FULTON
 Before me, this day, personally appeared,
 JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D., who, being duly sworn,
 states that the foregoing transcript of his
 deposition, taken in the matter, on the date, and at
 the time and place set out on the title page hereof,
 constitutes a true and accurate transcript of said
 deposition.

JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D.

SUBSCRIBED and SWORN to before me this
 _____ day of _____, 20__ in the
 jurisdiction aforesaid.

My Commission Expires _____ Notary Public

*If no changes need to be made on the following two
 pages, place a check here _____, and return only this
 signed page.*

DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

Page No. _____ Line No. _____ Change to: _____

Reason for change: _____

SIGNATURE: _____ DATE: _____

JOHN W. CULCLASURE, M.D.